

## Enclosing Archival Sound: Colonial Singing as Discipline and Resistance

Erin Johnson-Williams

Conversations about decolonisation have created a lot of noise recently. As a historian of sound, it often strikes me that such dialogues also create a significant opportunity to think critically about the colonial legacies of *silence* – and the power of the archive to silence or (re)sound forms of colonial experience.<sup>1</sup> Indeed, there has been a growing tendency to interrogate the power imbalances latent in western institutional structures – from the #MeToo movement, to the rise of Black Lives Matter protests and threats of fake news, to critiques of the ways in which the pressures of digital surveillance and capitalist globalisation increasingly shape modern life. Alongside this questioning of and resistance to hierarchical structures, there is an emergent commitment to attend to voices previously silenced through the processes of archival curation, and to narratives (and forms of expression) that have traditionally been omitted from canonical discourses. Likewise, new academic readings of the imperial archive are under pressure to ‘give voice to’ those who have been systemically silenced by structural power imbalances.<sup>2</sup> Yet conversations about ‘re-sounding’ the past necessarily start with a critical interrogation of who has the institutional *ability* to archive colonial sound. From the perspectives of sound studies and, more specifically, musicology, how can colonial archives both ‘sound’ and ‘give voice to’ histories of violence and resistance, particularly when the colonial archive is arguably a ‘silencing’ structure by its very nature?

Focusing on the idea of the nineteenth-century archive as both a space and an archive of carceral ‘enclosure’,<sup>3</sup> this chapter examines how music – particularly in the form of settler colonial hymn-singing – functioned to both ‘sound’ and ‘silence’ the ambiguities of the colonial archive within spaces of disciplinary enclosure. In much existing musicological scholarship, the role of singing within institutions of settler colonial biopolitical containment – such as

Indigenous residential schools, concentration camps and prisons – has largely been archived as a strategic tool for religious conversion and/or social control.<sup>4</sup> By the same token, there has been a relatively longstanding association in historical musicology of the genre of the hymn with congregational (and stylistic) conformity, resulting in the devaluing of the hymn's potential as a form of both personal self-expression and potentially violent coercion.<sup>5</sup>

By providing a case for a 're-archiving' of nineteenth-century technologies of sonic incarceration, I suggest that the flexibility and accessibility of the nineteenth-century hymn – a genre that 'sounded' simple, beautiful, and even child-like to Victorian ears<sup>6</sup> – reinforced yet challenged the atrocities of settler colonialism. Effectively, acts of silencing, sounding and archiving thus go hand in hand: the use of English-language hymns as a form of discipline in colonial residential schools and prisons created sonic spaces for conformity while actively silencing Indigenous singing traditions. Therefore, the archiving of the hymn as a tool of imperial 'enclosure' in colonial institutions was part of a larger movement to 'silence' colonised voices, often (in the context of religious mission) through the 'sounding' of English-language hymns. To erase the colonial hymn from histories of the past would be to lose the opportunity to find moments within these histories where colonial subjects were able to sound – and, effectively, re-archive – their own experiences of oppression or resistance.<sup>7</sup>

Drawing on material relating to acts of colonial 'disciplining' in late nineteenth-century Canada and twentieth-century South Africa, I challenge Foucauldian analyses of institutional power by exploring how the biopolitics of hymn singing in spaces of colonial enclosure both reinforced and resisted the silence of the imperial archive, and, later, through Truth and Reconciliation initiatives, how new 'soundings' were made possible through the processes of decolonial re-archiving.<sup>8</sup> Hymn-singing in environments such as colonial residential schools and prisons simultaneously evaded – and yet also nuanced – a top-down 'sounding' of the archival silences that were brought about by western carceral institutions. I propose that while the violence of the colonial hymn may have been largely silenced by the archive of empire, its

enduring traces bear witness to the power of singing as a form of liberation, and ultimately, a sonic ‘re-archiving’ of imperial discipline.

### **Sound as Enclosure / Archive as Silence**

In the summer of 2021, a series of unmarked graves were uncovered in Canada. Holding the bones of hundreds of Indigenous children, this discovery generated heated discussions about the long-silenced history of Canada’s Indigenous Residential Schools (1883–1996), which have recently culminated in the Canadian government pledging \$31.5 billion to repair the system that supported these atrocities and to compensate the families of those affected.<sup>9</sup> These schools had previously been declared a site of ‘cultural genocide’ by the Canadian Truth and Reconciliation Commission (TRC),<sup>10</sup> but the sudden visibility of the graves also sparked a call within the UK to acknowledge the responsibility of the British Empire for the existence of these disciplinary spaces. On 2 July 2021, for example, an article entitled ‘The Toxic Legacy of the British Empire in Canada’s Residential Schools’ appeared in the *Guardian*, claiming that ‘[t]he destruction of Indigenous lifeways was necessary for the British corporations whose interest in timber and other natural resources drove many of the actions of crown officials in that era’, and that:

it was British money that funded much of the early missionary work that eventually became the religious institutions that would go on to bury children in unmarked graves. Maybe a little more reckoning with the UK’s own past is in order.<sup>11</sup>

This link between racial capitalism and empire sets the scene for how missionary imperialism provided a humanitarian and moral justification for institutional racism, whether the institutions were justified as pedagogical, carceral or commercial.<sup>12</sup> Within the Canadian residential schools, hundreds of children died due to unsanitary conditions and physical and sexual abuse. Those who attempted to speak or sing in their Indigenous language were severely punished.<sup>13</sup>

Indigenous Canadians have long mourned the horrific conditions at these ‘compulsory’ residential schools, where children were forcibly separated from their families by governmental authorities, yet the discovery of the mass graves has sparked new attention from the press internationally, and the resulting conversations have joined a broader dialogue about decolonisation, and how the atrocities of imperialism have been archived and made available (or not) for the public.<sup>14</sup>

The singing of English-language hymns was used within these spaces of colonial incarceration as a mandatory form of religious and pedagogical discipline. And yet archives relating to music within Canadian residential schools are almost non-existent, except to indicate that mandatory English-language hymn singing occurred at regular intervals throughout the day.<sup>15</sup> Similar archival gaps – perhaps because of an implicit ambiguity of hymn singing as an effective tool for coercion and conversion, despite the (silenced) risk that communities might use singing as a means of reformist solidarity<sup>16</sup> – occur when examining the broader presence of music in other spaces of colonial incarceration, such as prisons, military camps, and concentration camps.<sup>17</sup> At the same time, more recent Truth and Reconciliation initiatives, particularly in the contexts of Canada and South Africa that I examine here, have placed Indigenous-language singing as crucial to processing transgenerational trauma.<sup>18</sup> Taking western imperial structures of institutional ‘enclosure’ as a starting point, I propose that a re-consideration of how sound operated as a form of ‘disciplinary enclosure’ in settler colonial contexts might provide a way to start to fill the gaps left by archival silences.<sup>19</sup>

A topical, performative ‘re-sounding’ of hymn singing within Canadian residential schools appeared in 2019 in the popular Canadian Broadcasting Corporation (CBC) drama (now on Netflix) *Anne With an E*: a striking re-imagining of the beloved Edwardian novel *Anne of Green Gables*, where the themes of mental health, trauma, sexual consent, race, gender and empire are all foregrounded. The content of much of the third season, in a notable departure from the novels by L. M. Montgomery, is about power, race and consent. In episode 4 of Season 3 (aired

13 October 2019), the character of Anne's Indigenous Canadian friend Ka'kwet is forcibly removed from Avonlea to a residential school, and a powerful central scene shows the Indigenous children (who are literally locked into the school as prisoners) being forced to sing the Victorian hymn 'Praise him! Praise him, Jesus, our Blessed Redeemer'. Anne, oblivious to the coercion in the school, unsuccessfully attempts to pay a visit to Ka'kwet. As she approaches the schoolhouse, the doleful sound of children reluctantly singing the hymn resonates in the background. The nun who greets Anne at the door refuses to let her in because 'the children are in choir practice'. When Ka'kwet tries to break out of the hymn singing session by protesting in her own language, she is physically assaulted by the nun, who slaps her across the face, saying: 'speak English: your heathen tongue is forbidden. Now, sing to the Lord'.<sup>20</sup> When Ka'kwet refuses to sing a second time, the nun brings in a male priest, Father Beck, who gives her the belt because she was 'behaving like a stupid Indian'.<sup>21</sup>

Notably, the other children stop singing the hymn when the physical abuse begins. This is a telling dramatic moment in the television script because the sonic archive that it (re)creates is effectively a record of how Indigenous voices were silenced, and how the students themselves 'silenced' the English hymn by tentatively showing a mute solidarity for Ka'kwet. Because it is challenging to theorise the 'silencing' properties of the colonial musical archive, there has been relatively little space, musicologically, to explore what role music and sound played in the lives of the Indigenous school children, and it has taken a CBC/Netflix production to dramatize what a hymn-as-violent-coercion might actually have sounded like. Indeed, if hymns have been traditionally dismissed from being a 'serious' genre of musicological study *because* they still retain Victorian associations of simplicity and benevolence, then such aesthetic sidelining has also reinforced how hymns can be used as a form of (and a cover for) institutional abuse.<sup>22</sup> It is also notable that the producers of *Anne With an E* chose to have the mandatory 'choir practice' in full swing at the moment when Anne arrives. In Anne's white, Protestant experience, hymn singing is a 'noble', holy, and thus an entirely acceptable (and ostensibly compassionate) pursuit; an

apparently innocent reason for why Ka'Kwet could not be allowed visitors. Because of the veneer of hymn singing as benevolent, therefore, the sound of the hymn, at least to Anne's ears, effectively covers up the abuse happening behind locked doors. Even though Anne, in this dramatization, is a character who is extraordinarily perceptive about structures of abuse across virtually all of the other storylines, as a white settler she is effectively deaf to the silencing properties of the Protestant hymn in the context of residential schools. The presence of hymn singing in this upsetting scene, therefore, both reveals and conceals the abusive structures of Indigenous incarceration: a hymn as melodically and harmonically innocuous (to Anne's ears, at least) as 'Praise him! Praise him, Jesus, our Blessed Redeemer!' can for Ka'kwet imply a context of torture and coercion, even though to Anne, that the children are in 'choir practice' at all is 'marvellous', as 'singing is a great fortifier for the spirit'.<sup>23</sup>

One of the reasons why the residential school scene in *Anne With an E* is so powerful, and has generated discussion on the internet,<sup>24</sup> is the rarity of portrayals of how hymn singing functioned as both a tool of humanitarian benevolence as well as disciplinary violence within spaces of colonial incarceration. Anne's obliviousness to the various overlapping levels of coercion going on at the school is a jarring metaphor for the colonial archive's silencing potential, for up to this point in the drama the viewer has been primed to believe that Anne would be able to see through violent, hierarchical structures. The idea of hymn singing as wholly benevolent is therefore indelibly linked to Anne's white racial frame.

Returning, then, to the place of Canadian residential schools within recent conversations about decolonisation, perhaps the 'sounding' of an archive of enclosure is a powerful way to see the archive as a disciplinary space that *must* engage with sound because silence is at the heart of how many colonial archival spaces were created. Historians of music, however, have often struggled with how to 'sound' historical discourses about biopolitical enclosure, when music is so often virtually absent from the archives of such disciplinary spaces. How, then, can a history of incarcerated colonial music-making be 'enclosed' in the nineteenth-century archive, and

ultimately ‘disclosed’ through a decolonial hearing of archival gaps? Indeed, institutional spaces of empire, whether they be camps, prisons, or cultural institutions, all to varying degrees *enclose*, frame, and control their holdings. By implication, such institutions also have an extraordinary power to silence. Music – through its flexible parameters to both sound *and* silence an environment – is a potentially useful, if at times elusive, way to bring the material archives of nineteenth-century imperialism into dialogue with the reparative potential of decolonisation. Musical sound, at least in a nineteenth-century western construction, allegedly constituted an inherently subjective artform, but at the same time music-in-practice has been a profoundly disciplining force throughout the history of the British Empire. In this way, the lived experience of colonial singing was in one sense at odds with the textual, recorded histories of nineteenth-century art music, while also being the unheard soundtrack to the daily lives of the peoples represented in institutional holdings.<sup>25</sup>

Such tensions have been described by Beverley Diamond as the ‘doubleness of sound’ in Canadian residential schools.<sup>26</sup> Diamond claims that the presence of hymn singing in the schools ‘functioned as a mechanism of assimilation and control, but also as a form of student resistance and resilience’.<sup>27</sup> As students might refuse to sing, or use the genre of the hymn for their own subjective expression, music is therefore an ambiguous, although potentially very revealing, way to enter the nineteenth-century colonial archive. Diamond makes the case that the existing archives of Canadian residential schools provide a very limited understanding of the range of traumas that were possible with hymn singing, noting that ‘[m]ost information available about music in the schools was written for school newsletters, often by students under the close supervision of teachers and administrators. These articles presented the schools in a positive light, as if they were the equivalent of other schools across the country’.<sup>28</sup> While the transient nature of music may seem, on the surface, to be at odds with an institutional archive’s claims to permanence, the tensions of absence and presence that pervade utopian discourses about nineteenth-century western music as a civilising force and those that uphold archival spaces of

institutional enclosure stem from remarkably parallel impulses.<sup>29</sup> The same might be said of the kinds of disciplining discourses that were applied to music, sound and archival curation in colonial contexts.<sup>30</sup> Thus, the nineteenth-century archiving of empire was fundamentally in tension with Eurocentric understandings of the place of music in the world, leaving acts of colonial musical archiving to be at once implicit attempts of hierarchical control, as well as opportunities for sonic ambivalence.

Constructions of the archive as a form of silencing, as explored across the essays in this volume, are far from new. What I am interested in here is what the inverse of archival silencing would sound like – and whether the heroic assumptions about ‘re-sounding’ lost voices that many scholars adopt can in fact reinforce neo-imperial, salvationist assumptions.<sup>31</sup> An implication across a lot of recent literature on decolonisation is that the inverse of archival silencing is to create space for sound(ing)s to happen.<sup>32</sup> The next step, I suggest, is to consider critically what form(s) this might take: to state the obvious, whenever sound occurs, it has the effect of silencing what was there before, even if what was already there was actually silence (or even silent protest), which is then filled by the (sometimes non-consensual) regulation of organised sound, a technique widely used as a torture device in Guantanamo Bay.<sup>33</sup> Music, therefore, can be both a form of historical erasure and its own kind of ‘disciplinary enclosure’, as well as a vehicle of potential emancipation. Furthermore, the colonial hymn still offered the possibility of asserting and expressing group identity for its singers, creating musical spaces that are therefore difficult to ‘archive’ as strictly oppressive or liberative.

In academic discourses the idea of the archive as a disciplinary, silencing space has been explored from a variety of perspectives, although there is room for links between silence, sound and music to be forged *beyond* Foucauldian discourses of institutional archives as forms of top-down hierarchical dominance.<sup>34</sup> In approaching the idea of the ‘enclosed’ subject, Chris Waller argues that Victorian singing goes hand-in-hand with the tensions between control and resistance within many nineteenth-century carceral institutions.<sup>35</sup> As Waller reminds us, Henry Mayhew was



famously moved by hearing hymns sung at London's Pentonville prison, although, even there, the 'singing of hymns and psalms wasn't always as earnest, with some prisoners taking the rare opportunity of physical proximity to their fellow inmates to communicate', using the 'raucous noise of the hymns' to act as a cover for subversive speech.<sup>36</sup> Other prisoners would likewise 'implant their own words over those of the hymns to subvert the acoustical authority of the service'.<sup>37</sup> As a result, hymn singing in Pentonville prison was sometimes banned.<sup>38</sup> Mayhew's account is a powerful indication of the potential of the hymn to both demonstrate and resist conformity in contexts of imprisonment. By extension, in colonial contexts Kofi Agawu has shown that hymns in postcolonial practice are constantly reappropriated, and thus they are prone to be in tension with the coloniser.<sup>39</sup>

What could be helpful here would be to extend the idea of the panoptical powers of (archival) enclosure to ways of understanding the function of music in colonial institutions in light of what la paperson has termed 'technologies of indigenous erasure'.<sup>40</sup> While la paperson does not write about music, imagining the hymn as a 'technology' of Indigenous erasure fits well within a paradigm of settler colonial institutions that define themselves through performative projects of 'cultural assimilation' that reflect 'desires for a colonizer's future and, paradoxically, desires for Indigenous futures'.<sup>41</sup> Enforced hymn singing within spaces of colonial incarceration can thus be constructed as a kind of performative aspiration towards Indigenous 'erasure', although – and this is where music creates a particularly reflexive archive – I would argue that through colonial hymnic reappropriation, space may be created for resistance.<sup>42</sup> Taking on Michel-Rolph Trouillot's idea in *Silencing the Past* of how history is a form of storytelling that reflects the hierarchies of the past while replicating and reinforcing new power structures,<sup>43</sup> I suggest that the hymn within spaces of colonial biopolitical enclosure can operate within what Daniel Nemser has described as a form of relational infrastructure, where '[w]hat appears as infrastructure – what *disappears* from view – necessarily does so in relation to specific subject positions or practices'.<sup>44</sup> In Nemser's formulation, such racial infrastructures are learned, and 'the

habitual practices that congeal around them are themselves constructive of collective norms. If familiarity can generate a shared sense of belonging to a community of users, engaging with unfamiliar infrastructures can yield the unsettling sense of being out of place'.<sup>45</sup> Applying this framework to musical practice, the underlying unfamiliarity of English-language hymn singing within spaces of colonial incarceration had the potential to yield an unsettling sense of being 'out of place', while at the same time requiring conformity and offering the possibilities of collective belonging.

### **Enclosing and Disclosing the Hymn**

Effectively, the imposition of hymn singing within spaces of colonial incarceration had a double effect of presence and absence; belonging and unbelonging: what we might call a 'sounding into disappearance' of Indigenous agency.<sup>46</sup> The presence of imposed music (here, hymns) as a way to obstruct the possibility of resistance is all the more troubled in settler colonial records because historians are so often looking *to* the institutional archive to fill a sonic void. As Bryanne Young evocatively describes of her experience in conducting archival research on the Canadian residential schools, 'I continue to find more resonant significance in the effect of those documents blurring together than I do in the records themselves. Walking out of The Archives at the end of that day, into the clamor of the capital city at rush hour, I realized how deeply I had been aching for *sound*'.<sup>47</sup> Similarly, in *The Silence of the Archive*, David Thomas, Simon Fowler and Valerie Johnson claim that archival silences can also be starting points: 'certain voids in archives may also function as positive or humanly necessary spaces – tacit agreements and ellipses designed to leave unsaid or let slip away things that may be too painful, too problematic, too love-laden or too explicit to capture'.<sup>48</sup>

Archival silences, too, are reminders that institutional collections are constructed and curated by people with their own agendas and fallibilities. As Thomas et. al. continue, '[s]ources and archives are neither neutral nor natural. They are created. It is this that is the reason for so

many silences. Archival creation is, of course, a human process'.<sup>49</sup> Such tensions can also lead to what Simon Fowler has referred to as a history of 'enforced silences',<sup>50</sup> where associations between utopia and institutional incarceration run deep.<sup>51</sup> It is no coincidence that in nineteenth-century British colonial prisons, concentration camps and residential schools, hymn singing at chapel services was mandatory (a practice in line with Victorian schools, that still continues, somewhat controversially, in many British schools today),<sup>52</sup> and framed as a wholly moral pursuit.<sup>53</sup>

Becca Whitla's concept of 'hymnic coloniality'<sup>54</sup> is a useful way to navigate the kinds of sonic gaps that are left in a Foucauldian discourse of carceral biopolitical power, particularly within post/colonial contexts.<sup>55</sup> Moreover, it is worth remembering that many of the early biopolitical initiatives of 'concentration' were originally framed as so-called 'protective' measures: as Laleh Khalili notes, concentration camps, first used by the Spanish, British and US militaries in Cuba, South African and the Philippines, were 'originally conceived as mechanisms for removing the civilians from a battlefield, the entirety of the countryside, thus allowing maximum firepower to the conquering European armies'.<sup>56</sup> With regard to the Canadian context, Jennifer Graber argues that the incarceration of Indigenous subjects was framed within a series of theological justifications, and that imprisonment was thought of as a compassionate, reformatory activity, where Indigenous American inmates singing hymns was offered up as an example of benevolent incarceration.<sup>57</sup>

The colonial hymn thus functioned in these carceral contexts as an ostensibly 'protective' framing device: it silenced Indigeneity under the guise of humanitarian benevolence. Music as a means of initiating mandatory colonial 'congregation' in this way also reinforces Nemser's claim that concentration operates as 'the enabling ground for racialization'.<sup>58</sup> As Nemser elaborates, 'concentration literally emerges through the construction of a colonial "peace"'.<sup>59</sup> In this formulation, spaces of colonial enclosure, even those resulting in genocide, were framed under an imperial veneer of 'peace'. If Victorian hymn singing represented conformity and social

harmony, then it was an ideal way to ‘silence’ Indigeneity within carceral spaces: its fragmented existence in colonial archives in the form of hymn books and mandatory singing timetables therefore implies a benign and co-operative soundscape that enclosed, and curated, an ideological edifice of administrative innocence. Rather than covering up the coercive use of the hymn, then, the settler colonial archive implies a righteous belief that silencing Indigenous languages through singing English-language hymns was right, and even necessary, for the success of empire. If the archive of colonial hymnody shielded and protected carceral institutions from being culpable of musical coercion, then by extension sonic ‘disclosures’ need to come to terms with their archival omissions. A significant obstacle here is that of language: while a lot of hymns were translated into Indigenous languages by nineteenth-century British missionaries, the hymn in the context of residential schools was sung in English, necessarily reflecting what Whitla has described as an ‘(English) coloniality – the all-encompassing residual web of colonizing processes, tendencies, and practices’,<sup>60</sup> a phenomenon she refers to as ‘musicoloniality’.<sup>61</sup>

Canadian residential schools therefore created a context where Christian rituals, presented as being fulfilling and redemptive, were detrimental to the Indigenous students’ understanding of their own language and musical cultures. As Johnson notes, rituals of hymn singing in Canadian residential schools ‘embodied disciplines that functioned as technologies of power, self, and community’.<sup>62</sup> Whitla, moreover, characterises hymn singing in the residential schools as an example of ‘a cultural-genocidal project of “taking the Indian out of the child”’.<sup>63</sup> Searching for agency within this history is complex. As Diamond recounts, in examining the ‘historical record’ for the ‘multiple functions – oppressive, assimilative, or resistant – that music served within the schools’, she found that ‘[a]gency is prominent ... but includes the agency of several different players: the Canadian government, church authorities, teachers and IRS [Indian Residential Schools] administrators, and the children themselves’.<sup>64</sup>

I argue that hymn singing is a potentially flexible enough genre to create a way to explore multiple forms of resistance to colonial carceral institutions. While the teachers and

administrators would have brought their own associations of ‘hymnic coloniality’ to the residential schools, students may have engaged with Christian hymnody to varying degrees later in life, or not at all. More complex are historical moments where a hymn text or tune was composed within a context of limited agency. As Volume 1 of the 2015 Canadian TRC report noted with regard to the residential schools, ‘[i]n the classroom, Aboriginal children were given a constant drilling in English, and spent much of their time memorizing and reciting religious texts and hymns’.<sup>65</sup> The same TRC report also describes an Indigenous student, renamed Henry Budd (first taken into the residential school system in the 1820s), who wrote the text of a hymn ‘with a verse that reflected both his new language proficiency and the new attitude he had been encouraged to develop towards his own native culture’:

Oh let a vain and thoughtless race,  
Thy pardning [*sic.*] mercy prove;  
Begin betimes to seek thy face  
And thy commandments love.<sup>66</sup>

Effectively, the TRC report created a new, postcolonial archive in which materials such as hymns are given space and recontextualisation. The supervised inscription in Budd’s text of directing one’s own ‘vain and thoughtless race’ towards the ‘pardning [*sic.*] mercy’ of a benevolent Christian God is in line with the silencing structures of the older, silencing archive discussed above. The TRC report also revealed the ubiquity of hymn singing as a structural device within a carceral environment, providing the following description of how time was ordered and punctuated by hymn-singing on a daily basis. Quoting from a Methodist report given about the school at Mount Elgin in 1914:

The bell rings at 5 a.m. when the children rise, wash, dress and are made ready for breakfast. At 5:30 they breakfast; after which they all assemble in the last school-room and unite in reading the

Scriptures, singing and prayer. From 6–9 a.m. the boys are employed and taught to work on the farm, and the girls in the house. At 9, they enter their schools. At 12 they dine and spend the remaining time till one in recreation. At one they enter school, where they are taught till 3:30, after which they resume their manual employment till six. At six, they sup and again unite in reading the Scriptures, singing and prayer. In the winter season, the boys are engaged in the Evening school and girls are taught needle-work until 9, when all retire to rest. They are never left alone, but are constantly under the eye of some of those engaged in this arduous work.<sup>67</sup>

In this timetable, communal Scripture reading, singing and prayer punctuate the school day. Taking the TRC's report as an archive of how sound was manipulated to be a disciplinary tool, hymn singing plays the role of a structural device of sounding *and* silencing that is both benevolent and corrective.

### **Listening, Liberating and Re-Archiving**

Looking forward to how the legacies of nineteenth-century sonic archives have impacted more recent calls for decolonisation in the twentieth and twenty-first centuries, it is worth noting that the Canadian TRC report is relatively unique for the depth of its historical remit. In the twentieth century perhaps the most famous Truth and Reconciliation Commission was initiated in South Africa in 1995. While the South African TRC focused primarily on the twentieth-century events of Apartheid, the legacies of nineteenth-century colonial atrocities were left relatively untouched. As Dirkie Smit and Elna Mouton claim, therefore, the 'sufferings with which the Truth and Reconciliation Commission had to deal were, to a large extent, caused by the fact that the sufferings of the Anglo-Boer War had not been dealt with adequately'.<sup>68</sup> In other words, nineteenth-century archival silences are still shaping decolonial attempts to re-archive post/colonial trauma. Further, the structures of racialised carceral 'encampment' that were normalised in nineteenth-century South Africa naturally influenced the institutionalisation of racial separatism that would pervade South Africa for much of the twentieth century.<sup>69</sup>

I have examined elsewhere how the tensions between Dutch and English-language hymn singing created spaces for theological and racial negotiation in the concentration camps of the South African War (1899–1902).<sup>70</sup> In these carceral spaces, where the British set up separate camps for white (then ‘Boer’; now ‘Afrikaner’) and Black inmates, I hold that hymn singing was used as a way to establish colonial rivalry between the British and Afrikaner soldiers and civilians, and, as British missionaries were often more evangelical in spreading the genre of hymn singing to Black South Africans, the sonic vestiges of colonial concentration camp musicality largely equated Black hymn singing in South Africa with an allegiance to English, rather than Dutch, hymnic traditions.<sup>71</sup> The ways in which missionary hymns have been translated and reclaimed by Black South Africans during the Apartheid era have largely been framed as a positive narrative about Black musical agency within a context of postcolonial resistance.<sup>72</sup> Yet, drawing on Smit and Mouton’s claim that the South African TRC did not reckon with (or, effectively, provide an ‘archive of’) the nineteenth-century legacies of trauma and suffering that had created such entrenched racial cultures of separation and incarceration in the first place, the fact that Nelson Mandela sang hymns in prison as a means of expressing personal faith and solidarity for Black resistance also speaks to a silenced history of sonic incarceration and colonial hymnic appropriation that predates the Apartheid era.<sup>73</sup>

Many of the existing records of South African concentration camps reveal, firstly, that hymn singing is primarily given archival space for ‘white’ carceral subjects.<sup>74</sup> A lot of this is due to the fact that interest in the camps from within Britain was largely generated by concern over the considerable number of ‘Boer’ women and children who were starving in the camps, spawning wide press coverage about the unprecedented scale of white suffering – even if the ‘Boers’ were, like the Irish, generally regarded in Britain as a degenerate white race.<sup>75</sup> By contrast, very little coverage or military history at the time gave attention to the Black concentration camps.<sup>76</sup> In terms of available information on music in the camps, by extension, while there are numerous references to and descriptions of the prevalence (both positive and negative) of Dutch

psalm and hymn-singing within the white camps, virtually no archive exists for Black hymn singing within colonial carceral spaces.<sup>77</sup> This is a striking archival silence, considering the prevalence of hymn singing on South African mission stations throughout the nineteenth century, and the rich traditions of Black South African sacred choralism that were already pervasive during the war.<sup>78</sup>

It is compelling to think about TRC reports worldwide as a powerful form of decolonial ‘re-archiving’ of the systemic imbalances, exclusions and absences of the nineteenth-century archive.<sup>79</sup> Indeed, the growth of TRC movements since the late twentieth century provides a unique opportunity for a critical ‘listening’ to nineteenth-century archival silences as a way to generate new modes of hearing the past. In the South African TRC reports, for example, hymn singing in spaces of Apartheid imprisonment acts as a way of ‘sounding’ many of the same ambiguities of oppression and resistance that can be read into the accounts of Canadian residential schools, despite the differences in context. As Volume 3 of the South African TRC recounts, one of the witnesses who had been imprisoned, a Mr Mopeloa, told the Commission that while he was being tortured:

They said I should sing and I was singing a song “God we praise you”, and they put a hose-pipe in my mouth, they said “You are singing nonsense, why don’t you sing the Mandela song, we want to listen to that” ... I said to them, “I do not have an idea of what you are talking about, I can’t even sing those songs”. They forced me to sing and I kept on singing the hymns.<sup>80</sup>

In this account Mr Mopeloa’s torturers, who try to coerce him into performing ‘Mandela’ freedom songs, attempt to rob him of any musical agency. Instead, he resists, by continuing to sing the hymns that he wants to sing, although he has already been accused of ‘singing nonsense’. What is notable here is that the Victorian imperial construction of hymns as a ‘benevolent’ form of discipline have been effectively ‘re-archived’ and ‘re-sounded’ as Black



resistance *to* carceral space: an imperial musical structure once justified as a ‘compassionate’ way to silence Indigenous musical traditions is now reframed through the TRC archives as the very solace that helps prisoners endure their incarceration. As one TRC testimonial described the conditions on Death Row at Pretoria Maximum Security Prison, those sentenced to death were sent to the ‘Pot’, where ‘the traditional silence of Death Row was broken – with singing day and night. Singing mostly of traditional and religious hymns but sometimes of freedom songs’.<sup>81</sup> Further examples abound of protesters being shot and killed while singing hymns and protest songs.<sup>82</sup>

In the re-archiving of these accounts, I suggest that the postcolonial hymn *can* be become newly reconfigured as musical resistance once it has exited the nineteenth-century carceral framework. The fact that the ‘Black’ hymn, by the late twentieth century, was such a powerful tool for protest that it no longer ‘belonged’ to white structures of disciplinary enclosure is perhaps one explanation for why written accounts of Black hymn singing in the concentration camps of the South African War are so rare, compared to the re-archiving of the hymn as a form of Black expressive agency during and since the anti-Apartheid movement. In Canada, too, singing has been at the forefront of recent attempts at reconciliation and reparation for victims of the residential schools.<sup>83</sup> Such powerful attempts at filling archival voids with songs not only reveal the limitations of the colonial archives that have silenced or downplayed the role of singing for processing trauma, but they also speak to a powerful reframing of the Victorian hymn as a revitalising decolonial genre that, once sounded, will reshape the legacies of ‘who’ gets to speak (or sing) out against (and within) violent spaces.

The idea of the subaltern singing back against the empire is what Whitla calls the ‘flipping’ of hymns to take forms ranging from ‘a subtle act of subversion or a direct act of defiance’.<sup>84</sup> What exact forms a decolonial archiving of musical sound will take in the future remains to be seen, for in one sense to archive (or, returning to the carceral metaphor, to ‘enclose’) sound is to colonise it. Conversely, to forget, or to erase, the silencing properties of the

nineteenth-century archive from postcolonial musical experience is to obstruct the possibility of sonic liberation. To return once more to la paperson's concept of 'technologies of indigenous erasure',<sup>85</sup> it is worth considering where a decolonial fracture in the musical archives of settler colonialism can most effectively happen. In the context of the Canadian residential schools, English-language hymn singing violently erased Indigenous identity; in the South African prisons, a reappropriated and arguably decolonial form of hymn singing challenged the white prison guard's unsuccessful attempts to frame 'Mandela's' songs as a mode of performative torture. Perhaps to liberate and decolonise the sound of colonial incarceration is, ultimately, to come to terms with how many of the silences of the nineteenth-century archive are, ultimately, the loudest moments of all.

## Bibliography

- Agawu, Kofi. *Representing African Music: Postcolonial Notes, Queries, Positions*. New York and London: Routledge, 2003.
- . ‘Tonality as a Colonizing Force in Africa’. In *Audible Empire: Music, Global Politics, Critique*, edited by Ronald Radano and Tejumola Olaniyan, 334–355. Durham: Duke University Press, 2016.
- Austen, Ian. ‘How Thousands of Indigenous Children Vanished in Canada’. <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/06/07/world/canada/mass-graves-residential-schools.html>. Accessed 5 August 2021.
- BBC News. ‘Canada: 751 Unmarked Graves Found at Residential School’. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-us-canada-57592243>. Accessed 5 August 2021.
- Bracken, Amber. ‘Canada Pledges \$31.5 Billion to Settle Fight Over Indigenous Child Welfare System’. *The New York Times* (5 January 2022). <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/04/world/canada/canada-indigenous-children-settlement.html>. Accessed 13 January 2022.
- Buis, Johann S. ‘Music and Dance Make Me Feel Alive: From Mandela’s Prison Songs and Dances to Public Policy’. *Torture* 23, no. 2 (2013): 55–67.
- Burkholder, J. Peter, Donald J. Grout and Claude V. Palisca. *A History of Western Music*. New York: W. W. Norton, 2010.
- Burnett, Philip. ‘Music and Mission: A Case Study of the Anglican-Xhosa Missions of the Eastern Cape, 1854–1880’. PhD: University of Bristol, 2020.
- , Erin Johnson-Williams, and Yvonne Liao, ‘Music, Empire, Colonialism: Sounding the Archives: Introduction’. *Postcolonial Studies* (forthcoming, 2022).
- Clapp-Itnyre, Alisa. *British Hymn Books for Children, 1800–1900: Re-Tuning the History of Childhood*. Farnham: Ashgate, 2016.
- Corr, Evelyn Araluen. ‘Silence and Resistance: Aboriginal Women Working Within and Against the Archive’. *Journal of Media & Cultural Studies* 32, no. 4 (2018): 487–502.
- Cusick, Suzanne G. “‘You Are in a Place That is Out of the World...’: Music in the Detention Camps of the “Global War on Terror””. *Journal of the Society for American Music* 2, no. 1 (2008): 1–26.
- Dahlhaus, Carl. *Nineteenth-Century Music*, translated by J. Bradford Robinson. Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989.
- Danes, Richard. *Cassell’s History of the Boer War, 1899–1902*. London: Cassell, 1902.
- Dirsuweit, Teresa. ‘Carceral Spaces in South Africa: A Case Study of Institutional Power, Sexuality and Transgression in a Women’s Prison’. *Geoforum* 30, no. 1 (1999): 71–83.
- The Economist. ‘What Happened at Residential Schools for Indigenous Children in North America?’ <https://www.economist.com/the-economist-explains/2021/07/26/what-happened-at-residential-schools-for-indigenous-children-in-north-america>. Accessed 5 August 2021.
- Erlmann, Veit. ‘Africa Civilised, Africa Uncivilised’: Local Culture, World System and South African Music’. *Journal of Southern African Studies* 20, no. 2 (1994): 165–179.
- Fargion, Janet Topp. ‘African Music in the World and Traditional Music Section at the British Library Sound Archive’. *History in Africa* 31 (2004): 447–454.
- Forth, Aidan. *Barbed-Wire Imperialism: Britain’s Empire of Camps, 1876–1903*. Oakland: University of California Press, 2017.
- Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction, Vol. 1*, translated by R. Hurley. New York: Random House: 1978.
- Fourie, William. ‘Musicology and Decolonial Analysis in the Age of Brexit’. *Twentieth-Century Music* 17, no. 2 (2020): 197–211.

- Graber, Jennifer. 'Natives Need Prison: The Sanctification of Racialized Incarceration'. *Religions* 10 (2019): 1–12.
- Gray, Anne-Marie. 'Vocal Music of the Anglo-Boer War (1899–1902): Insights into Processes of Affect and Meaning in Music'. PhD: University of Pretoria, 2004.
- Grier, Tara, "'Anne With an E" Acknowledges Indigenous Residential Schools in New Episodes'. *The Whit Online* <https://thewhitonline.com/2019/10/arts-entertainment/anne-with-an-e-acknowledges-indigenous-residential-schools-in-new-episodes/>. Accessed 18 August 2019.
- Golding, Rosemary. "'Appeasing the Unstrung Mental Faculties": Listening to Music in Nineteenth-Century Lunatic Asylums'. *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 17, no. 3 (2020): 403–425.
- Hanson, Eric, Daniel P. Games, and Alexa Manuel. 'The Residential School System'. *Indigenous Foundations* <https://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/residential-school-system-2020/>. Accessed 17 August 2021.
- Hartman, Saidyia. *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-Making in Nineteenth-Century America*. New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997.
- \_\_\_\_\_. 'Venus in Two Acts'. *Small Axe* 26 (2008): 1–14.
- 'A Hope of Meeting you in Another World'. *Anne With an E*, Season 3, Episode 4, CBC Television, 13 October 2019. *Netflix*, <https://www.netflix.com/search?q=anne%20with%20an%20e&jbv=80136311>. Accessed 18 August 2021.
- Howell Alison, and Melanie Richter-Montpetit. 'Racism in Foucauldian Security Studies: Biopolitics, Liberal War, and the Whitewashing of Colonial and Racial Violence'. *International Political Sociology* 13 (2019): 2–19.
- Ingalls, Monique, Carolyn Landau, and Tom Wagner (eds). *Christian Congregational Music: Performance, Identity and Experience*. London: Routledge, 2013.
- Johnson, Sarah Kathleen. 'On Our Knees: Christian Ritual in Residential Schools and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada'. *Studies in Religion* 47. 1 (2019): 3–24.
- Johnson-Williams, Erin. 'Singing, Suffering and Liberation in the Concentration Camps of the South African War'. In *The Oxford Handbook of Community Singing*, edited by Esther Morgan-Ellis and Kay Norton. Forthcoming, Oxford University Press, 2022.
- Jolaosho, Omoyato. 'Singing Politics: Freedom Songs and Collective Protest in Post-Apartheid South Africa'. *African Studies Review* 62, no. 2 (2019): 6–29.
- Khalili, Laleh. *Time in Shadows: Confinement in Counterinsurgencies*. Stanford: Stanford University Press.
- Krog, Antjie, and Nosisi Mpolweni. 'Archived Voices: Refiguring Three Women's Testimonies Delivered to the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission'. *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature* 28, no. 2 (2009): 357–374.
- Lange, Britta. 'Archival Silences as Historical Silences'. *SoundEffects* 7, no. 3 (2017): 47–60.
- Levitz, Tamara. 'The Musicological Elite'. *Current Musicology* 102 (2018): 9–80.
- Luxen, Micah. 'Survivors of Canada's "Cultural Genocide" Still Healing'. <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/magazine-33001425>. Accessed 17 August 2021.
- Mackinlay, Elizabeth. 'Decolonization and Applied Ethnomusicology: "Story-ing" the Personal-Political-Possible in Our Work'. In *The Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology*, edited by Svanibor Pettan and Jeff Todd Titon, DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199351701.013.14. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015.
- Maddox, Alan. 'On the Machinery of Moral Improvement: Music and Prison Reform in the Penal Colony on Norfolk Island'. *Musicology Australia* 34, no. 2 (2012): 185–205.
- Malisa, Mark, and Nandipha Malange. 'Songs for Freedom: Music and the Struggle Against Apartheid'. In *The Routledge History of Social Protest in Popular Music*, edited by Jonathan C. Friedman, 304–318. New York: Routledge, 2013.

- Mall, Andrew, Jeffers Engelhardt, and Monique Ingalls (eds). *Studying Congregational Music: Key Issues, Methods, and Theoretical Perspectives*. London: Routledge, 2021.
- McGuire, Charles. *Music and Victorian Philanthropy: The Tonic Sol-fa Movement*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
- . ‘Christianity, Civilization and Music: Nineteenth-Century British Missionaries and the Control of Malagasy Hymnology’. In *Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain*, edited by Martin Clarke, 79–96. Burlington: Ashgate, 2012.
- Mouton, Elna, and Dirkie Smit. ‘Shared Stories for the Future? Theological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa’. *Journal of Reformed Theology* 2 (2008): 40–62.
- Mühlhahn, Klaus. ‘The Concentration Camp in Global Historical Perspective’. *History Compass* 8, no. 6 (2010): 543–561.
- Nasson, Bill. *Abraham Esau’s War: A Black South African War in the Cape, 1899–1902*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.
- Nemser, Daniel. *Infrastructures of Race: Concentration and Biopolitics in Colonial Mexico*. University of Texas Press, 2017.
- Newton, Paula. ‘More Unmarked Graves Discovered in British Columbia’. <https://edition.cnn.com/2021/07/13/americas/canada-unmarked-indigenous-graves/index.html>. Accessed 5 August 2021.
- Olwage, Grant. ‘Scriptions of the Choral: The Historiography of Black South African Choralism’. *SAMUS: South African Journal of Musicology* 22, no. 1 (2002): 29–45.
- . ‘Discipline and Choralism: The Birth of Musical Colonialism’. In *Music, Power, and Politics*, edited by Annie J. Randall, 24–46. London: Routledge, 2004.
- . ‘John Knox Bokwe, Colonial Composer: Tales about Race and Music’. *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131 (2006): 1–37.
- la paperson. *A Third University is Possible*. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2017.
- Porter, Andrew. ‘“Cultural Imperialism” and Protestant Missionary Enterprise, 1780–1914’. *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 25, no. 3 (1997): 367–391.
- Radano, Ronald, and Tejumola Olaniyan (eds). *Audible Empire: Music, Global Politics, Critique*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2016.
- Rademaker, Laura. *Found in Translation: Many Meanings on a North Australian Mission*. Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2018.
- Raengo, Alessandra and Lauren McLeod Cramer. ‘The Unruly Archives of Black Music Videos’. *Journal of Cinema and Media Studies* 59, no. 2 (2020): 138–144.
- Reddie, Amala. ‘Anne With An E: A Reflection on Representation’. <https://cambridgeeditors.wordpress.com/2020/09/04/anne-with-an-e-a-reflection-on-representation/>. Accessed 18 August 2021.
- Richards, Jeffrey. *Imperialism and Music: Britain, 1876–1953*. Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2017.
- Rogers, Helen. ‘Singing at Yarmouth Gaol: Christian Instruction and Inmate Culture in the Nineteenth Century’. *Prison Service Journal* 199 (2011): 35–43.
- Scull, Andrew (ed). *The Asylum as Utopia: W. A. F. Browne and the Mid-Nineteenth Century Consolidation of Psychiatry*. London: Routledge, 1991.
- Sharpe, Christina. *In the Wake: On Blackness and Being*. Durham: Duke University Press, 2016.
- Schroeder, Janice. ‘Inside Voice: Talk, Silence, and Resistance in the Victorian Prison’. *Victorian Review* 46, no. 1 (2020): 9–13.
- Smith, Van Wyk. ‘The Boers and the Anglo-Boer War (1899–1902) in the Twentieth-Century Moral Imaginary’. *Victorian Literature and Culture* 31, no. 2 (2003): 429–446.
- Steedman, Carolyn. *Dust: The Archive and Cultural History*. New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2002.
- . ‘After the Archive’. *Comparative Critical Studies* 8, no. 2–3 (2011): 321–340.

- Stirrup, David, and James Mackey. 'The Toxic Legacy of the British Empire in Canada's Residential Schools'. <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jul/02/the-toxic-legacy-of-the-british-empire-in-canadas-residential-schools>. Accessed 17 August 2021.
- Stoler, Ann Laura. *Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense*. Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2009.
- Taruskin, Richard. *The Oxford History of Western Music*, 5 vols. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005.
- Thomas, David, Simon Fowler, and Valerie Johnson (eds). *The Silence of the Archive*. Chicago: Neal-Schuman, 2017.
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission. *Canada's Residential Schools: The History, Part 1: Origins to 1939, Volume 1*. Montreal, Kingston, London and Chicago: Published for the Truth and Reconciliation Commission by McGill-Queen's University Press, 2015.
- Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa. *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report Volumes 1–7* (1998). <https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/>.
- Viney, William. 'T. S. Eliot and the Textualities of the Discarded'. *Textual Practice* 28, no. 6 (2014): 1057–1075.
- Waller, Chris. "'Darker Than the Dungeon': Music, Ambivalence, and the Carceral Subject". *International Journal of the Semiotics of Law* 31 (2018): 275–299.
- Warwick, Peter. *Black People and the South African War, 1899–1902*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Whitla, Becca. *Liberation, (De)Coloniality, and Liturgical Practices: Flipping the Song Bird*. Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020.
- Woolcock Nicola, and Kaya Burgess. 'Don't Sing Hymns That are Too Preachy, Church of England Schools Told'. <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/dont-sing-hymns-that-are-too-preachy-church-of-england-schools-told-h6b6f69b3>. Accessed 18 August 2021.
- Young, Bryanne. 'Killing the Indian in the Child: Materialities of Death and Political Formations of Life in the Canadian Indian Residential School System'. PhD: University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2017.

---

Research for this chapter is a part of a larger project funded by a Leverhulme Early Career Fellowship grant. Special thanks must go to my co-editor Rachel Bryant Davies, for such thoughtful support as my ideas for this piece developed. Bennett Zon, Tim Barringer and Kamala Schelling also provided writing feedback on earlier drafts.

<sup>1</sup> The impulse in musicology to focus on what has been *sounded* and *written about*, rather than what has been *silenced* and *not written about*, is of course understandable, but perhaps it goes part of the way to explaining why historical musicology (as opposed to ethnomusicology) has been relatively slow to engage with decolonial conversations. Coming to terms with what has been silenced also directly challenges the all-too-often-nostalgic 'sounding' of much-loved musical repertoires, creating what William Fourie has referred to as a 'cultural amnesia' in Britain and in British musicology about the existence of the empire. See William Fourie, 'Musicology and Decolonial Analysis in the Age of Brexit', *Twentieth-Century Music* 17, 2 (2020): 197–211. Relatedly, on the institutional barriers to decolonisation in musicological institutions in North America, see Tamara Levitz, 'The Musicological Elite', *Current Musicology* 102 (2018): 9–80.

<sup>2</sup> The growing academic literature that addresses the systemic effect of 'archival silencing' includes, but is not limited to: Saidyia Hartman, 'Venus in Two Acts', *Small Axe* 26 (2008): 1–14; and *Scenes of Subjection: Terror, Slavery, and Self-Making in Nineteenth-Century America* (New York and Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1997); Christina Sharpe, *In the Wake: On Blackness and Being* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2016); David Thomas, Simon Fowler, and Valerie Johnson (eds), *The Silence of the Archive* (Chicago: Neal-Schuman, 2017); Evelyn Araluen Corr, 'Silence and Resistance: Aboriginal Women Working Within and Against the Archive', *Journal of Media & Cultural Studies* 32, 4 (2018): 487–502; Carolyn Steedman, *Dust: The Archive and Cultural History* (New Brunswick: Rutgers University Press, 2002); and 'After the Archive', *Comparative Critical Studies* 8, 2–3 (2011): 321–340; and Ann Laura Stoler, *Along the Archival Grain: Epistemic Anxieties and Colonial Common Sense* (Princeton and Oxford: Princeton University Press, 2009).

<sup>3</sup> I understand the concept of 'enclosure' to refer to both incarceration and salvationist, paternalistic discourses of imperialism that saw the carceral institution as not just disciplinary but 'humanitarian' and 'benevolent' as well.



Aidan Forth has compellingly drawn parallels between the so-called ‘humanitarian’ justifications for the concentration camps that the British set up during the South African War and broader rationalisations for carceral enclosure as part of an ethical, liberal humanitarianism. See Aidan Forth, *Barbed-Wire Imperialism: Britain’s Empire of Camps, 1876–1903* (Oakland: University of California Press, 2017).

<sup>4</sup> On the British colonial hymn as a tool for conversion and control, see Charles McGuire, ‘Christianity, Civilization and Music: Nineteenth-Century British Missionaries and the Control of Malagasy Hymnology’, in Martin Clarke (ed), *Music and Theology in Nineteenth-Century Britain* (Burlington: Ashgate, 2012), pp. 79–96; Grant Olwage, ‘Scriptures of the Choral: The Historiography of Black South African Choralism’, *SAMUS: South African Journal of Musicology* 22. 1 (2002): 29–45; and ‘Discipline and Choralism: The Birth of Musical Colonialism’, in Annie J. Randall (ed), *Music, Power, and Politics* (London: Routledge, 2004), pp. 25–46.

<sup>5</sup> Musicology is increasingly making room for empire and postcolonialism: see, for example, Jeffrey Richards, *Imperialism and Music: Britain, 1876–1953* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2017); and Ronald Radano and Tejumola Olaniyan (eds), *Audible Empire: Music, Global Politics, Critique* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2016). Studies of the hymn as a signifier of cultural and stylistic ideology are very recent but are gradually gaining traction; see, for example, Kofi Agawu, ‘Tonality as a Colonizing Force in Africa’, in Ronald Radano and Tejumola Olaniyan (eds), *Audible Empire: Music, Global Politics, Critique* (Durham: Duke University Press, 2016), pp. 334–355; *Representing African Music: Postcolonial Notes, Queries, Positions* (New York and London: Routledge, 2003); Becca Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality, and Liturgical Practices: Flipping the Song Bird* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2020); and Laura Rademaker, *Found in Translation: Many Meanings on a North Australian Mission* (Honolulu: University of Hawai’i Press, 2018).

<sup>6</sup> On the strong associations in nineteenth-century Britain between hymns and children (and by extension, the children of empire), see Alisa Clapp-Itnyre, *British Hymn Books for Children, 1800–1900: Re-Tuning the History of Childhood* (Farnham: Ashgate, 2016).

<sup>7</sup> The potential for hymn singing to express and enact postcolonial liberation has recently been explored by Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality*.

<sup>8</sup> Michel Foucault most famously discussed the concept of biopower, or the ‘administration of life’, in *The History of Sexuality: An Introduction, Vol. 1*, translated by R. Hurley (New York: Random House: 1978). In bringing Foucault’s Eurocentric discussions of biopolitical enclosure into dialogue with post/colonial contexts, where I expand the notion of ‘the human’ to one that was heavily racialised in nineteenth-century carceral spaces, I have drawn heavily upon Alison Howell and Melanie Richter-Montpetit, ‘Racism in Foucauldian Security Studies: Biopolitics, Liberal War, and the Whitewashing of Colonial and Racial Violence’, *International Political Sociology* 13 (2019): 2–19.

<sup>9</sup> Amber Bracken, ‘Canada Pledges \$31.5 Billion to Settle Fight Over Indigenous Child Welfare System’, *The New York Times* (5 January 2022), <https://www.nytimes.com/2022/01/04/world/canada/canada-indigenous-children-settlement.html>, accessed 13 January 2022.

<sup>10</sup> See Sarah Kathleen Johnson, ‘On Our Knees: Christian Ritual in Residential Schools and the Truth and Reconciliation Commission of Canada’, *Studies in Religion* 47. 1 (2019), p. 5.

<sup>11</sup> David Stirrup and James Mackey, ‘The Toxic Legacy of the British Empire in Canada’s Residential Schools’, <https://www.theguardian.com/world/2021/jul/02/the-toxic-legacy-of-the-british-empire-in-canadas-residential-schools>, accessed 17 August 2021. See also BBC News, ‘Canada: 751 Unmarked Graves Found at Residential School’, <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/world-us-canada-57592243>, accessed 5 August 2021; The Economist, ‘What Happened at Residential Schools for Indigenous Children in North America?’, <https://www.economist.com/the-economist-explains/2021/07/26/what-happened-at-residential-schools-for-indigenous-children-in-north-america>, accessed 5 August 2021; Paula Newton, ‘More Unmarked Graves Discovered in British Columbia’, <https://edition.cnn.com/2021/07/13/americas/canada-unmarked-indigenous-graves/index.html>, accessed 5 August 2021; and Ian Austen, ‘How Thousands of Indigenous Children Vanished in Canada’, <https://www.nytimes.com/2021/06/07/world/canada/mass-graves-residential-schools.html>, accessed 5 August 2021. References to spaces of colonial incarceration are also made in the chapters by Roisín Laing and Jemima Short in this volume.

<sup>12</sup> See Andrew Porter, ‘“Cultural Imperialism” and Protestant Missionary Enterprise, 1780–1914’, *The Journal of Imperial and Commonwealth History* 25. 3 (1997): 367–391.

<sup>13</sup> BBC News, ‘Canada: 751 Unmarked Graves’.

<sup>14</sup> See Eric Hanson, Daniel P. Games, and Alexa Manuel, ‘The Residential School System’, *Indigenous Foundations* <https://indigenousfoundations.arts.ubc.ca/residential-school-system-2020/>, accessed 17 August 2021.

<sup>15</sup> As quoted in Truth and Reconciliation Commission, *Canada’s Residential Schools: The History, Part 1: Origins to 1939, Volume 1* (Montreal, Kingston, London and Chicago: Published for the Truth and Reconciliation Commission by McGill-Queen’s University Press, 2015), p. 79.

<sup>16</sup> For example, singing as a form of communal solidarity has been well-documented with regard to Victorian mass choral movements: see Charles McGuire, *Music and Victorian Philanthropy: The Tonic Sol-fa Movement* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009). On the communal protest singing of the anti-Apartheid movement, see Omoyato Jolaosho, ‘Singing Politics: Freedom Songs and Collective Protest in Post-Apartheid South Africa’, *African Studies Review* 62. 2 (2019): 6–29. See also Mark Malisa and Nandipha Malange, ‘Songs for Freedom: Music and the

Struggle Against Apartheid', in Jonathan C. Friedman (ed), *The Routledge History of Social Protest in Popular Music* (New York: Routledge, 2013), pp. 304–318.

<sup>17</sup> See Erin Johnson-Williams, 'Singing, Suffering and Liberation in the Concentration Camps of the South African War', in Esther Morgan-Ellis and Kay Norton (eds), *The Oxford Handbook of Community Singing* (forthcoming, Oxford University Press, 2022).

<sup>18</sup> For example, singing has been a fundamental tool for trauma recovery in initiatives to help former students of the Canadian residential schools process their experiences. In a poignant 2015 BBC video on the Canadian victims, a former student ended his interview by singing a First Nations song in his Indigenous language, as a symbol of moving forward. See Micah Luxen, 'Survivors of Canada's "Cultural Genocide" Still Healing', <https://www.bbc.co.uk/news/magazine-33001425>, accessed 17 August 2021. On the South African context, see Omotayo Jolaosho, 'Political Aesthetics and Embodiment: Sung Protest in Post-Apartheid South Africa', *Journal of Material Culture* 20. 4 (2015): 443–458.

<sup>19</sup> On the tensions between music, race and archival silences see Janet Topp Fargion, 'African Music in the World and Traditional Music Section at the British Library Sound Archive', *History in Africa* 31 (2004): 447–454; and Alessandra Raengo and Lauren McLeod Cramer, 'The Unruly Archives of Black Music Videos', *Journal of Cinema and Media Studies* 59. 2 (2020): 138–144. See also Thomas et al, *Silence of the Archive*, p. 5–6.

<sup>20</sup> 'A Hope of Meeting you in Another World', *Anne With an E*, Season 3, Episode 4, CBC Television, 13 October 2019. Netflix, <https://www.netflix.com/search?q=anne%20with%20an%20e&jbv=80136311>, accessed 18 August 2021.

<sup>21</sup> Ibid.

<sup>22</sup> It is worth noting that while hymns have received sustained coverage in scholarship on theology and congregational worship music, including topics of de/colonisation, there has yet to be a sustained incorporation of colonial hymns in the discipline of 'historical musicology', where they could be studied alongside genres such as symphonies, string quartets, and operas; there is also room for the congregational studies scholarship to engage more specifically with historical legacies of contemporary traditions. For example, hymnody as a practice is virtually absent (as is empire and colonialism) from the landmark 'music history' textbooks such as Richard Taruskin, *The Oxford History of Western Music*, 5 vols. (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2005); and J. Peter Burkholder, Donald J. Grout and Claude V. Palisca, *A History of Western Music* (New York: W. W. Norton, 2010). For key concepts in hymnody and congregational music studies, see the essays in Monique Ingalls, Carolyn Landau and Tom Wagner (eds), *Christian Congregational Music: Performance, Identity and Experience* (London: Routledge, 2013); and Andrew Mall, Jeffers Engelhardt and Monique Ingalls (eds), *Studying Congregational Music: Key Issues, Methods, and Theoretical Perspectives* (London: Routledge, 2021).

<sup>23</sup> 'A Hope of Meeting you in Another World'.

<sup>24</sup> See, for example, Tara Grier, "'Anne With an E" Acknowledges Indigenous Residential Schools in New Episodes', *The Whit Online* <https://thewhitonline.com/2019/10/arts-entertainment/anne-with-an-e-acknowledges-indigenous-residential-schools-in-new-episodes/>, accessed 18 August 2019; and Amala Reddie, 'Anne With An E: A Reflection on Representation', <https://cambridgeeditors.wordpress.com/2020/09/04/anne-with-an-e-a-reflection-on-representation/>, accessed 18 August 2021.

<sup>25</sup> As the famous twentieth-century musicologist Carl Dahlhaus noted, a 'neglect of the text' was at the cornerstone of western Romantic musical aesthetics during the nineteenth century, which had devastating consequences for the historiography of vocal traditions, because the assumption was that 'great' music was without text. As a consequence, historical musicology is still catching up in terms of writing a history of nineteenth-century sung traditions. Carl Dahlhaus, *Nineteenth-Century Music*, translated by J. Bradford Robinson (Berkeley: University of California Press, 1989), p. 5. By implication, this 'neglect of text' also led to an internalised assumption that the 'greatness' of western art music could not really be archived (despite the rise in the nineteenth century of a fetishisation of the printed score).

<sup>26</sup> Beverley Diamond, 'The Doubleness of Sound in Canada's Indian Residential Schools', in Victoria Lindsay Levine and Philip V. Bohlman (eds), *This Thing Called Music: Essays in Honor of Bruno Nettl* (Lanham: Rowman & Littlefield, 2015), pp. 267–279.

<sup>27</sup> Ibid., p. 267.

<sup>28</sup> Ibid., p. 272.

<sup>29</sup> For further reading, particularly on the point of music as a form of civilisation in colonial contexts, see Veit Erlmann, 'Africa Civilised, Africa Uncivilised': Local Culture, World System and South African Music', *Journal of Southern African Studies* 20. 2 (1994): 165–179.

<sup>30</sup> See Philip Burnett, Erin Johnson-Williams, and Yvonne Liao, 'Music, Empire, Colonialism: Sounding the Archives: Introduction', *Postcolonial Studies* (forthcoming, 2022).

<sup>31</sup> I am referring here to what Saidiya Hartman has called the 'romance' of trying to construct resurrected narratives of resistance from marginalised voices: Hartman, 'Venus in Two Acts', p. 9.

<sup>32</sup> This trend has certainly taken off more in ethnomusicology than in historical musicology, and the integration of conversations about decolonisation between these two subdisciplines is certainly a pressing issue. For calls towards decolonial 'soundings' in ethnomusicology, see Elizabeth Mackinlay, 'Decolonization and Applied Ethnomusicology: "Story-ing" the Personal-Political-Possible in Our Work', in Svanibor Pettan and Jeff Todd Titon



(eds), *Oxford Handbook of Applied Ethnomusicology* (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2015): DOI: 10.1093/oxfordhb/9780199351701.013.14.

<sup>33</sup> See Suzanne G. Cusick, “‘You Are in a Place That is Out of the World...’: Music in the Detention Camps of the ‘Global War on Terror’”, *Journal of the Society for American Music* 2. 1 (2008): 1–26.

<sup>34</sup> For further reading see Britta Lange, ‘Archival Silences as Historical Silences’, *SoundEffects* 7. 3 (2017): 47–60.

<sup>35</sup> Chris Waller, “‘Darker Than the Dungeon’: Music, Ambivalence, and the Carceral Subject”, *International Journal of the Semiotics of Law* 31 (2018): 275–299.

<sup>36</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 281.

<sup>37</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>38</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>39</sup> Agawu, ‘Tonality as a Colonizing Force’, pp. 334–355.

<sup>40</sup> la paperson, *A Third University is Possible* (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 2017), p. 11.

<sup>41</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 11, xiii.

<sup>42</sup> See Grant Olwage, ‘John Knox Bokwe, Colonial Composer: Tales about Race and Music’, *Journal of the Royal Musical Association* 131 (2006): 1–37.

<sup>43</sup> Michel-Rolph Trouillot, *Silencing the Past: Power and the Production of History* (Boston: Beacon, 1995).

<sup>44</sup> Daniel Nemser, *Infrastructures of Race: Concentration and Biopolitics in Colonial Mexico* (University of Texas Press, 2017), p. 17. Emphasis original.

<sup>45</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>46</sup> I have used ‘sounding into disappearance’ here in relation to the phrase ‘writing into disappearance’, which has been used by Bryanne Young, ‘Killing the Indian in the Child: Materialities of Death and Political Formations of Life in the Canadian Indian Residential School System’, (PhD: University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill, 2017), p. iv. Another scholar who uses the phrase ‘writing into disappearance’ is William Viney, ‘T. S. Eliot and the Textualities of the Discarded’, *Textual Practice* 28. 6 (2014), p. 1071.

<sup>47</sup> Young, ‘Killing the Indian’, p. 32. Emphasis original.

<sup>48</sup> Thomas et al., *Silence of the Archive*, p. xvi.

<sup>49</sup> *Ibid.*, pp. 1–2.

<sup>50</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>51</sup> See Andrew Scull (ed), *The Asylum as Utopia: W. A. F. Browne and the Mid-Nineteenth Century Consolidation of Psychiatry* (London: Routledge, 1991).

<sup>52</sup> The singing of hymns in Church of England schools in Britain today has received criticism and backlash, reflecting controversies over religious tradition versus secularism. See, for example, Nicola Woolcock and Kaya Burgess, ‘Don’t Sing Hymns That are Too Preachy, Church of England Schools Told’, <https://www.thetimes.co.uk/article/dont-sing-hymns-that-are-too-preachy-church-of-england-schools-told-h6b6f69b3>, accessed 18 August 2021.

<sup>53</sup> Relatedly, see Rosemary Golding, “‘Appeasing the Unstrung Mental Faculties’: Listening to Music in Nineteenth-Century Lunatic Asylums”, *Nineteenth-Century Music Review* 17. 3 (2020): 403–425. See also Alan Maddox, ‘On the Machinery of Moral Improvement: Music and Prison Reform in the Penal Colony on Norfolk Island’, *Musicology Australia* 34. 2 (2012): 185–205; Helen Rogers, ‘Singing at Yarmouth Gaol: Christian Instruction and Inmate Culture in the Nineteenth Century’, *Prison Service Journal* 199 (2011): 35–43; and Janice Schroeder, ‘Inside Voice: Talk, Silence, and Resistance in the Victorian Prison’, *Victorian Review* 46. 1 (2020): 9–13.

<sup>54</sup> On ‘hymnic coloniality’, see Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality*, pp. 94–110.

<sup>55</sup> A useful example here, although it does not focus on music, is Teresa Dirsuweit, ‘Carceral Spaces in South Africa: A Case Study of Institutional Power, Sexuality and Transgression in a Women’s Prison’, *Geoforum* 30. 1 (1999): 71–83.

<sup>56</sup> Laleh Khalili, *Time in Shadows: Confinement in Counterinsurgencies* (Stanford: Stanford University Press), p. 174. See also Klaus Mühlhahn, ‘The Concentration Camp in Global Historical Perspective’, *History Compass* 8. 6 (2010): 543–561.

<sup>57</sup> Jennifer Graber, ‘Natives Need Prison: The Sanctification of Racialized Incarceration’, *Religions* 10 (2019), p. 3.

<sup>58</sup> Nemser, *Infrastructures of Race*, p. 168.

<sup>59</sup> *Ibid.*

<sup>60</sup> Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality*, p. 79.

<sup>61</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 80.

<sup>62</sup> Johnson, ‘On Our Knees’, p. 3.

<sup>63</sup> Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality*, p. 118.

<sup>64</sup> Diamond, ‘Doubleness of Sound’, p. 270.

<sup>65</sup> Truth and Reconciliation Commission, *Canada’s Residential Schools*, p. 86.

<sup>66</sup> A hymn text written by an Indigenous student in a Canadian Residential School. As quoted in Truth and Reconciliation Commission, *Canada’s Residential Schools*, p. 86.

<sup>67</sup> *Ibid.*, p. 79.

<sup>68</sup> Dirkie Smit and Elna Mouton, ‘Shared Stories for the Future? Theological Reflections on Truth and Reconciliation in South Africa’, *Journal of Reformed Theology* 2 (2008), p. 41.

---

<sup>69</sup> Ibid.

<sup>70</sup> Johnson-Williams, 'Singing, Suffering and Liberation'.

<sup>71</sup> Ibid.

<sup>72</sup> See Omoyato, 'Singing Politics', pp. 6–29.

<sup>73</sup> Smit and Mouton, 'Shared Stories', 41. See also Johann S. Buis, 'Music and Dance Make Me Feel Alive: From Mandela's Prison Songs and Dances to Public Policy', *Torture* 23. 2 (2013): 55–67.

<sup>74</sup> For example, see the focus on white subjects in Anne-Marie Gray, 'Vocal Music of the Anglo-Boer War (1899–1902): Insights into Processes of Affect and Meaning in Music' (PhD: University of Pretoria, 2004).

<sup>75</sup> See Van Wyk Smith, 'The Boers and the Anglo-Boer War (1899–1902) in the Twentieth-Century Moral Imaginary', *Victorian Literature and Culture* 31. 2 (2003): 429–446.

<sup>76</sup> See, for example, the lack of archiving of Black experience in histories compiled at the time, such as Richard Danes, *Cassell's History of the Boer War, 1899–1902* (London: Cassell, 1902).

<sup>77</sup> Even in the subsequent rise of scholarship on Black experience and the war, music is notably absent: see, for example, Peter Warwick, *Black People and the South African War, 1899–1902* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983); and Bill Nasson, *Abraham Esau's War: A Black South African War in the Cape, 1899–1902* (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991).

<sup>78</sup> On Black choralism in South Africa, see Olwage, 'Scriptions of the Choral', pp. 29–45. On hymns and South African mission stations see Philip Burnett, 'Music and Mission: A Case Study of the Anglican-Xhosa Missions of the Eastern Cape, 1854–1880' (PhD: University of Bristol, 2020).

<sup>79</sup> For further reading, see Antjie Krog and Nosisi Mpolweni, 'Archived Voices: Refiguring Three Women's Testimonies Delivered to the South African Truth and Reconciliation Commission', *Tulsa Studies in Women's Literature* 28. 2 (2009): 357–374.

<sup>80</sup> Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa, *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report Volume 3* (1998), <https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume%203.pdf>, p. 619.

<sup>81</sup> Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa, *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report Volume 4* (1998), <https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/Volume%204.pdf>, p. 214.

<sup>82</sup> See Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa, *Truth and Reconciliation Commission of South Africa Report Volume 7* (1998), [https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/victims\\_10to300\\_vol7.pdf](https://www.justice.gov.za/trc/report/finalreport/victims_10to300_vol7.pdf).

<sup>83</sup> Luxen, 'Survivors of Canada's "Cultural Genocide"'.

<sup>84</sup> Whitla, *Liberation, (De)Coloniality*, p. 126.

<sup>85</sup> la paperson, *A Third University*, p. 11.