A Social Aesthetics of Imperfection: Spontaneity and Meaning in Pop on the Streets of China

Samuel Horlor

Introduction

The instrumental introduction to a Mandarin-dialect pop song 'Seeing through love, seeing through you' (Kantou aiqing kantou ni) lasts about 25 seconds on the 2009 recording sung by Leng Mo. A flute sound preempts a version of the main vocal melody, setting the scene for a song of betrayal and disillusionment layered on top of a cheery pop production. The story begins with the protagonist realising he has lost his lover to another man: 'You changed into the clothes he bought / With a smile as sweet as it always was.' At this evening's performance, though, the first three words are as far as the song progresses before it comes to an abrupt halt. The young woman singing suddenly turns away from the audience, gesturing towards the keyboard player behind her; she has realised that the key they have started in is the wrong one for her voice. With no obvious break in the flow of the music, the keyboard player responds by jumping right back to the start of the introduction, and the drummer and trumpet player who form the rest of the band quickly fall into line, this time setting up the song a tone or two lower in pitch. Comfortable in this new vocal range, the singer carries on: 'From now on in your world for two / There is someone who has replaced me for ever.'

The aborted start to hit on the right key for the song is quickly forgotten – if it really registered at all with the few dozen people in tonight's audience – and before the first verse is over, members of the crowd begin to approach the stage and press cash rewards into the singer's hand. These gifts are the raison d'être of tonight's show; it is May 2014, and this kind of performance takes place each afternoon and evening in about a dozen corners of this city, Wuhan, a central-Chinese provincial capital of around 10 million inhabitants. Local people, mainly middle aged and older, while away a few hours at a time listening to the amateur renderings of these classic and more recent pop

songs in cramped and dusty corners of city squares, green spaces, and derelict sites. Although singers are generally 'untrained' and the quality is variable, they make their living from the gifts that regular audience members give in recognition of the singing and as part of relationships that develop over time between the two parties.

The aborted start to the song tonight hints at a congruity with how mistakes and imperfections appear in Chinese music culture more widely. The phrase 'unstable opening' describes well what I witness tonight in Wuhan; when Tong Soon Lee uses it in the context of Chinese opera performances on the streets of Singapore, his emphasis is on how such openings offer potential for spontaneous creativity.[1] A singer may start up a tune for the string accompanist to follow, the latter often requiring a few moments to find and match the singer's pitch.[2] In other music drama traditions, such as Sichuan opera, responses to 'mistakes' are integrated so thoroughly as to become codified, with actors inventing short or longer passages to keep the flow going when they forget words, and drummers developing personalised repertories of material exclusively to cover mistakes and to prompt actors back in.[3] Parallels can be seen here with some of Derek Bailey's well-known observations on improvisation in jazz and elsewhere; 'by accident' seems to be an important mode in various contexts.[4]

Spontaneity and imperfection in Chinese music

The scene set so far is meant to situate my approach to spontaneity and imperfection in a particular musico-cultural context. The aesthetics of imperfection emphasises contingencies of the performance process over music product;[5] the present chapter is about developing this through an approach primarily interested in music as a social and cultural phenomenon, especially by considering how people relate to each other and their environment in musical performance. Before I return to explore this in the amateur pop music from the streets of Wuhan, key pillars of my approach are revealed by first briefly looking at spontaneity in Chinese music from a historical angle. The term *jixing* ('immediate creation') can describe different levels of spontaneity across Chinese musical genres.[6] At

one extreme are whole dramas sung and acted with only a written topic outline for performers to consult in the wings.[7] This design makes it possible, for instance, for opera troupes to give evening performances dealing with stories from that morning's newspapers.[8] On another level, some folk song traditions are built on dialogues in which singers try to outwit or amuse their partners with spontaneous replies to song lines. The singing often takes place alongside work in fields, during courtship, at competitions, or as funeral laments.[9] Common across levels is that the spontaneity is less about extemporising to produce completely 'new' music, and more about creatively combining set elements, through adding or merging lines of text, or through the formulaic borrowing of musical phrases.[10]

Historically, bringing idiosyncratic and context-specific treatment to established frameworks is often considered the essence of the genres of which this is part, a marker of true mastery, and a 'trigger [of] the public's enthusiasm' for the music.[11] Over the last century, however, the trend across genres has clearly been for repertory to be treated in increasingly fixed ways. Since at least the 1930s, for example, teachers of operatic forms have expected students to memorise texts and melodies exactly.[12] Typical, also, is the influence of individuals such as Li Runjie, a key figure in mid-twentieth-century developments to *kuaibanshu*, a genre of storytelling with wooden clapper accompaniment from the northern city of Tianjin.[13] Li was 'concerned about 'upgrading' his art form into a respectable genre for an increasingly savvy and sophisticated urban clientele' by composing and codifying material to play up the genre's literary credentials.[14] These experiences encapsulate a normalisation of perfectionist ideals over the last century, the work rather than the performance becoming the main locus of value.

These changes have been linked to numerous wider developments: the establishment of state music academies teaching Western classical music and a narrow range of standardised local musics; the related formalisation of performance contexts; political censors since the 1950s requiring material to be written down for pre-performance approval; and an increasing use of the more prescriptive modern cipher notation (*jianpu*).[15]

Some inside these musical cultures have lamented a shift towards music 'lacking flavour and thus necessarily diluting the tradition' and, in narrative genres, story-tellers (*shuoshu ren*) having become far more rigid 'story-reciters' (*beishu ren*).[16] Indeed, in the last decade or so, a distinct reaction has emerged – in the realm of folk singing especially – against the formalised and orchestrated songs performed by conservatory graduates. Helen Rees describes a new craze for 'original ecology folksong' (*yuanshengtai min'ge*) as manifestation of a 'sudden shift in musical aesthetic', one returning to value found in unpolished, local versions sung by rural people.[17] To illustrate, Rees reports being present on an occasion when the singing of drinking songs started up around a dinner table in a small remote town. One observer, she remembers, exclaimed: 'This is improvised creation (*jixing chuangzuo*), it's *really* original ecology.'[18]

Rees sees a political significance in this shift, viewing it as a manifestation of growing public concerns over cultural and environmental loss following massive economic development in the last few decades. The fledgling free and jazz improvisation scenes in contemporary China, too, seem highly attuned to political concerns. The spontaneity participants explore here is a self-conscious reaction to the aesthetics of state hegemony; they understand what they do as instead drawing upon the aesthetics of historical traditions such as solo *guqin* (seven-string zither) playing.[19] There are links here with Daoism, a philosophical and religious tradition thought of as central to Chinese culture since the fourth century BCE.[20] In simplified terms, Daoism stands for creative thinking, intuition, spontaneity, connection to nature, and a rejection of enslaving rules and structures, and thus the commonalities with the ideals of imperfectionism are clear.[21] The same cannot be said, however, for the other major tradition with strong contemporary legacy. Confucianism, as a 2,000-year-old state-supported institution of intellectual and socio-political organisation, stands for order, propriety, and the interests of the collective over the individual.[22] The concept of *yue*, which incorporates music, music theory, dance and social ceremony, is valued in Confucian doctrine for its instrumentality in promoting social harmony.[23] As such, rather than simply showing an aesthetic basis, Chinese musical culture arguably has an ethic-aesthetic at its foundations, a conception of the value of musical sound tied to its social effects.[24]

The aesthetics of imperfection in cultural context

The spontaneity of *jixing* is both manifest and valued in multiple and shifting ways, so how have scholars of Chinese music sought order in this multiplicity? As Jonathan Stock notes, some argue that the term *jixing* should be reserved for 'melodic innovation that is both spontaneous and substantive, not the putting together in performance of pre-existing materials'.[25] Stock ultimately advocates an opposing view, one arrived at by following 'folk evaluation', the privileging of the conceptualisations of people involved. Musicians may understand themselves to be 'creating music anew during performance', even when they are combining pre-established elements – most pertinent in their minds is that they are not following scores.[26] As ethnomusicologists, Stock and colleagues in this academic field are interested, broadly speaking, in *people* doing music, as it is found in its diverse global contexts. The folk evaluation approach reflects one key way that ethnomusicologists make sense of the extreme diversity of practices sharing improvisatory or imperfectionist elements around the world. The issue is framed in an influential article on the topic by Bruno Nettl from 1974. Nettl searches across cultures for musical features typical of, and shared between, *quick* and *slow* ways of creating music, and similar approaches have since been taken up by music psychologists and scholars of Western art music.[27]

This literature suggests broad agreement across fields of music scholarship on key features of Hamilton's defence of the aesthetics of imperfection. Hamilton sees improvisation and composition not in binary opposition but as 'interpenetrating opposites'; features of one ideal type can be found in the other, and real-life practices are accommodated on a continuum between the two.[28] Part of the intention is to undermine an orthodoxy in which perfectionism and composition represent the creative mode par excellence, while 'more individual, unschooled techniques' are denigrated in an 'expression of classical authority'.[29] Transcending the binary model is a solution advocated by ethnomusicologists too, also for reasons related to authority. Laudan Nooshin reports that in Iran, some consider Western classical music superior for its association with the scientific, while the more performer-driven Iranian classical music is the inferior 'other'.[30] The goal of Nooshin's discussion is to problematise the

'colonising' and 'self-othering' implications of alterities that the composition/improvisation binary enables.[31] Like Hamilton, she recognises that at stake here are not only musical features and practices but also how people position themselves in opposition to others and how power relations play out.

While, then, there are clear commonalities between the aesthetics of imperfection and scholarship of contemporary ethnomusicology, the two start to diverge with reference to one key feature. Hamilton's scheme advocates valuing musical process over musical product; the contrast between the rival aesthetics of imperfection and perfection hinges on 'a focus on the moment of performance (imperfection) [versus] the timelessness of the work (perfection)'.[32] Rather than imagining a performance to be simply an iteration of an enduring 'work', the aesthetics of imperfection emphasises factors such as bodies, the material forms of instruments, and performance locations, all of which contribute to the uniqueness of each fleeting occasion. I subscribe to the idea that these factors cannot be ignored. My main argument for the rest of this chapter, though, is that there is significant room to broaden out this focus beyond the point the aesthetics of imperfection currently enables. In fact, there may even be basic tensions between the concern for musical process and the very framing of the issue as an aesthetic one.

Ethnomusicologists are particularly well placed to contribute tools for considering performance as process, and being attuned to the significance of cultural factors exposes assumptions of the *aesthetic* project that may be at odds with this focus. Hamilton ties ideas of art and the aesthetic together; he characterises the former as having 'a conscious aesthetic end [and] richly reward[ing] aesthetic attention'.[33] This is a reminder that music aestheticians are primarily interested in music involving an attitude of deep contemplation from both creators and receivers. As Judith Becker argues, though, the notions of 'aesthetic ends' and 'aesthetic attention' themselves carry substantial historical and cultural baggage. She notes that the term *aesthetics* is a 'creation of enlightenment European thought', and that a model of musical experience involving 'a listener who is imagined as sitting quietly with fixed attention upon the musical event' is one specifically suited to Western classical and a few closely related musics whose cultures are born of these ideals.[34] Indeed, scholars with wider cultural perspectives have questioned the very notion of a 'distinctive aesthetic mode of perception',[35]

and rather than a model of listeners *taking* something from the music, they propose considering 'the *relationship* of the listener to the musical event'.[36]

In other words, reconsidering the model of people *listening* to music in favour of people *relating* to musical events demands that aesthetics be broadened out to 'subsume the related concepts of value and meaning'.[37] Here, the focus shifts to *creative processes*, and to the different ways possible of participating in musical experiences.[38] Thomas Turino sets up a continuum with, at one end, presentational performance (performance by specialist musicians to specialist listeners) and, at the other end, participatory performance (everyone present being a potential contributor).[39] Each place on this continuum requires different kinds of attention and action from those involved – singing, playing, dancing, clapping, supporting, and so on.[40] A couple of examples of radically different kinds of musical experience emphasise inadequacies in the picture of meaning evoked by *aesthetics*. In street-corner rap 'battles' in the United States, the music is about competing and winning in the creative trading of insults with other rappers;[41] it is not about deep contemplative experiences, nor really about entertaining people (a purpose Hamilton sets up as the alternative to creating art).[42] In another case, that of the Tumbuka people of Malawi, music's main meanings are found in its therapeutic effects. Here, 'the healing arts have not been separated into mutually exclusive categories of medical care and aesthetic experience'.[43]

Meaning, then, is found in the process of musical performance in ways that go far beyond what the idea of aesthetics conjures, the rapt listener's disinterested contemplation of sound. So, just as Hamilton notes that 'the prescriptions of the authoritative art music are not universal; good technique must be characterized with reference to the kind of musical effects the performer is trying to achieve',[44] my intention here is to follow through with the idea of 'musical effects' – or meanings – in a fuller way. The focus on process that the aesthetics of imperfection advocates, if not incompatible with its narrow concern for the 'artistic' dimensions of music, could certainly be enriched by considering how imperfection is more broadly meaningful in the process of musical performance.

One important level of meaning not yet explored thoroughly – perhaps music's 'primary' level of meaning – is the collective.[45] Recent work elaborating ideas of 'social aesthetics' questions

the separation of the *aesthetic* and the *social*, and this is a point I highlight as I return to the performances of pop on the streets of contemporary China.[46] How is imperfection implicated in meaning made *between people* in this context? Being far removed from the forces of perfectionism I have already raised in connection with institutionalised Chinese music culture, but at the same time heavily reliant for their repertory on the canonical recordings honed in Chinese pop studios, these shows seem an ideal case study. Part of the task is about seeing performance as an emplaced phenomenon, and an element of the brief picture I present here is about performance location as a factor in the meanings made between people.

Imperfection and social meaning in Wuhan's pop shows

Returning to May 2014, then, I find that three of the afternoon amateur singing stages in Wuhan have recently been moved out of a small patch of public green space following a dispute with local police about their presence there. They have taken a step unique among groups I encountered in the city of hiring out an indoor alternative; the Wangjiang Building is a shabby space just across the road, built into a riverside promenade beside the Great Yangtze River Bridge. The three stages take one room each of this long, thin building; the rooms are connected up by a walkway running along its length, and there is a shutter opening up to a patio at one end (Figure 7.1). In many ways, the character of the performances changes little as a result of this move indoors. Singers and spectators still circulate constantly between the three stages, and curious passers-by still come and go, attracted to the music that they hear loudly from the promenade above. Despite being indoors, these three stages have a sense of transition almost as strong as those in normal public streets.

[Insert Figure 7.1 here]

Figure 7.1: The patio at one end of the Wangjiang Building, with people looking down from the riverside promenade above, and the Great Yangtze River Bridge in the background (photo by the author, 6 November 2014).

In other senses, however, this move indoors highlights ways imperfection is part of *meaning* in these (socio-)musical occasions. The scene that I described at the very beginning of this chapter – of singer and keyboard player taking time to arrive at the appropriate key – is typical of the regular false starts, corrections, and negotiations that characterise the musicians' flexible attitude to the unfolding of songs. Imperfection is also manifest in several other facets of how sound, setting, and behaviour intersect. Most fundamentally, this venue's acoustic conditions are simply incompatible with the perfectionist ideals of clarity and finely honed musical detail. The building's design and technology – employed by necessity rather than choice – are especially unconducive to well-defined sound. Music from the dated PA systems of the three rooms bleeds extensively through the walls and open doorways between them (Figure 7.2); off-stage singers moving around with microphones regularly creates screams of feedback, and the PA systems are set to maximum volume with extreme reverb and ever-present echo masking intricate detail. Unaccustomed members of the public pass through the rooms with hands over their ears, and aural fatigue surely contributes to audience numbers dwindling significantly over a three-hour afternoon session.

[Insert Figure 7.2 here]

Figure 7.2: One of the three rooms in the Wangjiang Building. On the left side of the far end wall is an opening to the next performance room (photo by the author, 6 November 2014).

Are these conditions for imperfection in the musical performance simply unhelpful, or are they valued and implicated in specific meanings generated here? Do factors 'detracting' from the clarity of the main sonic signal (reverb, echo, masking) add dimensions to what is prized in the experience? One afternoon, I am in the room at the far end of the Wangjiang Building, and I watch as one performer crosses over to the sound desk in the middle of a song to turn down the volume of music that is starting to distort. One of the event insiders, an organiser seated near the desk, immediately turns it

back up, as if asking: 'How can we demonstrate our energy by playing soft music?' These performances in Wuhan show clear parallels with another form of amateur singing that is highly popular in East Asia, karaoke. Loudness, reverb, and echo are often understood as welcome levelling influences here; in particular, they bring an indistinctness to how singers transition between notes, as the onsets and decaying of tones overlap. Less skilled leisure musicians, therefore, are able to play a successful part in music-making without feeling that 'shortcomings' in their performances are too clearly audible.[47]

On Wuhan's streets, there is a very specific vocabulary in use to link issues of sound to qualities of the social occasion more generally (even if I did not hear singers go as far as acknowledging the advantages of a forgiving mix in the same way that karaoke singers do). A primary aim of organisers is to build *re'nao*, literally 'heat and noise', a state of effervescence that sweeps people along into enthusiastic engagement, and a familiar reference point in contemporary Chinese culture. Beibei is a singer in one of the Wangjiang Building groups, and she tells me that producing *re'nao* is an aim both in singing and also in her wider dealings with audience members. The dinners to which she and other singers treat their fans and customers between sessions are not so much about directly setting up reciprocal cash tips at subsequent shows, but more they are for 'fun, *re'nao*, and to build popularity (*coucou renqi*)'.[48] I understand *re'nao* as inherently a manifestation of imperfectionist orientations. Researcher of Chinese folk Stephen Jones explains this with reference to the excitement underpinning the '*chaotic* outpouring of folk exuberance' across rural life.[49] For Jones, ritual procession groups with ear-splitting shawm bands, boisterous operatic percussion, and folk singing more akin to shouting – plus the firecrackers often set off around performance occasions – are representative of a major facet of the nation's musical culture, more so than its disproportionately known urban chamber forms. The century of fixing and refining in Chinese music that I presented in the first half of this chapter is underpinned by the normalisation of perfectionist values. But *re'nao* is fostered not by attention to finely honed intricacies in musical sound; instead it is primarily a matter of loudness, intensity, and exuberance complementing other features of everyday and ritual practice. Like heightened modes of experience linked to music in other contexts, *re'nao* is a phenomenon that

resists categorisation as a feature of any single facet of experience in isolation. A.J. Racy makes this point about the somewhat similar phenomenon of *ṭarab*, the transcendent ecstasy associated with successful musical experiences in the Arab world; he addresses 'a panoramic vision of ṭarab, as a complex that embraces an aesthetic-experiential core, but also intertwines with a thick network of cultural values, economic relationships, and social hierarchies'.[50] *Re'nao*, then, is a valuing of imperfectionist qualities read in sound, but also in a far wider picture.

As I have argued elsewhere, the ultimate consequences of generating *re'nao* are about fostering the conditions for performers and audience members to develop individual interactions and relationships – the basis for the cash tips from which performers make their livings.[51] The effects of imperfection are felt most meaningfully in enabling a sense of interpersonal intimacy to develop. In performance situations with more perfectionist ideals (often in the more 'presentational' forms of performance), musicians may seek to represent themselves to others through emphasising formalised behaviours that can be practiced and 'perfected'. These behaviours may extend beyond the action needed directly to produce sound and into wider stage conduct, such as walking on, bowing, tuning instruments, indicating readiness to begin playing, and so on. In performances with more 'participatory' elements, and with intentions to dissolve rather than reinforce performer-audience barriers, it may be positively useful for informal, unrehearsed, or 'imperfect' behaviours to be displayed instead of left backstage.

This is emphatically the case in the Wangjiang Building. One evening, the sun sets spectacularly over the Great Yangtze River Bridge seen through the windows. The saxophone player of one of the bands puts down his instrument mid-song and goes over to the window to photograph the view with his mobile phone, and the music carries on without him. From a musical point of view, there is obviously no need to strive for perfect playing (or even to be playing at all) at every moment in a session. Likewise, from the point of view of wider behaviour, the musician's informal and unrehearsed actions are far from disruptive or undermining, and audience gifts – the ultimate measure of success in performance here – continue flowing unaffected. This individual's engagement with the unique performance setting, and the connection between this and social meaning, brings into focus

material dimensions of the value of imperfection here. In the process of performance, musicians embrace contingencies of the unique occasion in ways that have consequences on sonic and social levels. And there are further dimensions of significance in the saxophone player's snaps. His shot captures exactly the point at which Mao Zedong, the first leader of Communist China, famously swam in the Yangtze in 1966 as a statement of his continuing fortitude despite advancing age (Figure 7.3). The river clearly has special significances for participants in the musical events; I got to know the keyboard player from the same band, and one day he staged an impromptu ritual with me as we walked together to the venue. He led me down to the Yangtze's edge just outside the building, and we washed our hands in its waters. The situation of the performances at this spot links them not only to the aura of recent political history, but also to the river's status as central to Chinese history and society over millennia.[52]

[Insert Figure 7.3 here]

Figure 7.3: Mural commemorating Mao Zedong's swim in the Yangtze River in 1966, with the Wangjiang Building immediately beyond it (photo by the author 12 October 2014).

Conclusion

Imperfection is a value that implicitly pervades the creative practices and wider musical experience on the streets (and indoor venues) of Wuhan. What I read here is not a narrow *aesthetics* of imperfection (involving a particular mode of contemplative listening), but a *social aesthetics* of imperfection, one in which sound intersects in complex ways with people engaging in various modes. Furthermore, meaning is generated not through people interacting in a decontextualized way, but as they relate to the specifics of their environment, including in ways referring to wider histories and cultural values. Imperfection in sound and behaviour is important here as it serves the forging of intimacy between people, and ultimately the cash economy. It emphasises my main point again: valuing process over product in music demands that attention be expanded to these wider notions of meaning. The

alternative, assuming interest in music to rest on a discreet aesthetic mode of experience, leaves imperfection's potency explored in only a limited way. Taking *meaning* as the starting point affords imperfection a life outside of narrow cultural confines; as Hamilton suggests, Western classical modes should not be taken as markers of authority beyond that particular musical realm.[53] The social aesthetics of imperfection follows through on this promise to redress the balance with a fuller focus on musical performance as process.

References

Becker, J. (1983), ''Aesthetics' in Late 20th Century Scholarship', *The World of Music*, 25: 3, pp. 65-80.

Born, G., Lewis, E. and Straw, W. (2017), 'Introduction: What is Social Aesthetics?', in G. Born, E. Lewis and W. Straw eds., *Improvisation and Social Aesthetics*, London: Duke University Press, pp. 1-30.

Capdeville-Zeng, C. (2015), 'A Chengdu Field Research Report: The Lively 'Torch Troupes' of Sichuan Opera', *CHIME*, 20, pp. 69-84.

Chan, S. (1991), *Improvisation in a Ritual Context: The Music of Cantonese Opera*, Hong Kong: The Chinese University Press.

Cook, N. (2017), 'Scripting Social Interaction: Improvisation, Performance, and Western 'Art' Music', in G. Born, E. Lewis and W. Straw eds., *Improvisation and Social Aesthetics*, London: Duke University Press, pp. 59-77.

Friedson, S. (1996), *Dancing Prophets: Musical Experience in Tumbuka Healing*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Hamilton, A. (2000), 'The Art of Improvisation and the Aesthetics of Imperfection', *British Journal of Aesthetics*, 40: 1, pp. 168-185.

_____. (forthcoming), 'The Artist as Entertainer, the Entertainer as Artist: An Essay on the Aesthetics of Entertainment'.

Harris, R. (2004), *Singing the Village: Music, Memory and Ritual among the Sibe of Xinjiang*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Horlor, S. (2019), 'Permeable Frames: Intersections of the Performance, the Everyday, and the Ethical in Chinese Street Singing', *Ethnomusicology Forum*, 28: 1, pp. 3-25.

Jones, S. (1995), *Folk Music of China: Living Instrumental Traditions*, Oxford: Clarendon Press.

_____. (2013), 'Gender and Music in Local Communities', in R. Harris, R. Pease and S. Tan eds., *Gender in Chinese Music*, Rochester: University of Rochester Press, pp. 26-40.

Lau, F. (2015), ''Centre or Periphery?': Regional Music in Contemporary China', *International Communication of Chinese Culture*, 2: 1, pp. 31-47.

Lawson, F. (2011), *The Narrative Arts of Tiānjīn: Between Music and Language*, Farnham: Ashgate.

Lee, J. (2009), 'Battlin' on the Corner: Techniques for Sustaining Play', *Social Problems*, 56: 3, pp. 578-598.

Lee, T. (2009), *Chinese Street Opera in Singapore*, Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Marlow, E. (2018), *Jazz in China: From Dance Hall Music to Individual Freedom of Expression*, Jackson: University Press of Mississippi.

Nettl, B. (1974), 'Thoughts on Improvisation: A Comparative Approach', *The Musical Quarterly*, 60: 1, pp. 1-19.

Nooshin, L. (2017), '(Re-)imagining Improvisation: Discursive Positions in Iranian Music from Classical to Jazz', in E. Clarke and M. Doffman eds., *Distributed Creativity: Collaboration and Improvisation in Contemporary Music*, New York: Oxford University Press, pp. 214-235.

Racy, A. (2003), *Making Music in the Arab World: The Culture and Artistry of Ṭarab*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Rees, H. (2016), 'Environmental Crisis, Culture Loss, and a New Musical Aesthetic: China's 'Original Ecology Folksongs' in Theory and Practice', *Ethnomusicology*, 60: 1, pp. 53-88.

Schimmelpenninck, A. (1997), *Chinese Folk Songs and Folk Singers:* Shan'ge *Traditions in Southern Jiangsu*, Leiden: CHIME.

Shi Y. (2019), *Suzhou pingtan* [Suzhou storytelling and narrative singing], Nanjing: Jiangsu fenghuang meishu chubanshe.

Sloboda, J. (1985), *The Musical Mind: The Cognitive Psychology of Music*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Small, C. (1998), *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening*, Hanover, NH: University Press of New England.

Stock, J. (2002), *Huju: Traditional Opera in Modern Shanghai*, Oxford: Oxford University Press.

Thrasher, A. (1980), *Foundations of Chinese Music: A Study of Ethics and Aesthetics*, Ann Arbor: University Microfilms International.

Turino, T. (2008), *Music as Social Life: The Politics of Participation*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Van Slyke, L. (1988), *Yangtze: Nature, History and the River*, Reading, MA: Addison-Wesley.

Wang, J. (2017), 'Global Sounds and Local Sentiments: A Survey of Improvised Music in Contemporary China', *Critical Studies in Improvisation*, 11: 1-2, pp. 1-11.

Wong, C. (2013), 'Singing Muqam in Uyghur Pop: Minority Modernity and Popular Music in China', *Popular Music and Society*, 36: 1, pp. 98-118.

Zhou X. and Tarocco, F. (2007), *Karaoke: The Global Phenomenon*, London: Reaktion.

Notes

[1] Lee, T. (2009), p. 68.
[2] Lee, T. (2009), p. 68.
[3] Capdeville-Zeng (2015), p. 79.
[4] Chan (1991), p. 23.
[5] Hamilton (2000).
[6] Chan (1991), p. 82.

[7] Lee, T. (2009), p.67.
[8] Stock (2002), p. 119.
[9] Schimmelpenninck (1997).
[10] Schimmelpenninck (1997), p. 71, 112, 294.
[11] Capdeville-Zeng (2015), p. 79. See also Chan (1991), p. 81; Schimmelpenninck (1997), p. 113.
[12] Stock (2002), p. 128.
[13] Lawson (2011), p. 100.
[14] Lawson (2011), p. 100.
[15] Marlow (2018), p. 112; Chan (1991), p. 17; Lau (2015), p. 43; Stock (2002), p. 204; Schimmelpenninck (1997), p. 98; Jones (1995), p. 126.
[16] Stock (2002), p. 173; Zhou Hong quoted in Shi (2019), p. 72.
[17] Rees (2016), p. 54.
[18] Rees (2016), p. 70.
[19] Wang (2017).
[20] Thrasher (1980), p. 85.
[21] Thrasher (1980), p. 84.
[22] Thrasher (1980), p. 29.
[23] Thrasher (1980), p. 36.
[24] Thrasher (1980), p. 127. The connection between doctrine and lived experience is, of course, highly complex. Likewise, the snapshot of a few genres and contexts I present here is not meant to impose a widely generalisable characterisation of Chinese music culture, or to imply that it is in any way homogenous. Especially important to note is that music in China (The People's Republic) is not coterminous with the Han ethnic majority I have mainly been talking about so far. Much could also be said about spontaneity and imperfection in many musical contexts of China's minority ethnic peoples (see, for example, work on Xinjiang by Harris (2004) and Wong (2013)).
[25] Stock (2002), p. 119n.
[26] Stock (2002), p. 119n.
[27] Nettl (1974), p. 9-10; Sloboda (1985); Cook (2017).
[28] Hamilton (2000), p. 171.
[29] Hamilton (2000), p. 175.
[30] Nooshin (2017), p. 221.
[31] Nooshin (2017), p. 221-222.
[32] Hamilton (2000), p. 172.
[33] Hamilton (forthcoming).
[34] Becker (1983), p. 65, 67.
[35] Born, Lewis and Straw (2017), p. 1.
[36] Becker (1983), p. 67.
[37] Becker (1983), p. 66.
[38] Nooshin (2017), p. 217.
[39] Turino (2008).
[40] Becker (1983), p. 67.
[41] Lee, J. (2009).
[42] Hamilton (forthcoming).
[43] Friedson (1996), p. xi.
[44] Hamilton (2000), p. 176.
[45] Small (1998), p. 8.
[46] Born, Lewis and Straw (2017), p. 4.
[47] Zhou and Tarocco (2007), p. 53.
[48] Online communication with the author (19 November 2014).
[49] Jones (2013), p. 29, emphasis added.
[50] Racy (2003), p. 9-10.
[51] Horlor (2019).
[52] Van Slyke (1988).
[53] Hamilton (2000), p. 176.