RESPECT AND RESPONSIBILITY: TEACHING CITIZENSHIP IN SOUTH AFRICAN HIGH SCHOOLS

"It's respect for yourself, respect for others, respect for other people's property, respect for your school." Principal, in a Cape Town high school.

"If the school has a laissez faire attitude in terms of education, they're not going to meet the objective of creating a good citizen. If there's firmness, if there's a rigid discipline, if there's sensitising learners to good discipline, to respect for elders, respect for the community, respect for property, then they can mould the citizen that we want. If the school is defunct of those values then you cannot create the society." Teacher, in a Pietermaritzburg high school.

1. Introduction

Like any rich concept, 'respect' is a term with many meanings and many uses. We can see this in dictionary definitions and common usages that invoke ideas of admiration, regard for feelings, or recognition. The importance of respect is also highlighted in public discussions about social problems; we are frequently told it is important to respect difference, the environment, social norms, and myriad other issues and objects. Respect is regarded as a necessary for the smooth functioning of government and societies; public deliberation and consultation, for instance, are predicated on a respect for different opinions. Finally, respect for self and others is heralded as foundational for democracy; it is a precondition for the ways we interact as members of a community and a polity. Clearly, the term is complex, and its meaning in any given setting may be difficult to elucidate. Yet the variety of emotions, ways of being,

and outlooks invoked with 'respect' are part of its power as a stance and as a rhetorical device.

One reason the invocation of respect is so compelling, so meaningful, and so laden with power is that the concept draws people into relations: there is always a subject and an object of respect. Furthermore, the relations of respect are understood as reciprocal and mutual: we cannot respect others if we do not respect ourselves, but it is hard to respect ourselves if others do not respect us. Policies and practices that show disdain or disrespect for people can damage self-respect and disempower them, whereas individuals with a sense of self-respect and respect for others can be potent forces for change and fighting injustice (Dillon, 2009). In this way, respect is both a marker of citizenship and a tool in struggles for it.

Not surprisingly, perhaps, respect is often a key concern with regard to youth. It is something to instil, such that youth learn how to behave in society, to relate with other people and with institutions, and to appreciate the moral value and personhood of others. Respect, then, should be a value held by nascent community members and should link them together as citizens. But respect is also a tool for discipline and social reproduction in that it links people in particular ways. That particularity is conditioned by context and by visions of what good societies and good citizens should be.

Our concern in this paper is with the ways in which educators in South Africa mobilize notions of respect in their understanding of citizenship and in their daily practices of citizenship education. South Africa's education sector is heralded as a

crucible within which the new nation is to be forged and democratic values and ideals entrenched, including the extension of citizenship, dignity and respect to all South Africans. Yet as we demonstrate, these ideals are modified, contested and challenged by the practices, resources, experiences and knowledge brought into the classroom by educators and learners (cf. Jansen 2009).

In South Africa, respect is a core value of the Constitution and of the nation-building project, but its perceived absence is a central concern of politicians, educators and community leaders. The reciprocal, almost chicken-and-egg nature of respect makes it difficult to instil respect unless it already exists to some degree. Compounding the problems in creating a respect-ful nation is that policymakers and educators often exercise authority in ways that run counter to ideals of mutuality and reciprocity. As we argue in this paper, educators expect learners to demonstrate respect before they are afforded it. As a consequence, the practice of teaching often slips from promoting 'respect' to promoting 'responsibility'.

We begin the argument just outlined with a discussion of respect as a moral principle, a communal value, and a social problem in South Africa. This is followed by a discussion of our approach to the research, including the study sites and the discursive analysis of texts, interviews, and observations within classrooms. We then explore the role of respect that is envisioned in policy and curriculum documents and by educators. As previewed above, we argue that the conceptions and practices of respect are imbued with power relations and conflate respect as a value with the practice of learner responsibilities, overlooking the reciprocal nature of respect.

2. Respect and responsibility

Theories and conceptualisations of respect abound, and we cannot hope to discuss all of them. Our focus in this paper is on respect as a value and practice that is critical for the ways in which people live together and interact, but that does not have any necessary or predetermined form. Approaching respect in this way allows us to explore the tensions that arise in debates over respect, as well as to see how those debates inflect the ways in which citizenship is taught to youth. In this way, we examine respect as an element in the reproduction – and perhaps transformation – of South African society. The three elements of respect – as moral value, as communal value, and as a practice in daily life – are discursively and rhetorically intertwined, but at this point, we discuss them separately.

As a moral value, respect is often based on principles of equality and recognition of the value of all people. It is an idea often associated with Immanuel Kant, but other approaches abound (see Darwall, 1977; Dillon, 2009; Hill, 2000; Ignatieff, 1984; Middleton, 2006; Wolff, 1998). It is also an ideal enshrined in the South African Constitution, which recognizes the equality and human rights of all people. This respect for the political personhood of all South Africans, of course, was a critical move away from apartheid, in that the vast majority of the population gained recognition that they held the same rights adhered to others. The expression of respect through rights is quite common. It reflects a commitment to ideas of what has been called 'recognition respect' in which individuals are to be accorded dignity no matter what they do or whom they are. Extended to a principle of justice, Kant argued that persons carry fundamental rights, such as the right to freedom, and to ancillary rights

that must be observed, or respected, and that are inviolate (Kant, 1996). Along with the fundamental rights accorded to individuals, however, is the duty to recognize the fundamental rights of others, thus joining people in reciprocal relations of respect.

Sitting alongside notions of respect in western moral philosophy is the concept of *ubuntu* (Goodhew, 2004; Ross, 1999). Jansen (2009) notes that the concept has many different meanings, and has been used to advance various political agendas. At its most idealistic, *ubuntu* emphasizes the allegiances that bind people together in relationships of reciprocity and affirmation, that create a whole that is greater than the individuals in it, and that is diminished when people are harmed or oppressed. *Ubuntu* is a concept that carries deep significance in South Africa – and in the education system – as a specifically African expression of the relationships that connect people and make them whole. It is presented as a non-western expression of respect that compels recognition of the personhood of all people and binds them to each other in reciprocal relations. In this way, the concept is almost religious or spiritual. But *ubuntu* carries an additional connotation of respect slightly at odds with Kantian ideals, in that it also implies that some people may be worthy of respect by virtue of behaving with humanity. This additional layer of respect may seem to contradict the idea that respect is owed to *all* people, but as we demonstrate later, it is important in the way that respect is mobilized in the classrooms of South Africa.

While moral philosophers may talk about the duty to recognize the rights of others, some political philosophers and politicians introduce the notion of 'responsibility' that accompanies rights. This move from rights to duty to responsibility carries important connotations. Many theorists, for example, link rights to responsibilities,

and sometimes they do so with the implication that failure to fulfil responsibilities justifies the retrenchment of rights (Miller and Savoie, 2002). The conflation of rights and responsibilities does not necessarily reflect Kantian ideas, but instead, is an example of how philosophical ideals are reshaped in practice, over time, and in particular contexts. Yet the conflation also becomes a key point of contestation and struggle in the ways that people are imagined as individuals and as members of communities. In this sense, respect is far from universal, but rather is both invididual and contextual: 'what respect means to you may not be what respect means to me' (Ignatieff, 1984, p. 16). It is an active concept, conceptualized and expressed in multiple ways that are framed by local relations of power, resistance, and identity, including race and gender (Salo, 2005; Sennett, 2003).

Reflecting its contextual nature, respect can also be thought of as a communal value. What separates the communal value of respect from the value ascribed to it in moral philosophy is the location of respect in communities, or in other words, as being a relationship between community members. To some degree, this represents a narrowing of respect in that not all people may be deemed worthy of respect, either because they are not members of a community – are 'foreign' – or because they have violated community norms and values. Respect in this sense is earned, as is membership, and therefore implies a form of authorisation. This authority carries the right to make claims on other community members, but importantly, carries the right and duty to ensure that other people comply. Ideally, this authority is mutual, and is available to all community members, a community of equal persons (for a different approach see Darwall, 1977).

Once again, there is slippage between the ways that philosophers imagine respect as a communal value and the ways that value is mobilized in political debate. In South Africa, as we noted, there is a communal element of respect linked with the notion of *ubuntu*, particularly with regard to elders and to respectability. In the period before high apartheid and continuing into its early days, an African elite developed in South Africa, often resulting from professional status or advanced education. During apartheid, this elite stratum was clustered amongst entrepreneurs and in professions open to black and coloured people, notably teaching, nursing, and the ministry. The ethos of this stratum was one of respectability, and involved commitment to law, order, and community. Respect and respectability involved an element of assisting other community members, but also bringing newcomers into the webs of authority that organized life in the locations and townships. Respect, in this sense, flowed from the community to elders and to the elite strata (Bozzolli, 2004, p. 44-45), rather than being reciprocal. With the onset of the struggle against apartheid, however, the respect accorded to the elite was challenged and their ability to sustain their respectability was threatened. Youth played key roles in the struggle, and also in challenging elites, and by extension, elders. In the new South African society, there are efforts to re-engage respect for *ubuntu*, leaders, and elderly within communities, although not necessarily respect for the state. This is expressed in efforts to discipline youth so that they will become responsible community members. In these efforts, including education, we can once again identify ways in which the desire for respect is expressed in terms of responsibility, particularly for youth.

There is a final way in which respect is mobilized, and that is a personal desire to be respected. The apartheid system and the failures of the new government have stripped

dignity, the basis of respect, from many South Africans. Extreme inequality, the declining accountability of the state, service delivery failures, and allegations of exclusion from the rights of citizenship reinforce a feeling of being dis-respected, despite the grand promises embedded in the Constitution. In response, people turn to other means of expressing their desire for respect and their identities as people who can claim it in one form or another (Goodhew, 2004; Jensen, 2008; Ross, 1999). Youth may face particular difficulties in this regard, as their identity claims and performances are often dismissed as dis-respectful by adults and people in authority (Dolby, 2001; Hammett, 2008, 2009). In the educational system, this is evident in the continued use of humiliation and corporal punishment to reinforce educator-learner hierarchies in the face of learners' desire for respect. The state and educators demand respect *from* young people, but often fail to address the conditions and experiences in marginal communities that result in feelings of shame, the antithesis of respect.[1] In part, this is because discourses of respect serve to depoliticise inequality by reducing it to a kind of difference that should be recognised, tolerated, and respected (Waghid, 2009). That the state and educators also seem out of touch with what young people mean by respect or how they wish to be treated only compounds the feeling on the part of youth that they are dis-respected. Relations between youth and the broader society seem to be untouched by the reciprocity, mutuality, and respect encapsulated in western moral philosophy and *ubuntu*. In large measure, this is argued to be a result of youth failing to show respect to those in authority and to demonstrate their own responsibilities as community members or citizens.

---

[1] For a discussion of this concern in a different context see C. Gaskell, "'But they just don't respect us': Young people's experiences of (dis)respected citizenship and the New Labour Respect Agenda", *Children's Geographies*, **6**, 3, pp. 223-238.

Respect is a key value in citizenship education in South Africa. It expresses a moral commitment to equality, to human rights, and to community. But it is also important as the value responds to the desire of individuals to be respected. As we have argued, however, the practices involved in education often fall short of the goal of either imparting or gaining respect. The inequalities of the country, the lack of responsiveness on the part of government, and expectations as to how youth and adults should interact all put pressure on the core elements of respect in moral philosophy and in *ubuntu*. Following our discussion of methods in the next section, we explore the conceptions of respect on the part of education officials and educators, and demonstrate the ways they conflate the value of respect with the practice of responsible citizenship.

3. Researching South African high schools: research context and methods

The South African education sector is characterized by extreme disparities and inequalities. Racial segregation and inequitable government spending characterized the development of formal education from the first years of white settlement. The National Party's 1948 election success brought the introduction of apartheid policies, including Christian National Education, which consolidated differential educational development, resource inequalities and entrenched racially differentiated citizenship (Pillay, 1990).

In 1994, the democratically elected African National Congress-led government inherited this distorted education system. In attempting to address inequities, education departments were restructured, the legal basis for racial segregation was

abolished, and moves were made towards more equitable spending. In so doing, the new government developed policies intended to consolidate democracy and human rights through the pursuit of constitutional ideals and by creating a new kind of citizen through the educational system (Christie, 2008, p. 128; Harley and Wedekind, 2004, p. 194). These efforts can be seen in key documents, including the *Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy* and *Curriculum 2005*, which articulate the ideals of citizenship in education. These ideals include participation, responsibility, social justice, critical thinking, tolerance, equality, dignity, accountability, and respect (G.o.S.A. 1997, 2001; see also Enslin, 2003). Yet the delivery of these curriculum ideals is framed by continued resource disparities between schools (see Lemon 2004, 2005) and by the attitudes and expectations of educators themselves. Thus, the translation of policy into practice in the classroom provides a window through which to observe how citizenship is understood and taught.

Our research attempted to use this window as part of a larger project that addresses citizenship, education and democratisation in South Africa. In this effort, we analyzed curriculum materials, conducted 64 interviews with educators (including school principals and history and life orientation educators), NGOs and government officials, and observed classroom teaching in 12 high schools across the country.[2] History is widely recognised as a key subject area in which dominant narratives of the nation are provided. During apartheid, history curricula and textbooks privileged white settler history and virtually erased blacks from this narrative. Post-apartheid teaching materials reflect changes in the dominant political narrative and nation-building agenda, providing an interpretation of national history positioned within global

---

[2] In reporting on these interviews and observations, pseudonyms are used for individuals and schools.

debates around oppression, struggle, democracy and human/civil rights (see Witz 2000).

Citizenship education is most explicitly addressed within the life orientation subject area. Life orientation is one of eight learning areas in the general education and training (grade R to 9) phase and is located as a subject area within the 'Human and Social Studies and Languages' learning field in the further education and training (grade 10 to 12) phase. Life orientation is designed to contribute to the holistic development of the learner through five learning outcomes at grades R to 9 (health promotion; social development' physical development; personal development; orientation to world of work) and four focus areas for grades 10 to 12 (personal well-being; citizenship education; recreation and physical activity; career and career choices). Citizenship education is both implicitly and explicitly emphasised as the life orientation curriculum "guides and prepares learners for life, and for its responsibilities and possibilities" by providing the knowledge, skills and practices associated with responsible citizenship (G.O.S.A., 2003, p. 9; see also G.O.S.A., 2002). The citizenship education component specifically seeks "to foster commitment to the values and principles espoused in the Constitution" while exploring critical issues including discrimination, social relationships, rights, responsibilities, political literacy, volunteerism, social justice and social and environmental issues (G.O.S.A., 2003, p. 11). While the subject area is given prominence in the curriculum, staff and students have mixed views on its relevance and importance; some are dismissive of the subject area, viewing it as a distraction from the delivery of the 'core' curriculum, while others support its inclusion as vital to the holistic development of learners.

The schools were drawn from three urban areas – Cape Town (Western Cape); King William's Town (Eastern Cape); Pietermaritzburg (KwaZulu Natal) (figure 1) – to provide exposure to different socio-political and economic histories and demographics. Cape Town is a relatively wealthy, cosmopolitan city. Demographically, it has a large coloured population due to previous designation as a coloured labour preference area. It currently is experiencing internal in-migration, particularly of black South Africans from the Eastern Cape (the old Xhosa homeland), resulting in inter-racial tensions (Western, 2001). King William's Town is a small urban settlement in the Eastern Cape. Located close to the provincial capital (Bisho), King William's Town is a historically important urban centre in an area of high poverty and out-migration. Pietermaritzburg, the provincial capital of KwaZulu Natal, is a mid-sized city with a relatively high proportion of Indian South Africans, reflecting the landing of indentured labourers and free passengers during the colonial period. The city experienced ethno-political tensions between the African National Congress and Inkharta Freedom Party during the 1990s. In each city, schools from across the spectrum of previous government classifications were selected to provide a proxy for continued socio-economic disparities in society and in education.[3]

-- Insert map around here --

Figure 1: Location of research sites in South Africa.

4. Teaching citizenship through respect

_____

[3] Detailed descriptions of the schools can be found in: D. Hammett and L. Staeheli, 'Citizenship Education in South Africa: A report to schools.' (2009) Available on-line:

http://www.geos.ed.ac.uk/homes/dhammett/esrccited.html

Respect emerges as an important issue in curriculum policy, textbooks, and educators' ideas about citizenship. This is probably not surprising in a country that systematically denied both respect and self-respect to the majority of its population. In building a new nation, respect for all is therefore seen as a foundation stone. As we have noted, the idea of respect is used in many ways, and so other meanings of respect are layered onto the foundational meaning. Some of these additional meanings of respect are imperfectly realized, while others seem to contravene the idea of respect being owed to all people. In this section of the paper, we explore the multiple ways that respect is deployed in the teaching of citizens and citizenship.

4.1 Respect, equality, and national citizenship

For educators, respect is a core value in South Africa's new democracy. Much as in the moral philosophy discussed previously, respect involves recognition of the fundamental dignity and equality of all people. Thus, a Grade 7 textbook presents '[t]he respect a person has for the dignity and the rights of his or her fellow man' as being amongst the main characteristics of humanity (Swart et al., 2000a). Most educators also held respect to be a foundation for democratic citizenship, and in doing so, often invoked the history of the county. Siddiqa, the principal of an independent Islamic school in Cape Town, expressed these sentiments: 'With the history of the country I think to be a citizen, it should be about equality and about being respected despite of your background, despite of your race' (Siddiqa, 26/02/2009). Citizenship education was the primary subject area where these ideas about equality could be taught, because as Nkosazana, a life orientation teacher at a former white school in

King William's Town, commented: 'It is where our learners are taught to respect one another and to know and accept that no-one is superior to others' (Nkosazana, 04/06/2009). This universalist understanding of respect and equality is in contrast to the views of the apartheid state, and overcoming entrenched attitudes is not easy (Jansen, 2009). Teachers are nevertheless committed to it: 'Basically, everybody is a unique human being and that's one thing that we need to accept. You need to respect that' (Juan, 08/06/2009).

Respect, however, is difficult to teach as the rational and abstract moral principle debated by philosophers. To compensate, educators drew on values of love, understanding, and *ubuntu* in trying to instil the value of respect. Thandiswe, a life orientation teacher at a former white school in King William's Town explained that, 'coming from the past and to forge a bright future, we have to love one another, to understand one another, and to respect one another' (Thandiswe, 02/06/2009). In trying to describe this process, many educators invoked ideas related to *ubuntu*, linking individuals to each other through an appreciation of their dignity and unity. For example, Vuyiswa, a life orientation teacher at a township school in Pietermarizburg, explained:

To respect myself and not destroy my dignity and respect other people's dignity, if I can protect my dignity and other peoples' dignity. By not destroying other people's dignity I can say I respect myself (Vuyiswa, 27/05/2009).

For some educators, this attempt to combine western moral philosophy with specifically African understandings was the way that new South African citizens could be moulded. Hossam, a history teacher, explained: 'Our aim is to create good

citizens and good citizens are those people with respect for their rights and responsibilities and the values of our country' (Hossam, 28/01/2009).

4.2 Respect, duty and the behaviour of citizens

For the educators, respect is not simply an attitude, but instead, is manifested and traced through the fulfilment of duties and by certain behaviours. Educators, for example, talked about respect being evident in attention to national symbols, through participation in political and community affairs, and in obeying the law. Failure to conform to behaviours associated with citizens implied a lack of respect for citizenship, for other people, and for oneself. In keeping with this sentiment, textbooks instruct learners that they must develop self-respect and respect for others by fulfilling their duties and by behaving in certain ways as young citizens (see for instance le Cordeur and Coetzee, 2001; Swart et al., 2000a, 2000b). For educators, as well, respect and citizenship require conformance with social norms and with the law. Nurina is a life orientation teacher at a working class coloured school in Cape Town; she made the point succinctly: 'A good citizen is somebody who respects one another, respects other people's property and belongings and abides to your rules' (Nurina, 29/01/2009).

Very important amongst these rules and duties were the rules of the school itself; in this sense, the school serves as a microcosm of South African society. Derek, a history teacher at a former-Model C school in King William's Town, explained how respect was manifest in learners' behaviour and practice. He argued that for learners, respect requires

…being respectful of their parents, respectful of their teachers, and in showing respect that would include being punctual, doing what they are expected to do in terms of their homework, being trustworthy, that you can trust them not to do harmful things to other people and that they have a desire to contribute to society' (Derek, 03/06/2009).

Educators tried to ensure that learners understood respect in relation to their status as learners and as citizens-in-the-making. As Derek implies, good behaviour as a citizen within the school would, in the ideal, result in good behaviour in the community at large. Fatima, an early career life orientation educator at a former White school in Pietermaritzburg expressed a similar view, noting:

Citizenship to me is about behaving responsibly towards my fellow citizens. Obeying the law and doing the best to enhance one's life in the community. Being a responsible citizen is understanding what your government is all about and how they got there, and the laws of the country, and understanding human rights and showing respect for those human rights (Fatima, 05/05/2009).

There is an important reduction here: respect for the dignity and equality for all people – the abstract view of respect in moral philosophy – comes to be manifest in adherence to the law of the land. This reduction is clear in the learning outcomes for one textbook, which listed enacting respect under the 'skills' outcomes for a lesson (Cassoo et al., 2005).

4.3 Respect and responsibility

While duties and behaviours are important to citizenship, most of the educators and curriculum materials went further in the ways they linked respect to rights and

responsibilities. As we argued previously, rights are conferred to people as both an indication and a guarantor of respect; in this sense, the extension of rights to everyone is talisman of equality and respect. While the Constitution, the curriculum, and the educators all expressed a commitment to human rights, this commitment was often moderated – and perhaps contravened – by a feeling that many South Africans and perhaps most students were not behaving in accordance with social and legal mores. As we listened to many educators, it seemed that commitment to rights was tempered by the feeling that rights should only be recognized for those people who fulfilled their responsibilities as citizens. In so doing, fulfillment of responsibilities becomes a marker of respect and the basis upon which rights are granted. In this way, the relationship between respect, rights and responsibility is reversed. Rather than rights and responsibility following from respect, responsibility becomes the basis for rights and respect.

This reversal of respect and responsibility is clear in textbooks and in the comments of many educators. A Grade 8 life orientation textbook, for example, develops the notion of respect in the section 'Sharing and Caring'. The text focuses on the rights and responsibilities of citizens, and as part of those, mentions the need to show respect to others (van der Walt, 2000). Initially this is presented as an inter-personal issue. The text then proceeds to address communal rights and responsibilities and the link between individual responsibilities and social challenges, such as non-payment for services and poor service delivery. Implicit in this is the idea that the individual – the learner – must fulfil his or her responsibilities to the community and the state in order to receive services and respect. The learner is expected to take responsibility for

his or her values and behaviours and show respect to *others* before being afforded respect and the rights that come with it.

This sentiment is also expressed by many of the educators. For Derek, who was quoted earlier, a citizen is '…somebody who respects other people, somebody who takes responsibility for his position in society' (Derek, 03/06/2009). For Elaine, a teacher at a former coloured school in Pietermaritzburg, recognition of rights and responsibilities in all aspects of life was the key to respect and thereby citizenship:

Respect is a very big issue. If you can respect yourself and respect others you obviously know right from wrong, which ultimately determines which type of citizen you are. You will be able to be a productive citizen, not one that is involved in crime. If you can come into the classroom and respect the teacher and respect yourself and your work is done at time, and your output is much greater (Elaine, 13/05/2009).

Discussions about respect, rights, responsibility in education were frequently framed by complaints about declining respect and support for educators and about a growing rights culture amongst learners. In particular, educators bemoaned learners' invocations of a discourse of rights without recognising the responsibilities concomitant with those rights. This was powerfully – and even angrily – expressed by Nurina (29/01/2009):

'They tell you, 'It's my *right* to education'. So I always tell them, 'Yes, it is your right, but what about my right and what about *your* responsibility? Because it's your responsibility to respect your educator'.

For Nurina, respect for the rights of learners is dependent on meeting responsibilities.

To address what is perceived as a growing 'rights culture' and declining application by learners, the possibility of introducing a Bill of Responsibilities, as a companion to the existing Bill of Rights, has been mooted. While the specific content of the Bill of Responsibilities has not been settled, there is agreement that this new bill would emphasize the idea that learners need to fulfil their responsibilities and treat educators with respect if learners are to access their rights. Educators are generally in favour of such a development, arguing that this could provide them with a frame through which to counter the 'rights culture' amongst learners. The notion of respect is again a common thread to discussions about the Bill of Responsibilities, as exemplified in Anne's thoughts on what it should include. She believes that it should be based on learner responsibility and respect: 'Respect for one's self and one another, and being responsible for yourself. Them taking more responsibility for their own actions, not placing the blame on anyone else, their work ethic should be their own' (Anne, 12/02/2009). This conceptualisation of respect is thus tied to the acceptance and development of responsibilities and responsible citizenship as an integral part of the 'hidden curriculum' of citizenship education.[4]

These efforts to hold learners responsible occur in the context of an educational system that is slowly, and in some ways reluctantly, moving away from authoritarian power relations in which respect between educators and learners is inequitable and non-reciprocal. Despite the comments about the need to respect the dignity and equality of all people, many educators still expected learners to show heightened respect toward them. In this context, respect is understood as respect *for* educators,

---

[4] This phrase comes from Jansen, who argues that throughout the educational system, there is a hidden curriculum that supplements the formal curriculum. See Jansen, 2009, p. 107.

while responsibilities are demanded *from* learners. These trends were implicit in Kaleb's approach to teaching. He stated:

As an educator [my role is to] make sure that the boys understand that they need to be disciplined, they need to be punctual, they need to be apologetic, they need to make sure that they respect other people, so that they can be respected also. I think that is the most important thing as far as education is concerned (Kaleb, 01/06/2009).

The invocation of respect in Kaleb's comments relies upon the learner adopting attitudes and behaviours that are appraised as respectful to others in order to be treated with respect; it becomes the responsibility of the learner to embody the respectful citizen, without necessarily being afforded the respect that comes with citizenship. Thus, while educators position respect as a key attribute to good citizenship, it is bound up in discourses of power and responsibilities. Yet this authority is increasingly called into question by attempts to move towards a more democratic approach to schooling, which leads some to believe that authority and power for educators are being eroded (see Deutsch and Jones, 2008).

Not everyone, however, sees the changing relationship between educators and learners as a problem. Indeed, some educators are vocal in trying to change attitudes and behaviours and to encourage greater reciprocity. For instance, a publication from the KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education (no date) asks: 'Do you give Life Orientation to an educator who will say, 'Do as I say! Not as I do?' Its answer is a resounding 'No', stating that a life orientation educator must be a role-model who demonstrates the values in the curriculum. Many education theorists would agree, believing that a democracy, such as South Africa, requires a democratized educational

system that returns to the conceptualisation of respect in moral philosophy. Osler and Starkey, for instance, note the need to develop respect for others' human dignity as a core issue. Educators, they contend, must then personify this ideal in their behaviour and interactions within the school: 'Teachers [must be] careful to be as polite to and respectful of their students as they expect them to be' (Osler and Starkey, 2005, p. 163). Deutsch and Jones note the importance of respect, as a bidirectional trait, in the mediation of and acceptance of authority (Deutsch and Jones, 2008, p. 671). Thus, to ensure respect, educators must uphold the very values and practices they are seeking to encourage in their learners.

Several educators that we interviewed also recognized reciprocity as an important relationship as they attempted to inculcate the values and practices of respect in their learners. Natalie, a life orientation educator at a former coloured school in King William's Town, stated:

Respect is the key [value] because really we cannot go further without respect and there's nothing like being good citizens without respect because everything is built upon respect. Education – respect should be there for good education, from both the sides, the learners and the educators; they should have respect for each other (Natalie, 08/06/2009).

Similarly, Lwazi, a teacher at a township school in Pietermaritzburg, argued:

We as educators need to show respect in order to show them how to respect. It is a mutual thing. I say to them, as an educator, I am a human being before I am an educator, so before you become a learner you are a human being, and I need to respect you as a human being… So, it is a matter of mutual respect that we are human beings first before we become an adult or a young person (Lwazi, 28/05/2009).

Thus, there was recognition on the part of some educators that they needed to embrace and enact the values of mutuality and respect in order to encourage their development and internalisation in learners. More controversially, there is some expectation that learners should question the ways in which the value of respect and responsibilities of citizenship and education are taught to and demanded from them, if these are missing from the ethos of the school and actions of the educators. The second quote in the epigraph of this paper encapsulates this belief.

4.4 A culture of respect?

Schools do not operate in a vacuum, however, and educators are only one influence on the lives of learners. Many educators worried that South Africa was developing a culture in which respect was no longer a core value. This disrespectful culture was manifest in a number of ways. First, educators often lamented the lack of respect for others and for the Constitution shown by a number of political and social leaders. Because learners are not isolated from the broader society, the actions and rhetoric of high-profile individuals were adopted by some learners and influenced their response to the content of citizenship education classes. Jason, a history teacher at a former White school, observed:

It's difficult because you want to build respect for the country's democratically elected leaders. But then they do something which completely undermines what I would regard as core values. You have national leaders exposed as lying to different commissions. You have the whole thing about respect, and how you debate something, showing respect to the other person, being

respectful and so you have an adult conversation. Then you have someone like Julius Malema being just disrespectful to the National Minister of Education (Jason, 13/02/2009).[5]

While Jason's comment picks up on one incident, there was a general frustration that the social ethic and values of citizenship being promoted in schools is undermined by the conspicuous consumption and behaviours of public leaders, such as the *waBenzi* culture of elected officials. Educators felt frustrated that they faced an uphill battle to instil respect as a core value in the face of such behaviours.

A related concern about cultural changes addressed the ways in which individualism is increasingly celebrated over communitarianism; many educators believed this is manifest in a growing selfishness amongst learners. These arguments are well rehearsed (see Kubow, in press, p. 12). Derek, however, is particularly direct: 'People tend to be so selfish, it's about what they can get and what society owes them, rather than what they can give and what they should be giving' (Derek, 03/06/2009). In this cultural context, it becomes increasingly difficult to talk about respect, mutuality and *ubuntu* in a meaningful way.

Derek's comments open up questions about broader respect relations between state, society and the individual. His contention is that there are basic behaviours that are inherently about respect for others – punctuality, preparedness, giving back to society. But what happens to these if individuals do not feel that they are afforded respect by

---

[5] This was an incident in February 2009 when Malema made derogatory remarks about Naledi Pandor during a salary dispute at Tswane University of Technology that had closed the university. The African National Congress censured Malema for his remarks and he apologised to Pandor, although the incident is viewed as symbolic of a lack of respect for others within political circles and symptomatic of a failure to encourage a robust and open arena for political debate and dissent.

the state or wider society? When Juan, a history teacher at a former coloured school in King William's Town explained what constituted a good citizen, he noted the importance of the treatment of individuals by the state in fostering citizenship,

A good citizen is to firstly accept the fact that I'm a South African and in order for us as a country to go forward, things need to start with me. I need to adhere to the laws of the country, I need to respect other people as I want government to respect me, and respect other people also (Juan, 08/06/2009).

In this statement, Juan emphasizes his own responsibilities as a citizen in contributing to nation-building and the development of the country. At the same time, however, he notes his desire for government to respect him as an individual. Should an individual believe the state is not fostering a culture of respect in which he or she is valued, there is the possibility that adherence to state goals and values will be undermined. Failures to provide basic services and the conditions appropriate for an acceptable standard of living undermines the dignity and self-respect of those living in sub-standard conditions, leading them to question whether or not the state respects them as individuals and citizens. Not only do such conditions have a serious impact upon the quality of and achievement in education in South Africa, they affect the ways in which educators and learners engage with the curriculum and ideals of citizenship and democracy (see also Kubow, in press).

4.5 Respect in the classroom?

If schools do not operate in a vacuum, then neither do the practices of teaching and learning. The instilling of ideals relating to citizenship and respect amongst learners depends not only upon the formal curriculum, but also the hidden curriculum and the

experiences of schooling. Thus, while educators spoke about respect and their attempts to build a sense of citizenship and belonging around this ideal, there were disjunctures between the rhetoric of the ideal and the practices of daily school life. In other words, the schooling experience did not always embody and demonstrate respect in the relations between educators and learners. To frame this discussion we will revisit sections of our analysis above.

Many educators spoke of the importance of learners demonstrating respectful behaviour, conformance to school rules and adherence to national laws. On occasion, these demands by educators were not replicated in their own actions. On multiple occasions during our work at a township school in Cape Town we witnessed educators either arriving late or leaving early from class or even remaining in the staffroom for the duration of the teaching period (despite being timetabled to teach). In these situations, how will a learner react to being told that they must be punctual and prepared to learn, while their educator models neither of these behaviours? Other transgressions by educators further limited their moral authority and respect standing. On a limited number of occasions at other schools, it appeared that educators were drunk. At many schools, educators used learners to run personal errands – primarily to fetch food or drinks from the school tuck shop or neighbouring street traders. Such practices suggest a misuse of the relations of power and trust between educators and learners and potentially challenge notions of the reciprocity of respect. In these situations it appeared that educators were not demonstrating their respect *for* and meeting their responsibilities *towards* learners.

Second, the stress placed on adherence to the law was also called into question on repeated occasions. Corporal punishment is banned in South African schools, yet such incidents were observed on numerous occasions. For instance, during recess at one school in Pietermaritzburg an act of bullying by a male learner towards a female learner resulted in intervention by staff members. The result was not only a telling off for the male learner but what could be referred to as 'six of the best' – six strokes of a stiff plastic tube across the palm of the hand. More commonly, we saw what appeared to be switches carried by educators, though we do not know whether or how frequently they might have been used. Not only do such practices – or perhaps threats – undermine attempts to instil adherence to the law, they suggest a view of learners as incomplete citizens, as only partially protected by the Constitution and the legal process.

5. Conclusion

Educators identify respect as a key value of good citizenship, to be enacted through the practices of responsible citizenship (and studentship) by learners. Yet the term has many meanings and many uses. While it can be mobilized as a powerful ideal in citizenship education, contradictions remain between respect as an ideal, as a value, and as a set of practices.

Policy and curriculum materials present a discourse of respect founded upon ideals of respect as a universal abstract. This approach is often mobilized in juxtaposition to the denial and scarcity of respect of the apartheid era. While many educators support the ideal of respect as conferring dignity and rights to all people, respect and responsibility are often conflated, and so complicate efforts to instil respect. Of

particular importance is the way that power and authority within schools mitigate against the reciprocal nature of respect imagined in moral philosophy. The demand is made upon learners to demonstrate respect *for* without necessarily delivering on the concomitant expectation that there will be respect *to* them from educators. These expectations rarely recognise a concomitant commitment for educators to treat learners with respect or the imperative for their behaviour to embody the value of respect.

The challenge remains, therefore, to conceive of respect within the educational context as a reciprocal relationship and to enact this value in the ethos of the school. Educators must embody this ideal and demonstrate respect towards the school and learners. Many educators are suspicious of the transition to more democratic schooling, having been trained within traditional, authoritarian pedagogics and power relations; many of these educators view the new pedagogical approach as undermining their status, power and respect. However, as Osler and Starkey (2005, p. 142) note, 'democracy in schools is fundamentally about respect'. The possibility remains that by equipping educators with a more appropriate range of educational and disciplinary tools there could be a greater buy-in to democracy within schools which, in turn, could enable the development of cultures of respect in keeping with the citizenship ideals identified by educators themselves.

References

Bozzolli, B. 2004. Theatres of Struggle and the End of Apartheid, University of Edinburgh Press, Edinburgh.

Cassoo, Z., Keim M., Vergnani, T. 2005. Making Choices Life Orientation: Grade 10 learner's book, Heinemann, Sandton.

Christie, P. 2008. Opening the Doors of Learning: Changing schools in South Africa, Heinemann, Sandton.

Darwall, S.L. 1977. Two kinds of respect. Ethics 88(1), 36-49

Deutsch N.L., Jones, J.N. 2008. 'Show me an ounce of respect': respect and authority in adult-youth relationships in after-school programs. Journal of Adolescent Research 23, 667-688.

Dillon, R. 2009 Respect. In: Zalta, E. (Ed.), Stanford Encyclopaedia of Philosophy, available at http://plato.stanford.edu/entries/respect.

Dolby, N. 2001. Constructing Race: Youth, Identity and Popular Culture in South Africa, State University of New York Press, Albany, NY.

Enslin, P. 2001. Citizenship education in post-apartheid South Africa. Cambridge Journal of Education, 33 (1), 73-83.

Goodhew, D. 2004. Respectability and Resistance: A History of Sophiatown, Praeger, Westport, CT.

Government of South Africa, Department of Education. 1997. Curriculum 2005, Government Printers, Pretoria.

Government of South Africa, Department of Education. 2001. Manifesto on Values, Education and Democracy, Government Printers, Pretoria.

Government of South Africa, Department of Education. 2002. Revised National Curriculum Statement Grades R-9: Life Orienation. Government Printers, Pretoria.

Government of South Africa, Department of Education. 2003. Revised National Curriculum Statement Grades 10-12: Life Orienation. Government Printers, Pretoria.

Hammett, D. 2008. Disrespecting teacher: the decline in social standing of teachers in Cape Town, South Africa. International Journal of Educational Development, 28 (3), 340-347.

Hammett, D. 2009. Local beats to global rhythms: coloured student identity and negotiations of global cultural imports in Cape Town, South Africa. Social and Cultural Geography, 10 (4), 403-419.

Harley, K., Wedekind, V. 2004. Political change, curriculum change and social formation, 1990 to 2002. In Chisholm, L. (Ed.), Changing Class: Education and social change in post-apartheid South Africa, Zed Books, London, pp. 195-220.

Hill, T.E. 2000. Respect, Pluralism, and Justice: Kantian perspectives, Oxford University Press, Oxford.

Ignatieff, M. 1984. The Needs of Strangers, Chatto and Windus, London.

Jansen, J. 2009. Knowledge in the Blood: Confronting Race and the Apartheid Past, Stanford University Press, Stanford, CA.

Jensen, S. 2008. Gangs, Politics, and Dignity in Cape Town, James Currey, Oxford.

Kant, I. 1797/1996 The Metaphysics of Morals, ed. M. Gregor, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Kubow, P. In Press. Metaphorical depictions of democracy and school-society relations in South Africa: Perspectives from principals in a Western Cape township. World Studies in Education.

KwaZulu-Natal Department of Education. No Date. General Education and Training Curriculum: Life Orientation Grades R-9.

le Cordeur, M., Coetzee, E. 2001. Dynamic Life Orientation: Learner's book grade 9, Kagiso Education, Cape Town.

Lemon, A. 2004. Redressing school inequalities in the Eastern Cape, South Africa. Journal of Southern African Studies, 30 (2), 269-290.

Lemon, A. 2005. Shifting geographies of social inclusion and exclusion: Secondary education in Pietermaritzburg, South Africa. African Affairs, 104 (414), 69-96.

Middleton, D. 2006. Introduction. Res Publica, 12,1-7.

Miller, S.M., Savoie, A.J. 2002. Respect and Rights: Class, race and gender today, Rowman and Littlefield, Lanham, MA.

Osler, A., Starkey, H. 2005. Changing Citizenship: Democracy and inclusion in education, Open University Press, Maidenhead.

Pillay, P.N. 1990. The development and underdevelopment of education in South Africa. In Nasson, B., Samuel, J. (Eds.), Education: From poverty to liberty, David Philip, Cape Town, pp. 30-47.

Ross, R. 1999. Status and Respectability in the Cape Colony, 1750-1870: A Tragedy of Manners, Cambridge University Press, Cambridge.

Salo, E. 2005. Negotiating gender and personhood in the new South Africa: adolescent women and gangsters in Manenberg township on the Cape Flats. In

Robins, S. (Ed.), Limits to Liberation After Apartheid: Citizenship, governance and culture, James Currey, Oxford, pp. 173-189.

Sennett, R. 2003. Respect: The formation of character in a world of inequality, Allen Lane, London.

Swart, K., Craig, J.K., Muller, T.A., Kriek, H., van Heerden, L., Gilmer, M., Pote, N. 2000a. Life Orientation for the New Nation: Grade 7 learner's book, Afro Publishers, Cape Town.

Swart, K., Craig, J.K., Muller, T.A., Kriek, H., Lotz, J., Gilmer, M., Pote, N. 2000b. Life Orientation for the New Nation: Grade 9 teacher's guide, Afro Publishers, Cape Town.

van der Walt, J. (2000) Skills for Life Learner's Book 8, Nolwazi Educational Publishers, Johannesburg.

Wahgid, Y. (2009) Patriotism and democratic citizenship education in South Africa: On the (im)possibility of reconciliation and nation building. Educational Philosophy and Theory, 41 (4), 399-409.

Western, J. 2001. Africa is coming to the Cape. Geographical Review, 91 (4), 617-640

Witz, L. 2000. Beyond Van Riebeeck. In Nuttall, S. and Michael, C.-A. (Eds), Senses of Culture: South African Cultural Studies, Oxford, Oxford University Press, pp. 318-339

Wolff, J. 1998. Fairness, respect and the egalitarian ethos. Philosophy and Public Affairs, 27 (2), 97-122