'Imagine a World Without Tobacco'. Utopian visions and collaborative research in public health

Andrew Russell

Pre-publication version of chapter in Ruy Blanes and Maité Maskens (eds) *Utopian Encounters: Anthropologies of Empirical Utopias,* (Ralahine Utopian Studies Series), Oxford: Peter Lang.

"If you want to build a ship, don't drum up the men to gather wood, divide the work, and give orders. Instead, teach them to yearn for the vast and endless sea"

Attributed to Antoine de Saint-Exupery[1]

Background

'Imagine a world without tobacco.' Fifty years ago, in many parts of the world, such a statement would have been culturally unthinkable. In this chapter, I explore the shift in what was once an impossible vision to something temporally, territorially and relationally achievable, and its consequences, through a case study of the global tobacco control movement and a specific ethnographic example from Aorotearoa/New Zealand. In this, I move from Shukaitis (2010)'s 'ethnography of nowhere' to an 'ethnography of somewhere', asking in the process what anthropological insights offer classic utopian studies debates, and suggest the need for a critical rethink of utopia today, beyond the notion of something unrealistic and unattainable to (in this case) a social movement that challenges the very political economy on which a global "harm industry" (Benson and Kirsch 2010) is based. There are many aspects to life which it is difficult to imagine being otherwise; Fisher (2009) cites Jameson 'it has become easier to imagine the end of the world than the end of capitalism'. Benson and Kirsch (2010) posit a "politics of resignation", something which Chrysanthou (2002: 470) would attribute to "the narcotic hold of an increasingly global consumer capitalism". For, as I argue elsewhere, tobacco has been in many ways the epitome of the origins and development of the capitalist world system and its associated ideologies from the time that Columbus encountered the "dried leaves which are in high value among them" in the midst of the Caribbean Indians in 1492. So much so that a golden age of modernity (if such a term is conceivable) is almost synonymous, visually speaking, with the ubiquitous cigarette.[2]

Times change; knowledge accumulates; people organize; imaginations grow, and the invitation to 'imagine a world without tobacco' is one now being extended by what has become, in the intervening time period, a global movement for tobacco control. What was once an unimaginable has come to be seen as within the grasp of many societies, fuelled globally by the World Health Organization's Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC)[3] and reflected in the names of organizations like 'Smoke Free Futures' and 'ASPIRE 2025: Research for a Tobacco Free Aotearoa'.The Himalayan kingdom of Bhutan has been the first to outlaw smoking completely (Ugen 2003; Givel 2011), while several nations – with Aotearoa/New Zealand, Ireland and Iceland in the vanguard – have taken up the challenge and have developed policy intentions for smoke- or tobacco-free futures by various dates: 2025 (New Zealand and Ireland),

[1] Quoted in a Cancer Research UK presentation on 'Endgame Thinking' to Fresh Smoke Free North East, 16th May 2014.

[2] See, for example, the nostalgia-rich representation of the 1960s advertising moguls in the many scenes of 'Madmen' that feature tobacco use.

[3] The FCTC is the first international treaty of its kind ever negotiated by the World Health Organization, and one of the fastest growing treaties in the history of the United Nations.

2034 (Scotland) and 2040 (Finland). Other nations, and parts of nations, are considering their options in the wake of these plans. Meanwhile legislation has been introduced in many parts of the world for smoke free public places, standardised packaging, reduced availability and increased sales taxes on tobacco products, to name but a few of the ways in which the production, supply and consumption of tobacco is becoming increasingly regulated. 'End game scenarios' are now regularly discussed and strategies for their achievement devised and implemented.

This is utopian envisioning par excellence, reflecting what Maskens and Blanes (this volume) style the 'constituent imaginations' which have transformed the possibility of tobacco free futures from a theoretical ideal to a practical reality. A special issue of the journal *Tobacco Control* devoted to 'The Tobacco Endgame', for example, indicates some of the different proposals being put forward for how the utopia in question might be achieved. They are framed (by turns) by three of the theoretical paradigms Maskens and Blanes suggest form the basis for the transformation from imaginative acts to concrete actualization. Thus there are calls to create a market controlled by a non-profit organization with a harm reduction mandate, based on a theory of economic behaviour (Borland 2013; Callard and Collishaw 2013). Benowitz and Henningfield advocate a nicotine reduction strategy in cigarettes, in order to return to the temporality "articulated by former Surgeon General C. Everett Koop to end the 21st century as we ended the 19th century with 'lung cancer…relegated to the status of a rare disease'" (2013: i16). Following these tropes, the New Zealanders talk, somewhat enigmatically, about a 'sinking lid' for tobacco supply, by which they mean an end to tobacco use through the imposition of increasing limits on the amount of commercial tobacco released for legal sale, the remaining portion being released to licensed suppliers by auction (Wilson et al 2013). Singapore is considering carefully a proposal to introduce a 'tobacco free generation' law, in which the sale of tobacco products to individuals born after a certain year would be prohibited (Berrick 2013). Proctor (2011; 2013) proposes simply banning the sale of cigarettes altogether. In these ways, we are beyond Saint-Exupery's yearning for 'the vast and endless sea' and are starting to build the ships that will take us there.

Anthropologists, for all that utopian tendencies may be found in their ethics, politics and worldviews (Maskens and Blanes 2013), can frequently be awkward champions of the concept; their critical stance on the social construction of knowledge (let alone the ideological diktats of the imagination) is likely to make them so. Critical public health bemoans the medicalization of everyday life, suggesting the pathological obsession with being healthy is an ideology in its own right (Crawford 1980; Chrysanthou 2002). For Chrystanthou, "it seems fitting to designate this individualized quest for the perfected or immortal body as an distorted expression of the utopian impulse under conditions inimical to utopian thinking" (2002: 471). Despite the proffered material and sensorial benefits of being smoke free on the lungs, heart, blood vessels and even brain, we might, like Dennis (2016) argue for critical engagement with the social, moral and political atmosphere within which smoke free legislation is enacted. We can also be sympathetic to the stigmatization caused when an intervention (such as raising tobacco taxes or going 'smoke free') values the health of society over the rights (denied) of the individual smoker. As Claeys (2011: 186-7) puts it, "the 'other' – Jew, foreigner, heretic – has often had a difficult time in utopia." We might consider adding 'smoker' to this list.

I say 'we' and this pronoun gives me pause for thought. Where do I situate myself in this particular utopian process? I am sympathetic to the aspirations for a smoke free world, and have worked in a mutualistic way with proponents of tobacco-free futures since 2006 (although I would say the prospect of achieving an 'end game', although present since James 1st of England

published his 'Counterblaste to Tobacco' in 1604, has only become seriously articulated some 400 years later). During this latter period I have been involved in a number of research projects which can be seen as moving us towards fulfilment of this utopian future (e.g. Russell et al 2009; Heckler and Russell 2008; Lewis and Russell 2013; McNeill et al 2014; Russell et al 2015; Russell et al 2016). Yet as an anthropologist one is also aware of operating within a moral compass. Movements for change in any global system have consequences that may be unforeseen – for (exploited) child labourers in the tobacco fields of Malawi, for example, (victimized) smokers on the streets of Vancouver, or (wealthy) executives of tobacco transnational corporations in Geneva. Core disciplinary values such as holism, diversity and the plurality of voices can make it difficult for the anthropologist to adopt a hardline activist approach. We are, as Dennis (2016: 172) eloquently puts it, better at "studying the war, rather than only taking up a place in the battle".

In order to better study the war, I decided to embark on my own 'utopian encounter', a visit to Aotearoa/New Zealand to see a utopian configuration for myself, the moves to concretize the 'Tobacco Free New Zealand' encapsulated in the title 'ASPIRE 2025'. The rest of this chapter will present an account of this research, conducted with both tobacco-free supporters, and those for whom the idea of a world without tobacco is problematic or, in some cases, dystopian. I shall end by asking what an anthropological analysis can offer the study of a utopian vision such as a tobacco-free world, given our disciplinary penchant for seeking out alternative viewpoints, the marginal, the voiceless and the oppressed, and in challenging hegemonic assumptions.

Methodological Approach

My approach combines an ethnographic commitment to the study of historical and cross-cultural moments in an effort to understand tobacco as a global phenomenon in new ways. I draw on my own 'armchair anthropology' involving anthropological and other accounts of tobacco's place in lowland South America (Russell and Rahman 2015), ethnographic enquiries that have involved 'following the thing' (Marcus 1998: 91) - in this case, the plant and its associated paraphernalia around the world, and a strong dose of serendipity (Rivoal and Salazar 2013) in empirical research as well as the use of artistic and literary sources germane to my project. I am interested in the contested dyad between 'people' and 'things', 'subjects' and 'objects' that Miller (2005: 41) finds so problematic. I am interested in tobacco as a plant turned commodity that is a fertile producer of hybrid assemblages (following Latour 2005) that we might call 'tobacco-persons' or 'tobacco-corporations'. With this shift in focus to a 'post-humanist', flattened terrain in which living and non-living things alike are considered actants, we soon find ourselves considering life from the plant's 'point of view'. It is frequently said, in presenting the findings of ethnographic research, that we should let the data speak for itself. Thus I follow Holbraad (2011) as well as Marx (through Shukaitis and Lim, 2012) in questioning whether the thing/plant/commodity can indeed speak on its own terms, what language it would use, and what it would be likely to say (Russell, in press). Dennis (2016) is rightly critical of the way in which the anthropology of tobacco has segued into an instrumentalized anthropology of tobacco control, and I am careful to emphasise I am studying both tobacco and tobacco control in equal measure. I intend neither to reprise the medical, social or policy evidence concerning the production and use of tobacco, nor to replicate existing political criticisms of the structures and organizations that keep tobacco (as a plant) at the height of national and international health agendas. Instead, my intention is to use current theoretical and methodological approaches within social anthropology to undertake a form of re-storying, bringing different, sometimes discordant and frequently extraordinary tropes

together in ways that foment new understandings of this complex, intelligent plant and, in the process, of society, lifeways and modes of thought more broadly.[4]

Insofar as tobacco is a plant with a life force before it is harvested this is a version of 'multispecies ethnography', although my experience with this genre is that people are more ready to consider the animal kingdom rather than the plant kingdom in their analyses. Insofar as tobacco is turned into a consumable after it is processed, I am entering the domain of what Holbraad (2011: 2) summarises as "material culture studies, thing-theory, ANT, speculative realism, [and] post-phenomenology". I use the testimony of various people intimately linked to tobacco in my analysis - producers, consumers, researchers - as well as some phenomenological work involving five growing specimens of *Nicotiana tabacum* brought from 'Mel424' on E-Bay.

The research in Aotearoa/New Zealand took place from February 7th to February 23rd 2014. I went to New Zealand because it had set one of the earliest dates of all nations that have declared an intention to become 'smoke-' or 'tobacco-' free. Two weeks may seem like an inordinately short period of time to undertake any kind of research that is attempting to encompass the policy-making and experience of a whole country, but it is incredible what a heavy carbon footprint, the internet and serendipity can do to facilitate what might once have been weeks of arduous and less felicitous fieldwork. My initial contacts, through my work in tobacco control, were with the Director, Prof. Richard Edwards, and his team at 'ASPIRE 2025'. However, as my preparations for the trip went on, it became apparent that there were other stories to be discovered about tobacco in New Zealand apart from policy attempts to eliminate it. I always like to read novels of the country I am visiting and I remembered *The Bone People* from its debut in 1985; it won the Booker prize the following year. In looking for the name of its author via Wikipedia, I was astonished to find that Keri Hulme had "worked as a tobacco picker in Motueka after leaving school. She began studying for an honours law degree at the University of Canterbury in 1967, but left after four terms and returned to tobacco picking."[5]

In the past, such a realisation (that tobacco had been grown in New Zealand) might have come only upon arrival ("What, tobacco grew here? I had no idea!"). However the internet is a wonderful thing in these circumstances and, because of the serendipity of unexpected connections, I had not only found out well in advance that there was a history of tobacco growing in New Zealand, but had been able to download substantial amounts of information about it and had incorporated Motueka, a small town in the north of South Island, into my travel plans. I was also able to locate Keri Hulme in a small village on the west coast of South Island, thanks to a local newspaper, The Greymouth Star, which in December 2011 had run a story that Keri was going to leave 'McMansion Okarito' and 'shift to Otago'.[6] In a move which I could not imagine happening in the UK, a helpful editor emailed in response to my query informing me that Keri Hulme was 'still at Okarito but…very difficult to contact'. He suggested I do so via her next door neighbours, providing me with their names and phone number. I decided a better approach, increasingly rare in our internet-connected world but which seemed appropriate given her literary credentials, would be to write Keri Hulme a letter in advance.

---

[4] On the intelligence and consciousness of plants, see Trewavas (2014) and Trewavas and Baluška (2011).
[5] Anon. 'Keri Hulme' article, *Wikipedia*, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Keri_Hulme [accessed January 5th 2014].
[6] Anon. (2011) 'Hulme to leave 'Mcmansion' Okarito', *Otago Daily Times Online News*, December 22nd, http://www.odt.co.nz/entertainment/books/191953/hulme-leave-mcmansion-okarito, [accessed January 5th 2014].

Again by chance the internet version of The Greymouth Star had a contemporaneous story about shops in Greymouth itself stopping the sale of tobacco.[7] I shared this interesting news item with my tobacco control colleagues in the NE of England since, as far as I was aware, nothing similar had happened in the UK along these lines, except for the case of ten supermarkets in Scotland deciding to stop selling tobacco products because of a supplementary health levy imposed by the Scottish government on the business rates of large stores selling cigarettes and alcohol.[8] Meanwhile a Google search for 'Tobacco Growing Motueka' had revealed an exhibition at the Motueka Museum and a talk to the town's Historical Association about the history of the Rothman's Factory in the town which had been given by its former manager.[9] This proved the basis of a particularly rich exchange. The secretary of the Motueka Historical Association gave me all sorts of advice in advance including information about a book written about the history of tobacco growing in the area (O'Shea 1997) which I ordered from Barnes and Noble, USA. In return I was able to send her Pete Benson's 'Tobacco Talk' article about tobacco growers in North Carolina,[10] tentatively hypothesising that former growers in New Zealand (where the last tobacco harvest took place in 1995) might share similar sentiments to those expressed in Benson's article. Another interesting lead, from searching 'Tobacco' on the websites of institutions like the National Library and Te Papa, the National Museum of New Zealand, was an intriguing 3D Viewmaster reel entitled 'Tobacco Harvest Motueka'. I shall present the fieldwork period that followed in the form of five vignettes (below), each of which sheds a different light on the utopian encounter in this 'ethnography of somewhere'. I shall then broaden my perspective by considering the wider, dystopian arguments concerning the vision of a tobacco-free world expounded by 'big men and great men' such as the British artist David Hockney, and will ask what anthropological insights there may be by taking up Dennis' challenge to study 'the war' rather than taking up a place in the battle.

Aotearoa/New Zealand: Concerning Utopia

11th February 2014

It is evening and I am being prodded awake by a security guard in the visitors' gallery of the House of Representatives at the New Zealand parliament in Wellington, where a debate on a plain packaging bill for tobacco is taking place. I was told about the debate during a visit to the Ministry of Health's tobacco control team that afternoon, and was enthusiastic about the idea of going and witnessing democracy in action. I had been invited by a member of the team to discuss what anthropological ideas might be able to add to the policy mix for a Smokefree New Zealand 2025. This sense of 'being put on the spot' through co-optation into an assumed shared utopian vision is a common feature of work in tobacco control, as it is in applied anthropology more generally.[11] Since the main object of my visit was to learn more about the New Zealand situation and how the process of getting to a Smoke Free New Zealand 2025 was devised and being talked about, it would have been a bit presumptuous of me to give my thoughts on the vision or plans, although was certainly happy to share ideas and observations.

---

[7] Logie, V. (2014) 'Shops Kick Tobacco Habit', *Greymouth Star*, http://www.greystar.co.nz/content/shops-kick-tobacco-habit [accessed January 6th 2014].

[8] Harrison, J. (2012) 'Sainsburys ends sale of cigarettes', *The Herald*, November 12th, http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/13080602.Sainsbury_s_ends_sale_of_cigarettes/.

[9] Smith, C. (2012) 'History of the Rothman's Factory Recounted', *Motueka Online*, October 31st, http://www.motuekaonline.org.nz/news/stories12/311012s2.html [Accessed January 6th 2014].

[10] Benson, P. (2010); this is in many ways a summary article of his 2012 book *Tobacco Capitalism.*

[11] Pool and Geissler (2005: 31) distinguish between 'anthropology in' and 'anthropology of' medicine, for example. I prefer the stronger distinction made by Grillo and Stirrat (1997) between 'anthropology of' and 'anthropology for' development.

The disciplinary values of anthropology which I summarised above as holism, diversity, and a plurality of voices frequently sound something like truisms when trotted out in discussions of what constitutes an 'anthropological perspective'. The danger I always feel is of anthropology being commandeered to deal with 'the ethnic minorities'; smoking rates in New Zealand certainly demonstrate high levels of ethnic inequality linked to poverty and deprivation. Members of ASPIRE 2025 and our interlocutors in the Health Ministry are well aware of how strongly this links back to the early colonial encounter[12] and increasing contemporary ethnic inequality (Barnett et al 2005) as well more contested issues such as place (Thompson et al 2007) and cultural mores (the latter, for example, reflected in the continuing use of cigarettes as a marker of Maori hospitality).[13] Maori smoking rates are declining, however, from 49% in 2002 to 42.2% in 2006 and 32.7% in 2013. However, this is a lower rate of decline than that of the population as a whole, which was from 21% to 15% between 2006 and 2013. Smoking rates amongst Maori women are particularly high (Barnett et al 2004). The Maori Select Committee and Maori politicians had been especially determined in their pursuit of the tobacco control agenda.

The parliamentary debate is going on and jet lag has got the better of me. The security guard is very pleasant about it – I am sure members of parliament fall asleep all the time during their sessions, but it is probably against the rules to permit a visitor to do so – perhaps it is seen as disrespectful, beyond the pale, or just the thin end of the wedge allowing parliament to become a place of refuge for every vagrant, homeless person or jetlagged anthropologist who finds it a good place in which to sleep. The debate picks up a little at this point, though, with John Banks speaking on behalf of his far right ACT party,[14] one of the few not supporting the bill's onward passage to a select committee, although he says he is "opposed with a lower case narrative". His criticisms are that the bill is an "exercise in rain dancing". Invocations of 'fate' and 'agency', 'determinism' and 'free will', are always electric polarities amongst those who are 'anti-anti-tobacco'[15] – the inevitable (there will be tobacco) flipping quickly into its opposite (the individual's right to choose). The tobacco control people I talk to are happy with the bill overall, although are disappointed that it contains a clause delaying implementation until after World Trade Organization (WTO) hearings against Australia's plain packaging laws have been concluded. This is seen by legal experts as an example of deliberate stalling by the tobacco industry. The industry's chances of success against Australia's sovereign decision to be the first nation in the world to introduce plain packaging legislation in the interests of public health are slim, yet litigation of this sort can act as an effective 'chilling effect', discouraging the introduction of such progressive legislation by other countries (Russell et al 2015).

---

[12] "When Captain Cook first set foot on New Zealand soil, he was smoking. Local Maoris threw water over him because they thought he was a demon" (Setting the Agenda for Tupeka Kore, 2011, http://www.youtube.com/watch?v=9LF7qoJdEXc).

[13] Glover (2005:17) for example describes situations in which Maori whanau ('family/wider community') encourage relapse by offering cigarettes to former smokers who have recently quit; she also argues that public health policies and media campaigns help create supportive environments for behaviour change, in contrast to Thompson et al who argue that spatial 'smoking islands' lead to individuals ignoring or actively resisting anti-smoking policies and campaigns.

[14] On ACT's principles, see http://www.act.org.nz/?q=principles. John Banks has been charged with breaching electoral finance laws by asking for a donation from John Dotcom to be provided in two separate $25,000 amounts so that it could remain anonymous. He was forced to resign as leader of his party, had indicated his intention not to stand at the next election, but resigned his seat on June 13th 2014 (see http://www.act.org.nz/posts/author/john-banks).

[15] I use this term with reference to Geertz's views (Geertz 1984) on abortion expressed in his lecture 'anti-anti relativism'

Reflection on utopian theory and praxis from this encounter: Levitas (1990)'s talk of political and moral 'desires' as the means of materializing utopian dreams sounds exciting – racy, even – but the reality, as exemplified in the debate in the House of Representatives, is less dynamic. At least, it provides no psychological override to my jetlag! This is common in other fora where utopian desires for tobacco control are converted into legislative forms.[16] Constitutive imaginations may be generative, but the praxis can be dull.

17th February 2014

We are in the book-bound main room of Keri Hulme's octagonal house in Okarito talking about tobacco (amongst other things). We arrived in Okarito yesterday to find there was a performance in the village hall by a guitar and double bass duo called 'The Tattletale Saints'. 'Keri Hulme will be there', said our host at the house where we were staying, 'I noticed her car was outside'. When we go into the concert, pretty much every seat is taken so I sit down near the back, next to a woman who is clearly enjoying the show, clapping along to the music in a somewhat disjointed fashion with a bottle of wine at her feet. Afterwards, I approach her and introduce myself (from my letter) as 'Andrew'. "Andrew!" she says (for this is Keri Hulme), with no indication from her demeanour that she might not a have a clue who I am. "Well, you must come to my house tomorrow, but first I must go out to get in supplies".

We approach her house after lunch the following day. A notice on the gate guards her privacy, saying that unless you have been in contact with her before, you should stay away. Confident in the knowledge that we have indeed made an arrangement in advance, we step into the verdant overgrowth that is her garden, up the steps onto her entrance porch, and knock tentatively at her door. There is a light on but no reply. We return at dinner time, and have a conversation through the door. I explain we met the night before and that I had sent her a letter. "I didn't get a letter", Keri says. But she takes us in and we pick a path through the shelves and piles stacked with books and find two chairs which she clears of further books so that we can sit down. Considering we are two *pakehas* (Maori generic term for non-Maori) showing up unannounced, her hospitality is wonderful. Yes, she says, wool packing and tobacco picking were the two things she did in her youth. She recalled three seasons of work, for three months at a time, and the need to protect her hands from the black resin produced by the plants – her anxious mother had provided her with ten pairs of rubber gloves to take with her from her home in Canterbury. Friends who had been pickers with her had subsequently developed skin cancer, probably as a result of unprotected contact with the plant. Back in the late 1960s, tobacco picking was something alternative, different, a source of escape from the somewhat dowdy and dull reality that non-tobacco life in New Zealand had the reputation for being at that time. It was hard work – you'd be up early, before 6.00am, because "what the leaf required, you had to do". But she also recalled how free and welcoming this activity was for her and for others who did not necessarily feel at home in conventional society. The old tobacco industry ethos was that your employers regarded their workers as part of the family. There were two families she returned to regularly in the Upper Moutere valley, near Motueka. She wrote a story about her experiences, 'Of Green and Golden Days', but it is one she has never sought to get published because it contains incriminating information about people who have now assumed different personas to the carefree, libidinous characters of their youth. She is surprised though, to hear that tobacco as a commercial crop is finished in Motueka (the last year of commercial production was 1995), so

[16] I am reminded of an email conversation with a tobacco control activist who could not understand my interest in attending the Conference of the Parties for the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, and event which was likened to 'watching paint dry'.

I get the impression she has not kept in close touch with either her fellow pickers or the families who formerly employed her.

My reflection on utopian theory and praxis from this encounter concerns the nature of the worker experience with tobacco. It is something of a truism in tobacco control that labourers in tobacco fields are exploited and live lives characterised by precariousness and abjection (Benson 2012 Chapter 5; Otañez et al 2006). This in part reflects the lack of attention paid by policymakers and health professionals to tobacco farmers and the lack of knowledge about their communities (Benson and Thomas 2010). In Malawi, for instance, where tobacco accounts for over half the country's export earnings, an estimated 78,000 child labourers are employed in the tobacco leaf production process. In two districts surveyed in 2008, 63% of children in tobacco growing families were involved in child labour, of whom about one fifth were not attending school in consequence (Eriksen et al, 2015: 24). In the USA, the social condition of farm labour for migrant farmworkers on the tobacco farms of coastal North Carolina is that of a structural violence "characterized by interlocking forms of subordination and marginalization" (Benson 2012: 166-7). Yet here, Keri Hulme relates something different going on. Sure, there was exploitation – the leaf was a demanding employer – but there was also pleasure, adventure and a degree of rebellious liminality to be had in the lives of tobacco pickers around Motueka, something which is reiterated in documentaries and newsreels from the era.[17]

February 18th 2014

We are in Greymouth en route from Okarito to Motueka. Richard Edwards forwarded some email correspondence to me from the Smokefree Advisor for Northland District Health Board concerning a retailer in Wanganui on North Island who had decided to stop selling cigarettes. This linked to the article I had read in the Greymouth Star about three shopkeepers who had decided to do the same thing. The ASPIRE 2025 researchers had conducted research into the attitudes of retailers to tobacco control (Jaine et al 2014), but not of the experience of people such as these who had actually 'taken the plunge' and decided to stop selling tobacco. I exchanged drafts of a questionnaire that the Northland Smokefree Coordinator had prepared in an attempt to survey the retailers she knew of who had made this decision, and I offered to pilot it for her during our passage through Greymouth.[18]

Our somewhat unpredictable timings and itinerary necessitate arriving unannounced at the three different establishments identified in the town. Our first visit, to Merv 'n' Kips' Dairy mentioned in the Greymouth Star article, is unsuccessful. The proprietor, Margaret MacDonald, is a tea lady at the local hospital every Tuesday afternoon and her nephew is in the middle of refurbishing the shop. According to the newspaper article, though, her decision to stop selling was an economic one – they were becoming unprofitable. Her volunteer presence at the hospital, however, leaves me wondering whether other factors might be at play. Our next destination is Allan Meaclem at the Santa Fe Dairy. He may well have been the first retailer in New Zealand to stop selling tobacco. Allan reports keeping a stock of cigarettes and tobacco on the premises was a big outlay for him. When 'point of sale' displays were prohibited, he decided there was little point in continuing. He used to smoke but gave up 20 years ago as he was a fisherman out at sea

[17] See, for example, the New Zealand National Film Unit series (1964) 'These New Zealanders', No. 5, Motueka. https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=4OGuF-O3NNw. More general information about the history of tobacco in the area see McAloon, J. (2013) 'Hops, tobacco and hemp - Tobacco', *Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand*, updated 22-Feb-13, http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/hops-tobacco-and-hemp/page-2.

[18] The final version of the questionnaire can be found in Appendix 6 of the Tobacco-Free Retailers Tool Kit, http://www.sfc.org.nz/documents/140923-retailers-toolkit.pdf.

most of the time and he found it frequently impossible to keep his hands dry for a smoke. His 'manager' (i.e. his wife) still "smokes like a steam train" but that was not a factor in his decision to stop selling tobacco products in the shop, he says.

Our final interlocutor is perhaps the most unusual, since when she is not working in 'Munchies on Marsden', she is a consultant gynaecologist (although it was her partner, a smoker, who was the driver for making their premises tobacco-free when they took the shop over two months ago). The previous owners appeared to have made quite a lot out of the sale of tobacco, so it was "a bit of a punt". However, the cost of stocking tobacco is more than the cost of stocking everything else in the store, and they couldn't see the point in tying up their capital in just one product. Meanwhile the return on tobacco compared to the amount of money tied up in it is very low and as tax rates rise so demand is falling. The location of the shop – across the road from a sports centre, a high school and primary school – was also a factor: a shop selling tobacco products in the midst of this complex didn't seem quite right. They are working with the school to lift a long term ban on students coming to the shop and one of the 'levers' they are keen to use is making the shop smoke-free.

Administering the questionnaire reveals a number of other issues which weren't included on it but which would be good to include in future research. For example, 'Munchies' reported coming under "huge pressure from the tobacco people who almost threatened us that we would lose customers left, right and centre if we didn't have cigarettes". This intimidation made it feel like a particularly big step to take when they were starting up. Questions about the response from the tobacco industry and also the response from the local community weren't on the original questionnaire but were very valid questions to raise, and were included in the final version of it. In this way I feel I have made a small research contribution to the fulfilment of the utopian vision of ASPIRE 2025 – the refinement of a research instrument designed to record the experience of retailers who are taking the decision to stop selling tobacco. I am aware of similarities and differences with other parts of the country. For example, it is interesting that none of the shops in Greymouth have any signs in the window indicating they don't sell 'smokes', unlike the shop portrayed in Wanganui. Nor did the onset of a smoking-related illness in a partner or family member figure in the decision-making about whether or not to sell tobacco products in any of the Greymouth shops, unlike the report I had read about the shop in Wanganui.

This was my one empirical experience of Shukaitis' "slices of liberation", the opportunity to see elements of the utopian ASPIRE 2025 vision translating into business behaviour. To respond to Maskens and Blanes' caveat (Introduction) I found these manifestations of utopia to be neither libertarian nor totalitarian in their political timbre. In fact, any affective dimensions to the decision to stop selling tobacco products that were incorporated into the questionnaire, such as the possibility that a partner or family member succumbing to a smoking-related illness might precipitate the decision to stop selling tobacco products, did not seem to feature in this study of the shops in Greymouth. Rather, plain economics seemed to have been a much more potent factor in proprietors' decision-making. Economics may yet have an important role to play in the conversion of utopian ideas into everyday realities around tobacco control.

February 19th 2014

We are talking to Coralie and Geoff, the former manager of the Rothman's tobacco plant, in the Motueka Historical Museum. Geoff has brought some photographs of his years in the industry and we spend a fascinating morning reminiscing about it. We spend a lot of time talking about

things like climate, labour, machinery, soils, manufacturing, and crop diseases.[19] Geoff (GT) and Coralie (CS) make reference to *The Golden Harvest* (O'Shea 1997), which we all regard highly. Geoff describes it as "well researched and accurate…" but adds "it's just a shame that the anecdotal things that happened during the life of this industry, they've never been recorded in that sense - there were some really hard case characters and a lot of funny things happened…[the book]'s more, I won't say 'dry' because it's anything but, but it's a factual record but [what I'm talking about]…is outside that, it's people who were involved in the industry, their personal experiences".

Coralie picks up the discussion:

> CS: There have been several attempts to write such a book, you know…
>
> GT: But unfortunately all those folk have died…
>
> CS: And there have been some recordings, of growers, but more the growers, not the workers – it's really the workers stories [we need] and some of the growers, you know, their experiences with the workers…mostly I think the workers came for a good time rather than to make money!
>
> GT: People used to, in the days of what we called 'the Six O'clock Swill', licensed premises had to close at six o'clock, and you had literally thousands of seasonal employees here because on any one tobacco farm there would be 20-30 people involved, 25 people involved in lighting a kiln, people in the paddock, it was so labour intensive. They used to close the pubs at 6 o'clock and we'd get sort of a hard core element. People used to come across from Nelson and line up along the street outside the Swan, which has since disappeared – that was the name of the hotel – and watch them come out and all the fights, and that - an entertainment centre!
>
> CS: And the taxi business flourished because they had several taxis – there's one that struggles now – and you could wait hours for a taxi to take you and then of course they were going miles, they might be going half an hour's drive to get these workers back, you know.
>
> GT: I actually boarded with one – this is back in the late '50s, early '60s, and I'd go three weeks and not see him because he'd be working 'til two, three, four o'clock in the morning then sleep during the day, and I'm at work and off he'd go, you know, and it was just a repeat…They would do a thousand miles in two days and not go outside the district.

Geoff and Coralie's memories resonate with those of Keri Hulme's 'green and golden days' with regard to a unique horticultural context which provided a venue for people to 'have a good time'. Coralie makes a firm distinction between the workers and the growers, saying it is the former whose stories tend not to be told. She also agreed that people were likely to share some of the same moral sentiments as those expressed by North Carolina tobacco growers in Benson's article which I sent her. However, they don't agree with Benson that arguments in favour of tobacco

[19] These interestingly don't feature heavily in Pete Benson's book (2012) or article (2010), both of which are more concerned with politics, citizenship, affect and tobacco corporations.

represent core psychological defense mechanisms crafted for people by the tobacco companies.[20] Coralie describes tobacco in a subsequent email as a plant which "brought money to the whole province but particularly Motueka; people are reluctant to let it go and are very defensive of it, seeing it as their livelihood not a health problem". Both Coralie and Geoff alert me to the importance of recognising and respecting a past heritage at the same time as looking to a utopian future in which past practices have no place. Theirs is perhaps a nostalgic, 'expressive utopia' as discussed in the Introduction, but it undoubtedly reflects the views of many of the inhabitants in the region where few people didn't have something to do with tobacco over the many years it grew there.

The museum has gathered together numerous tobacco-related publications[21] and has an exhibit of the production processes for tobacco, as well as a reminiscence book for people who were involved in the industry to record their memories. The exhibit in the Motueka Historical Museum, like similar exhibits in other parts of the world where tobacco either grows or formerly grew (e.g. Weix 1997; Rentetzi 2009),[22] is a fitting expression of the sense of a golden harvest playing to the temporality of a golden age. Perhaps this age though is becoming tarnished. As we leave the museum, the curator has a word with us about her own tobacco experience. She was once involved in every aspect of tobacco work except planting. She was an accomplished picker, and since she was left-handed this was useful in the picking machines. Geoff would phone her for a left-handed picker, and she would be at the farm for six months. Nowadays, though, she says, people often want to check out what has been grown on a piece of ground and do a soil test before building a house on it, due to the harsh chemicals which were associated with tobacco cultivation. She isn't sure, but anecdotally it seems large numbers of former tobacco as well as apple growers of a certain age are "dropping like flies".

February 26th 2014 and beyond

The ViewMaster reel at the national museum, Te Papa, provides a curious twist to my research involvement in tobacco and tobacco control in Aotearoa/New Zealand. It is a curious item (CT.059383), a disc of seven stereoscopic images taken in 1964 for a ViewMaster machine. Titled 'Tobacco Harvesting in Motueka', the disc is one of 237 by F.R. Lamb acquired by the museum in 2009.[23] I had tried to see the ViewMaster reel during my visit but unfortunately I didn't have the time to wait the two days in Wellington which would have been required to take the precious artefact out of cold storage. However, I subsequently discovered another of F.R. Lamb's reels uploaded onto the Te Papa website and hence on February 26th, back in the UK, I email the curator to see if it might be possible to do the same thing for reel CT.059383.

I have undertaken more research into the history and likely provenance of this reel. The ViewMaster was invented in the USA in 1939 and consists of a plastic stereo viewer that takes circular disks with seven pairs of colour stereo images. The curator of photography at the

[20] Benson (2012) writes about R.J. Reynolds' 'Pride in Tobacco' campaign in the 1970s and 80s which he sees as a cynical distraction from the company's shift to purchasing more foreign leaf.

[21] One that seems particularly salient to the notion of tobacco once having been an everyday utopia is a 1967 children's book by Robin Robilliard called *Kay of the Tobacco Farm*. It is part of a series called 'Families of New Zealand'.

[22] See also the list of European tobacco museums on the Città del Tabacco website http://www.cittadeltabacco.it/en/museums/.

[23] The others contain photographs of Christchurch and South Island scenes in the 1950s and 60s, including images of a wedding, a street parade, floral displays, small town scenes, rivers, autumn trees, and so on. According to the curator of photography at the museum, "most of his images are quite mundane, consisting of scenic photos of the South Island - the sort that keen amateurs might have taken during their holidays".

museum, taking advice from a local photo-historian, believed F.R. Lamb might have held a license to produce these images, but the Wikipedia entry concerning the history of ViewMaster technology revealed that, while most ViewMaster discs consisted of commercially produced photographs, Sawyer's Inc. produced a ViewMaster Personal Stereo Camera in 1952 which allowed anyone to take their own 3D pictures.[24] It is likely that Lamb's photographs are of this sort, since the sleeve of the one Lamb disc on the Te Papa website describes its contents as a 'personal reel mount', and there is no evidence of multiple copies of any of the 237 reels in the museum's collection. The cameras were manufactured in the USA for ten years, after which Sawyer Europe carried on with a 'View Master Mark II'. Armed with this information the curator changed the website entry about the reels to indicate that "a special stereo camera was marketed from 1952 which allowed anyone to create their own disks. Lamb was possibly the only person in New Zealand who did so". I see this as another minor research contribution to fulfilment of the utopian vision of ASPIRE 2025 (if one takes seriously the notion of heritage making as a form of 'expressive utopia' outlined in the previous vignette). It feels appropriately balanced to have done some knowledge-generating research for both tobacco control and tobacco heritage as a result of my sojourn in Aorotearoa/New Zealand.

Wider Perspectives: Incorporating Dystopia

Lamb's artefact in the Te Papa museum, with its 3-D view of tobacco harvesting, seemed a particularly significant find, an invitation to take a fresh perspective on my subject matter. As an anthropologist, I felt a connection between the notion of three-dimensional perspective and the 'cosmological perspectivism' which is such a distinctive cultural feature of tobacco's historical source area, lowland South America. Cosmological perspectivism is marked by a 'perspectival quality' which recognises the world as inhabited by different sorts of human and non-human subjects which see reality from distinct points of view (de Castro 1998; 2012b). Artistic perspective – the development of a 3-dimensional effect on a 2-dimensional surface through the use of linear structures taking the eye to a vanishing point on the horizon is said to have started with the experiments of Giotto in the 13th century, However, rather astonishingly, the Florentine reformist painter Jacopo Chimenti da Empoli did a pair of drawings which show he was well aware of the principle of 3-D stereoscopy even if he lacked the opportunities for the commercial exploitation of it that were offered by the Viewmaster centuries later.

I don't think it can be pure coincidence that the development of such stereoscopic ideas came with the arrival of tobacco on European shores, just as cosmological perspectivism is a feature of tobacco-rich lowland South America. Nor is it a complete coincidence that the development of what Wolff (2007) calls the 'cultural perspective', so closely associated both with the development of Enlightenment thought and the origins of anthropology, followed on from tobacco's arrival.. In fact, the zenith of interest in and enthusiasm for stereoscopic 3-D representations preceded the Viewmaster by at least 100 years, coming in the middle of the 19th century, a vogue era for tobacco and reflected in the development of the stereoscope. I have an English stereoscope and stereoscopic photographs that I salvaged from my grandmother's house in 1976. When I look through the images it contains again, I notice that one of the best preserved pictures, of a Victorian family group, features a lad smoking a pipe.

It is hard not to study perspective and dimensionality in contemporary British art without being drawn to the work of David Hockney. As well as a fascination with perspective, he has a dystopian vision of tobacco control. Hockney argues persuasively that a transformation took

[24] Anon. 'View-Master Personal Stereo Camera' article, *Wikipedia*, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/View-Master_Personal_Stereo_Camera [accessed October 31st 2017].

place in western art around 1420-30 with the development (probably in Flanders) of a concave mirror-lens capable of projecting an image of a scene that could be used as a 'device for drawing'. Suddenly one was not limited by what could be seen with two eyes any more – Hockney likens this to 'projection' as opposed to 'reflection'. "Reflection is affected by the viewers' movement and position, the projection is not. It is separate from our bodies, a point I think that in the late 20th century has become a big problem" (Hockney 2001: 284). Only in the 19th century, with the 'shock of modernism', was the optical projection and its influences challenged. "Cubism, derived from Cézanne, was two-eyed, a human vision again, connected to the body" (ibid: 284).

As well as advocating the merits of reverse perspectivism, which Cubism represents, Hockney is an ardent spokesman/mouthpiece for tobacco, or the 'tobacco lobby'. He has written and drawn regularly for national newspapers outlining his views on what to him is a dystopian future without tobacco. In his 'Letter in a Picture' dated 28th February 2012, for example, he states "Life is a killer. We all get a lifetime. There is only now. This is the case against the anti-smoking fanatics and the doctors and bossy-boots who are busy trying their best to make everything DULLER".[25]

In a more recent pronouncement, Hockney expands on his position somewhat:

> "There are about 10 million adult smokers in the UK. None are professional. There are far too many professional anti-smokers whose aim is to get rid of smoking altogether. They will fail. They are people with a purpose in life (and are convinced everyone would be better off not smoking), but others can have a purpose in life as I do, which I'm quite convinced keeps me going, as did Monet (never seen without a cigarette in his mouth). The NHS never mentions this, and few doctors do. We live in a very shallow age. Now the latest thing is that bacon is bad for you, another killer. It's as though shortly death itself can be postponed. That seems to be a mad aim. We are all going to die, and this luckily comes at the end of life. People are living longer, yes, but this includes the smokers. We are moving into a very different world….Things are going to be very different. The figures for smoking have been the same for about four or five years now. This means that you have a hardcore of smokers – naughty people who should know better – who accept the fact that fate plays a part in life and know that to be obsessed with longevity is life-denying. There is only now. The aim of the professional anti-smoker is to get rid of it. The press tells us "it's not acceptable". Well, it is for 10 million people, who probably don't all read newspapers and have little to do with the political and media elite….Why does the government only listen to the anti-smokers who obviously natter and natter about it? My father was one of these anti-smokers, and they won't be happy until it's gone."[26]

A dystopian sense of the future pervades other aspects of his work. For example, in a reverse-prophetic section of his book *Secret Knowledge*, he opines "we live in an arrogant age that thinks it knows more than any other. Humility is not in style. Asking questions is better than answering them…I don't like the idea of moving into darker ages. Wider perspectives are needed now" (2001: 285). His book ends with Hockney making some reverse-prophetic statements: "All this has interest beyond art history or the history of pictorial space, because the system of

---

[25] Hockney, D. (2012) 'A letter in a picture by David Hockney', *The Guardian*, February 28th http://www.theguardian.com/society/2012/feb/28/david-hockney-letter-in-picture

[26] Hockney, D. (2013) 'Life is now. Don't let the professional anti-smoking brigade ruin it', *The Guardian*, March 15th, http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/mar/15/life-now-anti-smoking-brigade-ruin-it

perspective led to the system of triangulation that mean you could fire cannons more accurately. Military technology had a jump from it, and it is clear that by the late eighteenth century the West's technology was superior to that of China, hence the decline of China in relation to the West. The vanishing point leads to the missiles of today, which can take us out of this world. It could be that the West's greatest mistakes were the 'invention' of the external vanishing point and the internal combustion engine. Think of all the pollution from the television and traffic." (p286).

Those in tobacco control might add the Bonsack cigarette making machine, invented in 1883, to this list…

Discussion

Shukaitis (2004/2010) argues that those who would make the world a better place frequently lack a coherent alternative vision. The philosopher Isaiah Berlin (an inveterate pipe-smoker, as Hockney reminds us)[27] sees utopia as "a static perfection in which human nature is finally fully realized, and all is still and immutable and eternal" (Berlin 1990: 22). A tobacco free future is a much more specific utopian ideal and one which, as argued above, is no longer seen by advocates of tobacco control as something impractical, unrealistic and unattainable. What happens though after we have followed the yellow brick road down to its vanishing point in a smoke free Emerald City is seldom articulated. Tobacco control is a good example of Miyazaki's notion of 'the performative inheritance of hope', since key developments nationally and internationally - the smoke-free public places legislation, introduced into the UK in 2007, for example, or the WHO's Framework Convention on Tobacco Control (FCTC), which came into existence in 2005 - represent the "triumph of hope over adversity, persistence over resistance" (Russell, Wainwright and Mamudu, 2015: 269), having taken nigh on fifty years to come to fruition. The counter to the FCTC and smoke free utopias is what Benson and Kirsch (2011) call 'the politics of resignation', a world in which 'harm industries' (of which the transnational tobacco corporations are particularly egregious examples) rule the roost and neoliberal, free market economics has full sway. As anthropologists, though, we occupy the betwixt and between position, interested in taking on board the multiple perspectives, of coming to a meta-apprehension of reality. This meta-apprehension includes the recognition that one person's utopia is another's dystopia.

So how does and should anthropology as a discipline relate to Aotearoa/New Zealand's aspiration to go smoke- (or tobacco-) free by 2025? How do I square my interest in and commitment to supporting progress towards a tobacco-free future with the notion that such a goal is dystopian for a significant part of the world's population? I can see three ways in which anthropology can contribute to the utopian vision while remaining true to its disciplinary principles of holism, diversity and minoritarianism. The first is simply, as Dennis suggests, to study the war (i.e. the relationships it containes) rather than taking up a place in the battle. My utopian encounter has involved an 'ethnography of somewhere'. Deciding who are the minorities and who the majorities in terms of positions in the battle depends on a situational politics, but as anthropologists we recognise the need to bring into the story the voices and perspectives of those who might otherwise be ignored or misrepresented. In the case of utopian tobacco control policy-making, this might be the people for whom tobacco is part of their life in a non-negative way – such as the former growers, pickers and manufacturers of tobacco and tobacco products in a

[27] Hockney, D. (2012) Smoking hot memo from David Hockney to Health Minister: Keep your mean, dreary views out of my life, *Mail Online*, April 15th, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2129954/David-Hockneys-smoking-hot-memo-Andrew-Lansley-Keep-mean-dreary-views-life.html

particular country. For these people the elimination of tobacco would mean not only the loss of livelihoods but the loss in some cases of a past part of themselves. Those to whom I spoke, such as Keri, Geoff and Coralie, are not speaking out stridently against the moves to make the country tobacco-free, but they represent past-oriented, 'expressive utopia' nostalgia for the old days and ways. Such temporalities deserve recognition and respect. Then there are the tobacco-persons, contemporary users such as David Hockney who present the policy aspirations in play as positively dystopian. These perspectives also need to be considered in what Alexander (1979: 62) calls "a meta-apprehension of the whole system…the bringing to bear on a situation a larger perspective and the more rigorous synthesis this allows".

A social anthropologist can not only bring together viewpoints that might otherwise be cast asunder but also make a more substantive, real-world contribution to multiple perspectives, by contributing directly to the expansion of the knowledge base of different sides. Surveying the tobacco-free retailers while working with the 3D Viewfinder reel at Te Papa, looking further into its provenance as well as highlighting its significance as an object that seems to me to represent something larger than itself, are examples of bringing a wider perspective on the whole situation.

Finally, there is the opportunity to reflect back on the information presented through the use of contemporary anthropological theory. This may serve to cast what we have already seen and accepted in new and sometimes different and challenging lights. I have used Latourian thinking to present those intimately involved with both tobacco and tobacco control under the same rubric of 'tobacco-persons'. Viveiros de Castro talks of the Desana, one of many Amazonian peoples who use tobacco in hallucinogenic quantities to envision and facilitate relations with other worlds. They have "an ingenuously twisted construction of sticks or slats used to support clay receptacles", in which they "see…a cosmic model of the upper and lower worlds, with ours represented by the narrow part. Viewed from above, the object has the appearance of a hollow vortex. This motif evokes the idea of transformation, which indigenous thought associates with whirlpools, birth, rebirth, and, more generally, with female fertility" (Viveiros de Castro 2012a: 14 & 15). It is a construct with which anthropologists around the world will feel familiar, appearing commonly in the form of stools and small tables as well as receptacles for gourds etc.[28] As much as a birth canal (which I assume is what Viveiros de Castro alludes to in talking about birth and female fertility) I see this structure as relevant to a much larger schema of change and transformation. We are all currently swirling around in the vortex of the ethnographic present, a world with tobacco. What will it be like if and when the 'end-game scenarios' currently under consideration become reality and we go through the pinch-point in the middle and pass into a world which is 'tobacco-free'? There is a Chinese saying that when passing through crisis, it is important to come out the other side with our integrity intact. How are we going to deal with the withering or loss of the tobacco side of hybridity? How can we accommodate tobacco-persons' loss when they emerge on the other side of the pressure point/birth canal into a world in which the tobacco part of their hybrid persona has been subject to something akin to an excision or amputation?

Some anthropologists, in the spirit of critical social science, maintain a wholly negative stance towards the notion of a tobacco-free utopia. Their focus is on the implications of what the vision might mean for people who smoke but who find themselves an increasingly stigmatized and deviant minority. Kirsten Bell is an example of an anthropologist who, with her interest in

[28] For a visual image of the latter, see Hugh-Jones, S. (2009), 'The Fabricated Body: Objects and Ancestors in Northwest Amazonia', in F. Santos-Granero (ed.) *The Occult Life of Things*, Tucson: University of Arizona Press, p. 37 .

"critically engaged social science perspectives on tobacco" differentiates herself from what she sees as "the larger body of tobacco control research produced by social scientists working in the fields of public health, health promotion, etc." (2013: 34). She argues for the need to move 'beyond standard tobacco control perspectives', with a particular focus in her case on what she sees as "the iatrogenic consequences of prevailing policy approaches", such as the class effects of the denormalization of tobacco use, the stigmatization of poor smokers (which she queries as potentially 'legislating abjection' (2011)), and the potential for tobacco control legislation paradoxically "to reinforce smoking or push it into the home" (2013: 37). She points out the political nature of the terrain and the risk that research becomes 'illegitimate' or 'legitimate' with the 'legitimate' label applied only to that which furthers the goal of 'tobacco control'. This politicization of the debate is awkward, particularly for someone like myself who has sympathy for the utopian vision presented but who can appreciate its dystopian aspects as well. It is unfortunate in some ways that the word 'embedded' is used by Kohrman and Benson (2011: 337-8) to describe research by anthropologists who were flagrantly 'on the take' from tobacco industry largesse. Lewis and I (2011) use the same word to describe a model of long-term collaborative research with a tobacco control organization involving anthropological fieldwork that was simultaneously action-oriented, critical and reflexive and is, we argue, somehow crucial to the future of ethnography. In our case, however, unlike the anthropologists exposed by Kohrman and Benson (ibid.) there was no monetary element involved in the exchange!

It should be possible to maintain a dialogue that remains aloof to questions of legitimacy and illegitimacy. It may be possible, however, to use anthropological theory in ways that take a stronger position on the dystopian view of a tobacco-free future. Hockney's 'there is only now' stance is inherently wary of perfect futures and would undoubtedly agree with the anti-utopian, critical public health stance of Chrysanthou and others outlined above. However, such an individualistic position is inimical to the relational, fractal or 'dividual' condition outlined by Maité and Blanes in the Introduction to this volume. Hockney's is an essentializing, unitary understanding of the individual and the relationship between the human and the non-human. The dyadic thinking on which this is based, I hope to show elsewhere, can be attributed in part to the rapid dissemination of tobacco at the time of the European Enlightenment. Tobacco then went on to become a classic exemplar of the history of capitalism, with all the associated ideological baggage that goes with it. Is it a complete coincidence, then, to paraphrase Fisher and Jameson's comments on capitalism, that despite its relatively recent arrival on the global scene (at least, in deep historical terms) it has, until recently, been 'easier to imagine the end of the world than a world free of tobacco?' For example, those who propound 'freedom of choice' arguments for the continued use of tobacco (by them, as individuals), irrespective of the dangers of second-hand smoke (which they can only argue are questionable or the result some form of scientific subterfuge), do so without any sense of the social mobilization of the individual as a social being, a 'dividual' who is part of an intersubjective web of interpersonal, often kin-linked, relations (cf. Toren 2011 [2009]). Similarly, oft-propounded ideas such as 'we're all going to die (of something)' reveals determinedly essentialized 'life/death' binary thinking, without reference to the multiplicities of experience that are obscured by such a rigid dyad: the half-life, vegetative torpor of chronic and, to a large extent, hidden illnesses such as Chronic Obstructive Pulmonary Disease (COPD) for example, a long-term consequence of cigarette use. One could also mention the frequently grisly way life ends for people with lung cancer and other untimely 'smoking-related diseases'.

My call, then, is for social anthropology to be more pro-active in using its theoretical approaches and paradigms – actor-network-theory, for example, material culture studies, intersubjectivity, global capitalist critique – to engage not only in observing the multiple debates that a utopian

vision such as the prospect of a world without tobacco inspires, but also with the arguments of its dystopian detractors. Others may choose to counter with their own, less relational brands of anthropology – critically (dis)engaged social science, for example, or Foucauldian notions of discourse and governmentality. We may also 'risk enchantment' with the phenomenological and social constructionist views of the smoking person, and with the wider perspectives offered by the arts and humanities that have the potential to "give voice to aspects of existence that might otherwise be inexpressible" (Macnaughton et al 2011: 462), and even add the voice of tobacco to this mix (Russell in press). We can not only observe the battle, but also explicate the utopian thinking that may help to win the war.

Acknowledgements

Numerous people and organizations have helped this chapter come to fruition. Funding for the Aotearoa/New Zealand fieldwork was provided by a Matariki Universities Network Mobility Grant and a Leverhulme Research Fellowship. In Aotearoa/New Zealand, I would like to thank Richard Edwards, Keri Hulme, Monique Leerschool, Paul Madgwick, Ninya Maubach, Athol McCredie, Allan Meacham, Vicki Robertson, Bridget Rowse, Anita Schrafft, Coralie Smith and Geoff Tillson for their many forms of kindness and consideration. Members of the Smoking Interest Group at Durham University whose ideas have been influential include Susana Carro-Ripalda, Sue Lewis, Kwanwook Kim, Jane Macnaughton, Frances Thirlway and Megan Wainwright. I would like to thank Ruy Blanes, Mäité Maskens and Ramon Sarro for organizing the EASA 2014 conference panel PO63 'Anthropological utopias: debating personal, political and idealist expectations in the intersection of theory and ethnographic practice' which was the initial motivation for the preparation of this chapter. Ruy and Mäité also provided me with exemplary advice on orientation and references. All errors of fact, omission and over-intepretation are my own. In our last email exchange, on 13th July 2014, Geoff Tillson said of the conference paper "I am sure it will be of considerable interest to those fortunate enough to read or hear it", adding "the NZ Government wish to have this country smoke free by 2025 - a big ask". He died of prostate cancer on November 11th 2015. This chapter is dedicated to his memory.

References

Alexander, L. (1979), 'Clinical Anthropology: Morals and Methods', *Medical Anthropology*, 3(1):61-107.

Anon. 'Keri Hulme' article, *Wikipedia*, http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Keri_Hulme

Anon. 'View-Master Personal Stereo Camera' article, *Wikipedia*, https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/View-Master_Personal_Stereo_Camera

Anon. (2011) 'Hulme to leave 'Mcmansion' Okarito', *Otago Daily Times Online News*, December 22nd, http://www.odt.co.nz/entertainment/books/191953/hulme-leave-mcmansion-okarito

Barnett, R., G. Moon and R. Kearns (2004) Social inequality and ethnic differences in smoking in New Zealand, *Social Science and Medicine*, 59(1): 129–43.

Barnett, R., J. Pearce and G. Moon (2005) Does social inequality matter? Changing ethnic socio-economic disparities and Maori smoking in New Zealand, 1981–1996, *Social Science and Medicine*, 60 (7): 1515–1526.

Bell, K. (2013), 'Whither Tobacco Studies?' *Sociology Compass*, 7(1): 34-44.

____ (2011), 'Legislating Abjection? Secondhand Smoke, Tobacco Control Policy and the Public's Health', *Critical Public Health*, 21(1): 49-62.

Benowitz, N.L. and J.E. Henningfield (2013), 'Reducing the nicotine content to make cigarettes less addictive', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i14-i17.

Benson, P. (2010), 'Tobacco Talk: Reflections on Corporate Power and the Legal Framing of Consumption', *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 24(4): 500-21.

____ (2012), *Tobacco Capitalism: Growers, Migrant Workers, and the Changing Face of a Global Industry*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Benson, P and S Kirsch (2010), 'Capitalism and the Politics of Resignation', *Current Anthropology*, 51(4): 459-86.

Benson, P. and K. Thomas (2010), After cultural competency: research practice and moral experience in the study of brand pirates and tobacco farmers. *Qualitative Research*, 10(6): 679–697.

Berlin, I. (1990), *The crooked timber of humanity*, London: John Murray.

Berrick, A.J. (2013), 'The tobacco-free generation proposal', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i22-i26.

Borland, R. (2013) 'Minimising the harm from nicotine use: finding the right regulatory framework', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i6-i9.

Callard, C.D. and N.E. Collishaw (2013), 'Supply-side options for an endgame for the tobacco industry', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i10-i13.

Chystanthou, M. (2002) Transparency and selfhood: Utopia and the informed body. *Social Science and Medicine*, 54: 469-79.

Claeys, G. (2011), *Searching for Utopia: The History of an Idea*. London: Thames and Hudson.

Columbus, C. (1893) *The Journal of Christopher Columbus: During His First Voyage, 1492-93*, trans. Sir Clements Robert Markham. London: Hakluyt Society.

Crawford, R. (1980) Healthism and the medicalization of everyday life. *International Journal of Health Services*, 10(3): 365-88.

Crosby, A.W. (2003) *The Columbian Exchange: Biological and Cultural Consequences of 1492* (30th Anniversary Edition), Westport CN: Praeger.

Dennis, S. (2016) *Smokefree: A Social, Moral and Political Atmosphere*. London: Bloomsbury.

Eriksen, M., J. Mackay, N. Schluger, F. Islami Gomeshtapeh, J. Drope (2015) *The Tobacco Atlas*, 5th ed., Atlanta: American Cancer Society.

Fisher, M. (2009) *Capitalist Realism: Is there no alternative?* Ropley: O Books.

Geertz, C. (1984), 'Anti-anti relativism', *American Anthropologist*, 86(2): 263-78.

Givel, M.S. (2011) History of Bhutan's prohibition of cigarettes: implications for neo-prohibitionists and their critics. *International Journal of Drug Policy*, 22: 306-310.

Glover, M. (2005) Analysing smoking using Te Whare Tapa Wha, *New Zealand Journal of Psychology*, 34(1): 13-19.

Grillo, R.D. and R.L. Stirrat (1997) *Discourses of Development: Anthropological Perspectives*. Oxford: Berg.

Harrison, J. (2012) 'Sainsburys ends sale of cigarettes', *The Herald*, November 12th, http://www.heraldscotland.com/news/13080602.Sainsbury_s_ends_sale_of_cigarettes/

Heckler, S. and A. Russell (2008), Emotional engagement in strategic partnerships: grassroots organising in a tobacco control partnership in the North East of England. *Evidence and Policy*, 4(4): 331-54.

Hockney, D. (2001), *Secret Knowledge: Rediscovering the Lost Techniques of the Old Masters*. London: Thames and Hudson.

Hockney, D. (2012) 'A letter in a picture by David Hockney', *The Guardian*, February 28th http://www.theguardian.com/society/2012/feb/28/david-hockney-letter-in-picture.

Hockney, D. (2013) 'Life is now. Don't let the professional anti-smoking brigade ruin it', *The Guardian*, March 15th, http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2013/mar/15/life-now-anti-smoking-brigade-ruin-it.

Hockney, D. (2012) Smoking hot memo from David Hockney to Health Minister: Keep your mean, dreary views out of my life, *Mail Online*, April 15th, http://www.dailymail.co.uk/news/article-2129954/David-Hockneys-smoking-hot-memo-Andrew-Lansley-Keep-mean-dreary-views-life.html

Holbraad, M. (2011), *Can the Thing Speak?* Open Anthropology Cooperative Press, Working Papers Series #7.

Hugh-Jones, S. (2009), 'The Fabricated Body: Objects and Ancestors in Northwest Amazonia', in F. Santos-Granero (ed.) *The Occult Life of Things*, Tucson: University of Arizona Press.

Jaine, R., Russell, M., Edwards, R., Thomson, G. (2014), 'New Zealand tobacco retailers' attitudes to selling tobacco, point-of-sale display bans and other tobacco control measures: a qualitative analysis', *New Zealand Medical Journal*, 127(1396).

James I (1604) *A Counter-blaste to Tobacco*. London.

Kohrman, M. and P. Benson (2011), 'Tobacco', *Annual Review of Anthropology*, 40: 329-44.

Latour, B. (2005), *Reassembling the Social*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Lewis, S. and A. Russell (2011), 'Being Embedded: A Way Forward for Ethnographic Research', *Ethnography*, 12(3): 398-416.

_____ (2013) 'Young Smokers' Narratives: Public Health, Disadvantage and Structural Violence', *Sociology of Health and Illness*, 35(5): 246-60.

Logie, V. (2014) 'Shops Kick Tobacco Habit', *Greymouth Star*, http://www.greystar.co.nz/content/shops-kick-tobacco-habit.

Macnaughton, J., Carro-Ripalda, S. and A. Russell (2012), ''Risking enchantment': how are we to view the smoking person?' *Critical Public Health*, 22(4): 455-469.

Marcus, G.E. (1998) *Ethnography through Thick and Thin*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

McAloon, J. (2013) 'Hops, tobacco and hemp - Tobacco', *Te Ara - the Encyclopedia of New Zealand*, updated 22-Feb-13, http://www.TeAra.govt.nz/en/hops-tobacco-and-hemp/page-2

McNeill, A., Iringe-Koko, B., Bains,M., Bauld, L., Siggens, G., Russell, A. (2014), 'Countering the demand for, and supply of, illicit tobacco: an assessment of the 'North of England Tackling Illicit Tobacco for Better Health' Programme, *Tobacco Control*, 23:e44–e50.

Miller, D. (2005) 'Materiality: An Introduction', in D. Miller (ed.) *Materiality*. Durham, NC: Duke University Press.

Miyazaki, H. (2004) *The Method of Hope: Anthropology, Philosophy, and Fijian Knowledge*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.

Otañez, M., M.E. Muggli, R.D. Hurt and S.A. Glantz (2006) Eliminating child labour in Malawi: A British American Tobacco corporate responsibility project to sidestep tobacco labour exploitation. *Tobacco Control*, 15(3): 224-30.

O'Shea, P.K. (1997) *The Golden Harvest: a History of Tobacco Growing in New Zealand*. Christchurch: Hazard Press.

Pool, R. and W. Geissler (2005) *Medical Anthropology*. Maidenhead: Open University Press.

Proctor, R. (2011), *Golden Holocaust: Origins of the Cigarette Catastrophe and the Case for Abolition*. Berkeley: University of California Press.

_____ (2013) 'Why ban the sale of cigarettes? The case for abolition', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i27-i30.

Rentetzi, M. (2009) The Tobacco Museum of the City of Kavala, *Technology and Culture*, 50 (3): 649-657.

Rivoal, I., and N.B. Salazar (2013), 'Contemporary ethnographic practice and the value of serendipity', *Social Anthropology/Anthropologie Sociale*, 21(2): 178-85.

Russell, A. (in preparation) Can the Plant Speak? Giving Tobacco the Voice it Deserves. Article for special issue 'Ambivalent Objects: Things, Substances, Commodities, and Technologies in Global Health', *Journal of Material Culture*.

Russell, A., Heckler, S., Sengupta, S., White, M., Chappel, D., Hunter, D.J., Mason, J., Milne, E. and S. Lewis (2009), 'The evolution of a UK regional tobacco control office in its early years: social contexts and policy dynamics', *Health Promotion International*, 24: 262-8.

Russell, A. and E. Rahman (2015) (eds), *The Master Plant: Tobacco in Lowland South America*, London: Bloomsbury.

Russell, A., M. Wainwright and H. Mamudu (2015) 'A Chilling Example? Uruguay, Philip Morris International, and the WHO's Framework Convention on Tobacco Control', *Medical Anthropology Quarterly*, 29(2): 256–277.

Russell, A., M. Wainwright and M. Tilson (2016) Means and ENDS – E-Cigarettes, the Framework Convention on Tobacco Control, and Global Health Diplomacy in Action. *Global Public Health*, DOI:10.1080/17441692.2016.1152284

Shukaitis, S. (2010 [2004]), 'An Ethnography of Nowhere: Notes Toward a Re-envisioning of Utopian Thinking', in N. Jun and W. Wall (eds), *New Perspectives on Anarchism*, Lanham, MD: Lexington Books.

_____ and M. Lim (2012), 'Editorial', *Culture and Organization*, 18(5): 341-3.

Smith, C. (2012) 'History of the Rothman's Factory Recounted', *Motueka Online*, October 31st, http://www.motuekaonline.org.nz/news/stories12/311012s2.html

Thompson, L., J. Pearce and J. Ross Barnett (2007) Moralising geographies: stigma, smoking islands and responsible subjects, *Area*: 39(4): 508–517.

Toren, C. (2011/[2009]), 'Intersubjectivity as Epistemology', in C. Toren and J. de Pina-Cabral (eds) *The Challenge of Epistemology: Anthropological Perspectives*. New York: Berghahn Books, pp. 130-47.

Trewavas, A. (2014) *Plant Behaviour and Intelligence*. Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Trewavas, A. and F. Baluška (2011) The ubiquity of consciousness. *EMBO Reports*, 12(12): 1221-25.

Ugen, S. (2003) Bhutan: The World's Most Advanced Tobacco Control Nation? *Tobacco Control*, 12: 431-3.

Vivieros de Castro, E. (1998) Cosmological deixis and Amerindian perspectivism, *Journal of the Royal Anthropological Institute*, 4: 469-488.

____ (2012a), *Radical Dualism: A Meta-Fantasy on the Square Root of Dual Organizations or a Savage Homage to Levi-Strauss*. (100 Notes-100 Thoughts Documenta 13). Ostfildern: Hatje Cantz.

_____ (2012b), *Cosmological perspectivism in Amazonia and elsewhere*. Masterclass Series 1. Manchester, HAU Network of Ethnographic Theory.

Weix, G.G. (1997) Displaying the postcolonial past: the Kudus Kretek Museum in Java. *Visual Anthropology Review*, 13(1): 28-39.

Wilson, N, G.W. Thomson, R. Edwards and T. Blakely (2013), 'Potential advantages and disadvantages of an endgame strategy: a 'sinking lid' on tobacco supply', *Tobacco Control*, 22(s1): i18-i21.

Wolff, L. (2007), 'Discovering Cultural Perspective: the Intellectual History of Anthropological Thought in the Age of Enlightenment', in L. Wolff and M. Cipollini (eds) *The Anthropology of the Enlightenment*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.