**Journal of Quaternary Science**

**Journal of Quaternary Science** 

# **Glacial Lake Pickering: stratigraphy and chronology of a proglacial Lake dammed by the North Sea Lobe of the British-Irish Ice Sheet.**



**SCHOLARONE™** Manuscripts

# 

# **Glacial Lake Pickering: stratigraphy and chronology of a proglacial Lake dammed by the North Sea Lobe of the British-Irish Ice Sheet.**

3 David J A Evans<sup>1</sup>, Mark D. Bateman<sup>2</sup>, David H. Roberts<sup>1</sup>, Alicia Medialdea<sup>2</sup>, Laura Hayes<sup>2</sup>, Geoff A T Duller<sup>3</sup>, Derek Fabel<sup>4</sup> and Chris D. Clark<sup>2</sup> 

- 5 1. Department of Geography, Durham University, South Road, Durham DH1 3LE, UK
- 6 2. Department of Geography, University of Sheffield, Sheffield S10 2TN, UK
- 7 3. Institute of Geography and Earth Sciences, Aberystwyth University, Llandinam Building, 8 Penglais Campus, Aberystwyth SY23 3DB, UK
- 9 4. School of Geographical and Earth Sciences, University of Glasgow, Glasgow G12 8QQ, UK

# **Abstract**

11 We report the first chronology, using four new OSL dates, on the sedimentary record of Glacial Lake 12 Pickering, dammed by the North Sea Lobe of the British-Irish Ice Sheet during the Dimlington Stadial 13 (24 ka-11 ka cal BP). Dates range from  $17.6 \pm 1.0$  ka to  $15.8 \pm 0.9$  ka for the sedimentation of the 14 Sherburn Sands at East Heslerton; a further date of  $10.1 \pm 0.7$  ka dates the reworking of coversand 15 into the early part of the Holocene, immediately postdating Younger Dryas periglacial structures. A 16 45 m lake level dates to ~17.6 ka, when the North Sea Lobe was already in retreat, having moved 17 eastward of the Wykham Moraine; it stood further east at the Flamborough Moraine by 17.3 ka. The 18 highest (70 m) lake level and the occupation of the Wykeham Moraine date to an earlier maximum 19 advance phase. The Sherburn Sands were formed by multiple coalescing alluvial fans prograding into 20 the falling water levels of the lake and fed by progressively larger volumes of debris from the Wolds. 21 Fan formation ceased  $\sim$ 15.8 ka, at a time when permafrost was degrading and nival-fed streams 22 were no longer capable of supplying sediment to the fans.

23 Key words: Glacial Lake Pickering; North Sea Lobe; British-Irish Ice Sheet; OSL dating; Sherburn Sands

# **Introduction to Glacial Lake Pickering**

25 The sedimentary and stratigraphic record of the recession of the North Sea Lobe of the British-Irish 26 Ice Sheet is best documented along the coast of eastern England, specifically in the tills and 27 associated glacilacustrine deposits of Holderness (Catt 1991, 2007; Evans et al. 1995; Boston et al. 28 2010; Evans & Thomson 2010) and the Humber Estuary and North Lincolnshire (Straw 1961, 1979; 29 Gaunt 1981; Bateman et al. 2008, 2015). The style of North Sea Lobe recession based largely upon 30 these onshore landform-sediment assemblages has been hypothesized by Clark et al (2012) based 31 upon a restricted number of chronostratigraphic control points, a palaeoglaciology that 32 acknowledges the damming of regional drainage to produce glacial lakes along the Yorkshire and 33 Durham coastlines. Significant advances have recently been made in securing a chronology for ice 34 recession from the sites on Holderness and the inner Humber Estuary, the former relating to the 35 Dimlington Stadial type site (cf. Penny et al. 1969; Rose 1985; Bateman et al. 2015) and the latter 36 relating more specifically to Glacial Lake Humber (Bateman et al. 2008). Glacial lakes further north, 37 such as lakes Pickering, Eskdale, Tees and Wear (Kendall 1902; Agar 1954; Smith 1981; Plater et al. 38 2000) are relatively poorly constrained chronologically. We report here on attempts to refine the 39 chronology of glacial lake development in the region in relation to the North Sea Lobe, concentrating 40 specifically on Glacial Lake Pickering.

41 The Vale of Pickering today is an east-west orientated low-lying plain bounded on three sides by the 42 Howardian Hills (west), the chalky North Yorkshire Wolds (southeast) and the limestone of the North 43 Yorkshire Moors (north). The damming of pre-glacial easterly river drainage from the North 44 Yorkshire Moors and Yorkshire Wolds by the onshore advance of the North Sea Lobe of the British-45 Irish Ice Sheet (BIIS) has long been acknowledged and depicted on palaeoglaciological maps in the 46 form of Glacial Lake Pickering (Fig. 1; Phillips 1868; Kendall 1902). This event has had a lasting impact 47 on the regional drainage network, in that the River Derwent, after rising less than 5 km from the 48 North Sea, no longer flows directly east to its nearest coastline, as it did prior to the last glaciation, 49 but instead flows 160 km westward up the Vale of Pickering and down the Kirkham Priory gorge 50 towards the Humber Estuary. This drainage pattern was dictated by a combination of ice and then 51 moraine damming of the east end of the Vale of Pickering and Vale of Scalby as well as the 52 deepening of the Forge Valley and Kirkham Priory gorge as glacial lake spillways (Fig. 1). The western 53 end of the vale was blocked by the margin of the Vale of York ice lobe at the Coxwold-Gilling Gap, 54 cutting off that potential drainage route at 68 m OD. Vale of York ice may also have penetrated into 55 the Kirkham Priory gap thereby blocking or restricting outflow. Kendall (1902) identified shorelines 56 at 68-70 and 45 m OD and associated the 70 m shoreline with a kame terrace/ice-contact delta and 57 hummocky moraine belt between West Ayton and Wykeham (King 1965; Edwards 1978). This 58 landform assemblage was termed the Wykeham moraine and used to define the BIIS North Sea Lobe 59 "Wykeham Stage" of Penny and Rawson (1969), when ice sheet marginal meltwater was forced to 60 flow into the lake along the Forge Valley. The lower 45 m shoreline was associated with an outwash 61 fan fed by the Mere Valley at Seamer and used to define the BIIS North Sea Lobe "Cayton-Speeton" 62 Stage of Penny and Rawson (1969). At this time the Flamborough Moraine (Farrington & Mitchell 63 1951) was thought to have been constructed. A gravel delta prograded from the Newtondale 64 channel (spillway?) at Pickering documents a former lake level as low as 30 m OD (Kendall 1902). 65 Later low stands such as this were controlled by the downcutting of the Kirkham Priory gorge 66 (spillway), which presently is as low as 20 m OD at its intake. Borehole records (Fig. 2) reveal that 67 parts of the former lake floor contain up to 12 m of fine-grained laminations lying over bedrock and 68 capped by up to 12 m of interbedded sequences of sands and gravels, with gravels becoming more 69 dominant towards the Wykeham and Flamborough moraines (Edwards 1978). The westward change 70 along the centre of the vale from sand and gravel dominated sequences at around borehole 52 to 71 sand and clay sequences (Fig. 2) reflects the increasingly ice distal depositional environment. 72 Borehole SE97NW31 at the Wykeham Moraine is representative of subaqueous ice-contact 73 sedimentation and borehole SE97NE11 at Sherburn is representative of the Sherburn Sands of Fox-74 Strangways (1880, 1881) and the deposits central to the findings of this paper.

75 Although the Wykeham Moraine has been widely regarded as the limit of the North Sea Lobe in the 76 Vale of Pickering during the Dimlington Stadial (Fig. 1a), Edwards (1978) and Foster (1985) have 77 proposed that the lobe penetrated further west up the Vale of Pickering; Edwards (1978) used an 78 apparent ice-marginal assemblage of till and glacifluvial ridges to propose Thornton-le-Dale as the 79 limit, whereas Foster (1985) suggested the limit was around the town of Pickering (Fig. 1). Foster's 80 (1985, 1987a, b) ice margin was reconstructed using glacial meltwater channels on the Wolds 81 escarpment and the occurrence and distribution of the Sherburn/Slingsby Sands (*sensu* Fox-82 Strangways 1880, 1881), which he interpreted as the deposits of an outwash train that stretches 83 from Flotmanby to Hovingham, the full length of the former Lake Pickering (Fig. 1a). However, any 84 variability in the sedimentary architecture and landform manifestation of the Sherburn/Slingsby

60

85 Sands that must have been created by sequential ice marginal recession has never been 86 documented.

87 The work of Candy et al. (2014) and Palmer et al. (2014) has led to significant improvements in our 88 knowledge of the postglacial evolution and archaeology of the east end of the Vale of Pickering. In 89 the complex depression between the Wykeham and Flamborough Head moraines a vestige of Glacial 90 Lake Pickering persisted as Palaeolake Flixton (Fig. 1a) the shoreline of which saw human occupation 91 at Starr Carr. Whilst this research reports the oldest sedimentation records for Glacial Lake 92 Pickering, it relates to the base of the sedimentary sequence that accumulated in the later stages of 93 lake damming at the Last Glacial-Interglacial Transition (LGIT).

94 Although the traditional palaeoglaciological reconstructions of Glacial Lake Pickering (Fig. 1b) have 95 endured (King 1965; Catt 1991; Clark et al. 2004; Evans et al. 2005), the landform and sedimentary 96 evidence proposed to support both minimum and maximum western full glacial limits for North Sea 97 Lobe advances (Fig. 1a) has not been fully scrutinized and never dated, especially in the centre and 98 at the western end of the vale. This paper reports on the first attempt to provide a chronology on 99 the sedimentary record pertaining to the operation of Glacial Lake Pickering during the Dimlington 100 Stadial (24 ka-11 ka cal BP), specifically on the sedimentation recorded on the south side of the vale 101 in the Sherburn Sands at East Heslerton (Fig. 1). The chronology presented for the East Heslerton 102 deposits forms part of a wider dating programme (BRITICE-CHRONO) aiming to constrain the rate 103 and timing of recession of the last British-Irish Ice Sheet.

# 104 **Study site and methods**

105 During excavations at the East Heslerton quarry of R. Cook and Son, extensive exposures have been 106 created through a large valley-side depositional sequence, locally known as the Sherburn Sands (Fig. 107 3; Fox-Strangways 1880, 1881). These deposits interdigitate with the Seamer Gravels at the eastern 108 end of the vale (Foster 1987a), a body of ice-proximal outwash associated with the Wykeham and 109 Flamborough moraines (Fig. 1a). To the west of Malton, Fox-Strangways (1880, 1881) proposed a 110 change in nomenclature to the Slingsby Sands in recognition of their finer grain size distribution. The 111 Sherburn Sands occur predominantly as an elongate strip lying below the Wolds escarpment and 112 skirting the south edge of the Vale of Pickering between the altitudes of c.  $60 - 27$  m OD and 113 mapped by the British Geological Survey (BGS) as a mixture of glacifluvial sands and gravels and 114 sands and gravels of unknown age and origin (Fig. 1a). Small pockets of Sherburn Sands are reported 115 by Foster (1987a) to lie on the Wolds scarp and in the southeasterly draining valleys of Warren Slack 116 and Cotton Dale on the dip slope. The area depicted by Foster (1987a) and the BGS as the Sherburn 117 Sands on the south side of the Vale of Pickering coincides with King's (1965) "scarp-foot bench" or 118 terrace of chalky gravel, which is depicted by her as lying below the uppermost Lake Pickering 119 shoreline at 225ft (68.5 m OD) and interpreted as the product of a postglacial solifluction terrace. 120 East of the Wykeham moraine, Foster (1987a) and the BGS depict the Sherburn Sands "strip" as 121 more indented and narrow (Fig. 1a).

122 At East Heslerton the bench or terrace of Sherburn Sands appears to dip northwards towards the 123 centre of the Vale of Pickering from 50 - 30m OD, although the northern edge is not particularly 124 pronounced; hence it is more like a dipping shelf than a bench. The Sherburn Sands that have been 125 exposed occur in the middle to outer edge of the shelf (Fig. 3a). Exposures through the stratigraphic 126 sequence at East Heslerton have been logged previously by Foster (1987a), whose results are

127 summarized along with our own below. Further new logging, together with sampling for optically 128 stimulated luminescence (OSL) dating, was undertaken in 2013 in the exposures through the thickest 129 part of the deposit, below the bench surface at 40 m OD, at the south end of the quarry (Fig. 3b). 130 Vertical profile logs were compiled following the procedures set out in Evans and Benn (2004) and 131 employing the lithofacies description and coding approach of Eyles et al. (1983).

132

### 133 **Luminescence Dating**

134 Samples for OSL dating were taken using opaque plastic tubes. In the laboratory, sediment 135 preparation followed standard procedures to isolate and clean the quartz fraction including wet 136 sieving to separate out the dominant 180-250 µm fraction (Bateman and Catt 1997, Porat et al., 137 2015). Beta dose rates are based on the concentration of U, Th and K measured using inductively 138 couple plasma mass spectroscopy (ICP-MS). Gamma dose rates are based on site measurement of 139 radionuclide activities carried out with an EG&G MicroNomad gamma spectrometer. Cosmic 140 radiation contributions were calculated based on average burial depths through time (Prescott and 141 Hutton, 1994). Appropriate conversion factors (Guerin et al., 2011) including attenuation by 142 moisture and grain size were used to calculate the final total dose rate (Table 1). Moisture values 143 were assumed at 20 ± 5% for samples well below the current water table (Shfd13054) and 10 ± 5% 144 for those currently close to but above the current water table.

145 Burial doses ( $D_e$ ) were measured at both the single grain (SG) and ultra-small multigrain aliquot (SA, 146 containing ~20 grains each) levels. All luminescence measurements were carried out on automated 147 Risø readers with blue (470  $\pm$  30 nm) LED and green (532 nm) Nd:YVO<sub>4</sub> laser stimulation for 148 measurement of SA and SG respectively. OSL was detected through a Hoya U-340 filter. All samples 149 were measured using the SAR protocol (Murray and Wintle, 2003) including an IR depletion ratio 150 step to test for feldspar contamination and a preheat of 200 °C for 10 s. The latter was derived 151 experimentally from a dose recovery preheat test. For each sample, 100-120 SA replicates and 4500- 152 5000 grains were measured. Derived  $D<sub>e</sub>$  estimates were accepted if the relative uncertainty on the 153 natural test-dose response was less than 20%, the recycling and the IR depletion ratio (including 154 uncertainties) were within 20% of unity and recuperation < 5%. The resulting data show that for 155 each sample the measured  $D<sub>e</sub>$  replicates were normally distributed with over-dispersion (OD) values 156 of 22-38% for SA and 32-44% for SG. Whilst these are above the 20% normally applied to 157 differentiate between well-bleached and incompletely bleached samples (Olley et al., 2004), this 158 may be due to extra over-dispersion associated with intrinsic factors (Jacobs et al., 2006; Thomsen et 159 al., 2005; Roberts et al., 2000). Dose recovery experiments carried out on artificially bleached and 160 irradiated material from sample Shfd13055, thereby only affected by intrinsic factors, returned OD 161 values of 11% for SA and 29% for SG. Therefore, the OD values observed on the natural dose 162 distributions, above the 20% threshold, are not necessarily derived from incomplete bleaching. In 163 addition, the characteristic lack of asymmetry observed in these natural distributions, similar to 164 those reported in previous studies (Alexanderson & Murray, 2007; Rownan et al., 2012) lead us to 165 the conclusion that the four samples studied here are well bleached. Therefore, the application of 166 Minimum Age or Internal External Consistency Criterion (IEU) models as per Medialdea et al. (2014) 167 was not required. Final D<sub>e</sub> values for age calculation purposes are therefore based on the Central 168 Age Model (CAM, Galbraith et al., 2005). An average of 9% of the accepted D<sub>e</sub> values have been

59 60 169 identified as outliers following the criterion of those out of 1.5 x InterQuartile Range (Tukey, 1977) 170 and excluded from the calculations. Results also show that estimated  $D<sub>e</sub>$  values from SG and SA are 171 consistent within 1σ and have similar distributions (Fig. 4) indicating that no resolution is lost when 172 using the very small (SA) multigrain aliquots. The SA data with its better signal to noise ratio and 173 lower uncertainties is therefore reported for age calculation purposes (Table 1).

174

# 175 **Sedimentology and stratigraphy of East Heslerton**

176 The earliest stratigraphic exposures at East Heslerton were logged by Foster (1985, 1987a), whose 177 summary vertical profile log is reproduced here as Figure 5. This exposure was located beneath what 178 was the *c.*40 m shelf surface at SE 918767 in 1985, in the east side of the pit. He identified three 179 main sedimentary units which we here classify as lithofacies (LF) 1-3. At the base of the sequence, 180 LF1 comprised around 3.5 m of interbedded and commonly internally upward-fining tabular units of 181 horizontal and trough cross-bedded, coarse to fine sands, also containing erratic coal and shale clast 182 lags, angular flint and chalk fragments and rare gritstone pebbles. Localized ripple drift laminations 183 recorded palaeocurrents towards the west and northwest. Internal structures included small (<0.50 184 m deep) ice wedge pseudomorphs but deeper structures extended through the sands from the 185 overlying deposits. The sands of LF1 were overlain by 2-3 m of sandy gravel to gravelly sand (LF2), 186 largely devoid of internal structures with the exception of distorted sand lenses. The gravel clasts in 187 LF2 were angular to sub-angular chalk (≤90%), flint and rare gritstone. The contact between LF1 and 188 2 was sharp and locally loaded. Importantly, towards the north of the pit, the gravels of LF2 became 189 sub-ordinate to the sand and pinched out into interdigitating lenses. Internal structures included 190 narrow (<0.20 m) but deeply penetrating sand-filled dykes, interpreted as ice wedge pseudomorphs, 191 which extended from the top of LF2 through underlying LF1. Wider ice wedge pseudomorphs (<1.0 192 m deep) were evident, together with cryoturbation structures, at the upper contact of LF2. The 193 sequence was capped by 2 m of LF3, a massive sand unit with scattered, pebble-sized clasts, which 194 infilled cryoturbation structures and ice wedge pseudomorphs in underlying LF2 and contained 195 localized pockets of sand "reworked by wind action" (i.e. presumably horizontally cross-laminated).

196 Exposures available in 2013 were also located directly beneath the c.40 m OD mid-shelf area but 250 197 metres west of Foster's (1987a) sampling sites (Fig. 3b). The sequence (Fig. 6) comprised three 198 sedimentary units, similar to those of Foster (1987a) and hence classified similarly here as LFs 1-3, 199 although the sedimentological details allowed a refinement of the lithofacies into sub-units. A 200 further upper LF 4 was also recognized.

201 At the base of the sequence in 2013, the basal fine to medium sands identified by Foster (1987a) and 202 classified here as LF1, displayed a significant proportion of rhythmically bedded sand and silt 203 laminations in its lower 1.5 m and is therefore classified LF1a. A sharp contact then separated the 204 rhythmites from an overlying 0.75 m of scour and fill features and climbing ripple drift (LF1b; Fig. 7a). 205 Bedforms were locally disturbed above the rhythmites by the development of small scale water 206 escape necks and associated angular autochthonous intraclasts, although the climbing ripples 207 recorded a palaeocurrent towards east-northeast and east.

208 A scoured and erosional contact separates LF1 from overlying LF2, which comprises three sub-units. 209 First, LF2a comprises planar bedded sands with rare isolated clasts, clast lags and scour fills (Fig. 7b). 210 It occurs both at the base and top of LF2. At the base it is 0.60-0.75 m thick and internal displays two 55 56 57 58

211 fining-upwards sequences wherein planar bedded sand grades upwards into horizontally bedded to 212 laminated or rippled sands. Palaeocurrents measured from this basal unit of LF2a record a range of 213 flow directions towards southwest through to east. Second, LF2b comprises 2.6 m of tabular units of 214 planar-bedded sands and sandy granule gravels separated by thin beds of horizontally-bedded to 215 laminated sand, locally draping undulating surfaces in the coarser sands and gravels (Fig. 7c). Third, 216 LF2c comprises 2.10 m of stacked tabular units of planar-bedded sands with scour fills and clast lags, 217 separated by horizontally-bedded to laminated sand and climbing ripple drift (Fig. 7d). The top of LF2 218 is characterized by 0.50 m of LF2a which has been penetrated by secondary, vertical wedge infills 219 descending from overlying deposits (Fig. 7d). Clast lithologies in LF2 were consistent with those 220 identified by Foster (1987a), and included a majority of angular to sub-angular chalk, with flint and 221 gritstone.

222 Towards the top of the 2013 sequence was predominantly ≤1.0 m of crudely horizontally bedded 223 but heavily disturbed (convoluted) sandy gravel with localized surface pockets of horizontally cross-224 laminated sand with isolated clasts, together regarded as the equivalent of Foster's (1987a) upper 225 unit (LF3). Where less disturbed, LF3 appears as shallow dipping interbeds of gravel clinoforms (small 226 scale foresets) and planar to horizontally bedded openwork gravel and sandy and matrix-supported 227 gravel (Fig. 7e). Palaeocurrents recorded in the gravel clinoforms indicate flow towards the north 228 and north-northwest. The sediments in the top 1-3 m of the sequence (LFs 2a, b & 3) are cross cut by 229 vertical wedges filled with a mix of sands and gravels, arranged in sub-vertical beds that are aligned 230 parallel with the wedge margins and overturned at the wedge top (Fig. 7d). We concur with Foster's 231 (1987a) conclusion that these characteristics are diagnostic of ice wedge pseudomorphs and that 232 together with the convolutions, which have characteristics indicative of cryoturbation structures 233 (e.g. Murton and Bateman 2007), they record the development of permafrost conditions sometime 234  $\parallel$  after the deposition of the sands and gravels.

235 Capping the 2013 sequence was a deposit not recognized previously by Foster (1987a) and classified 236 here as LF 4. It is a horizontally bedded-massive brown sand with rare isolated clasts and a sharp, 237 erosional basal contact. It lies stratigraphically above the ice wedges pseudomorphs of LF 3 and 238 represents the cold climate aeolian coversands as mapped by the BGS and found elsewhere in Vale 239 of York and North Lincolnshire (Bateman 1998).

240 **Depositional environment at East Heslerton and implications for Lake Pickering** 

241 Previous interpretations of the Sherburn Sands that outcrop at East Heslerton by Foster (1985, 242 1987a) proposed a glacial outwash origin, with the deposits grading distally into the Slingsby Sands 243 at the west end of the Vale of Pickering and interdigitating in the east with the glacier proximal 244 Seamer Gravels at the Wykeham and Flamborough moraines. Earlier notions that the deposits were 245 lacustrine in origin and associated with Lake Pickering sedimentation (Kendall 1902; Clark 1954; 246 Sheppard 1956) were dismissed by Foster (1987a), who explains the shelf-like, valley-side 247 distribution of the deposits as indicative of sedimentation along the left lateral margin of the glacier 248 lobe that penetrated the east end of the vale, presumably as a feature similar to a kame terrace but 249 grading to the falling base level of the proglacial lake to the west. Pockets of the Sherburn Sands on 250 the Wolds scarp and dip slope valleys document the earliest stages of such sedimentation, when the 251 ice margin overtopped the eastern escarpment summit and fed meltwater down valleys like Cotton 252 Dale. Foster (1987b) also identifies glacier sub-marginal chutes along the escarpment which contain

253 pockets of Sherburn Sands. Because the Sherburn Sands shelf-like deposit continues westwards and 254 backfills small escarpment valleys such as the Wintringham Beck valley, it has been used by Foster 255 (1987a) to justify the more westerly or maximum glacier margin reconstruction.

256 Two outstanding problems arise from this reconstruction of the Sherburn Sands depositional 257 environment: first, as acknowleged by Foster (1987a), the source of the Sherburn Sands is difficult to 258 reconcile with direct glacial meltwater drainage, as the materials are predominantly fine-grained and 259 contain few far-travelled erratics typical of those contained within the east coast tills (Madgett & 260 Catt 1966); second, there are no indicators of ice-contact sedimentation, which would be abundant 261 if the positioning of the Sherburn Sands bench was conditioned by the margin of a glacier lobe 262 extending as far west as Thornton-le-Dale, as proposed by Edwards (1978). However, the upper shelf 263 altitude of 40-60 m is compatible with Kendall's (1902) lower shoreline of 45 m OD and the altitude 264 of the outwash fan at Seamer used to define the Cayton-Speeton Stage (Penny & Rawson 1969). At 265 this stage the North Sea ice lobe, constructed the Flamborough Moraine (Farrington & Mitchell 266 1951) .

267 Consequently, some outstanding but not unrelated questions need to be addressed using the 268 sedimentology and geomorphology of the Vale of Pickering. First, why do the Sherburn Sands and 269 equivalent deposits coincide with and outcrop below the Lake Pickering shorelines (45-70 m OD) if 270 they are not lacustrine? Second, if they record glacier marginal recession, why are they devoid of ice-271 contact characteristics and why is their depositional shelf at a consistent altitudinal range inside and 272 outside the Wykeham Moraine? Third, if they represent glacial outwash, why are they concentrated 273 in a valley-side shelf which has no kame terrace characteristics and why do palaeocurrents record 274 former water flow in all directions except south? Fourth, as the East Heslerton deposits in particular 275 lie below 45 m and beyond the Wykeham Moraine (i.e. in an area formerly submerged by the 70 m 276 and 45 m lake stands) why are they not deltaic?

277 In light of the above, the sedimentology documented at East Heslerton is critical to the 278 understanding of the relationship between Glacial Lake Pickering and the North Sea Lobe of the BIIS. 279 The earliest deposits recorded in the exposures in LF1a are fine-grained rhythmites and hence 280 document subaqueous suspension sedimentation when the water level was above 34 m OD. As the 281 deposits lie at the margins of former Glacial Lake Pickering, where at least 12 m of laminated lake 282 sediments have been reported (Edwards 1978), and immediately proximal to the Wykeham 283 Moraine, which is associated with the upper Lake Pickering shoreline at 70 m OD, the simplest 284 interpretation of the LF1a rhythmites is that they represent deep water glacilacustrine 285 sedimentation.

286 Rhythmite deposition was terminated and sedimentation changed abruptly in LF1b, which contains 287 stacked, locally scoured and filled, sequences of sandy fluvial bedforms such as horizontal, planar 288 and trough cross-beds and climbing ripple drift separated by fine-grained laminations or waning 289 discharge deposits, all indicative of shallow water. Some minor clast lags or isolated clasts indicate 290 coarse-grained sediment starvation or a sediment source that was predominantly sandy but the 291 grain size range indicates pulsed sedimentation by a highly variable current. Foster (1987a) proposed 292 that the sand source for the Sherburn Sands in their entirety could have been wind-blown sand 293 sheets from the slopes of the Wolds. Indeed, the palaeocurrents derived from bedforms in LFs1b 294 and 2a indicate a radial pattern of water flow from the base of the Wolds escarpment as a low

295 angled subaerial fan. A local source for materials within the Sherburn Sands would help to explain 296 the paucity of far-travelled erratics and coarse gravels typical of proximal glacial outwash. However, 297 the wide range of grain size from fine to coarse sand precludes an entirely wind-blown origin. The 298 small ice wedge pseudomorphs in LF1 recorded by Foster (1987a) are syngenetic, indicating that 299 sediment progradation was on a subaerial surface in a periglacial climate, and hence post-dating the 300 lacustrine sedimentation recorded in LF1a. The localized disturbance of bedforms by water escape 301 necks and brittle failed blocks is most likely indicative of elevated porewater pressures brought 302 about by rapid fan sedimentation over freshly exposed lake bed deposits.

303 The sediments contained within LF2 record increased sediment discharges. This is manifest in the 304 scoured and loaded contact at the LF1b/2a boundary, the predominantly coarser, gravelly grain 305 sizes, greater number of partially gravel filled scours, and interbeds of planar-bedded sands and 306 granule gravels, as well as Foster's (1987a) massive sandy gravel (matrix-supported) facies. Pulsed 307 flows are locally recorded in fining-upward sequences in LF2a, but LF2 predominantly represents the 308 deposits of sandy to granule gravel bedforms in braided channels typical of the fluctuating 309 discharges of intermediate sandur systems (Miall 1985) but with clear evidence of matrix-supported 310 gravel deposition. Rapid distal fining of LF2 appears to be recorded by Foster (1987a) in his 311 interdigitating lenses of sand and increasingly subordinate gravel towards the north of the pit, 312 suggesting that sedimentation was on a shallow fan that rapidly dissipated water flow energy after 313 the feeder streams emerged from the Wolds scarp channels. The three sub-facies visible in LF2 in 314 2013 record a vertical sequence of first increasingly high discharges through LF2a to LF2b and then 315 falling discharges through LF2c to LF2a.

316 The sands and gravels that comprise LF3 at the top of the sequence have been largely post-317 depositionally modified by cryoturbation and ice wedge development (Foster 1987a). Localised 318 reworking by wind was also proposed by Foster (1987a). Some exposures in 2013 revealed that the 319 deposits were originally interbeds of gravel clinoforms and planar to horizontally bedded openwork 320 gravel and sandy, matrix-supported gravel and hence record a return to high discharges in a braided 321 stream network similar to that reflected in LF2 but with gravel bedforms accumulating in the style of 322 transverse bars (Miall 1992).

323 The largest ice wedge pseudomorphs at East Heslerton penetrate up to 3 m vertically, through LFs3 324 and 2a at the top of the sequence. Together with the cryoturbation structures, the ice wedge 325 pseudomorphs record a phase of permafrost conditions that post-dates the deposition of the 326 Sherburn Sands. These features are typical of many surface sands and gravels in eastern England, 327 with excellent examples in the same stratigraphic position at Sewerby and Barmston (Evans et al. 328 1995; Evans & Thomson 2010) and well developed polygons being visible on upland surfaces in the 329 region (Dimbleby 1952).

330 The dominance of angular to sub-angular clast forms within the gravels at East Heslerton is 331 indicative of the mechanical breakdown (frost shattering) of cold climate conditions but also of short 332 travel distances, the former being compatible with the development of intraformational ice wedges 333 in LF2. They also reflect low energy fluvial conditions and/or short travel distances and hence are not 334 likely to have been delivered to the site after significant transport through and then along the 335 margin of a glacier snout. This further supports the notion that the depo-centre represented at East 336 Heslerton is a scarp base fan fed by runoff from the Wolds. A fan interpretation, however, does not

337 explain the Sherburn Sands "shelf" located just below the altitude of the lower Lake Pickering 338 shoreline (45 m OD), unless a series of channels through the escarpment were used by runoff to 339 prograde sediments into the vale in a series of fans that coalesced over time and, at the last stages 340 of sediment production, aggraded to a base level below the 45 m shoreline. If deposited at the 341 margin of Lake Pickering, the Sherburn Sands were likely deposited in a scarp foot fan delta. The 342 occurrence of a small outcrop of rhythmites in LF1a is likely the stratigraphic equivalent of the lake 343 sediments previously reported from the former lake floor and hence the lake deposits appear to 344 continue under the Sherburn Sands. Additionally, the more gravel-rich sediments of LF2 interdigitate 345 with sands in a distal-fining architecture at East Heslerton (Foster 1987a). The paucity of lake 346 deposits in areas covered by the Sherburn Sands can be explained by their location within the limits 347 of the former Vale of Pickering ice lobe, so that fan progradation only started once the ice margin 348 began its recession eastwards. Moreover, the subaerial nature of LF2, as indicated by the fluvial 349 bedforms and intraformational ice wedge development at East Heslerton, indicates that lake water 350 levels had fallen to below 34 m OD by the time it was deposited. This must have taken place 351 sometime after the 45 m shoreline phase of the Cayton-Speeton Stage (Penny & Rawson 1969) and a 352 lower lake stand is recorded by the Pickering delta at 30 m OD (Kendall 1902), potentially recording 353 a later incision level at the intake of the Kirkham Priory spillway. However, the 45 m lake stand must 354 have impacted upon the Sherburn Sands because they extend up the Wolds to at least 60 m OD. 355 Lake waters most likely trimmed fans west of the Flamborough Moraine, East Heslerton being an 356 example, rejuvenating them with new base levels. This enabled these fans to continue carrying 357 sediments from the Wolds. Hence the combined influence of the 70 m, 45 m and 30 m lake stands 358 on sedimentation patterns gives rise to the 60 - 27 m OD shelf documented by King (1969) and 359 Foster (1987a).

# 360 **OSL dating of the East Heslerton stratigraphy**

361 Four OSL ages have been obtained from the East Heslerton stratigraphy (Table 1) and are located on 362 Figure 6a. The oldest age of 17.6 ± 1.0 ka (Shfd15054) comes from the LF1a glacilacustrine deposits 363 and therefore dates the sedimentation in Lake Pickering at the time the ice margin lay at or 364 immediately east of the Wykeham Moraine. If the LGM limit lies at the maximum western margin 365 proposed by Edwards (1978) and Foster (1985), this date relates to initial deglaciation of the Vale of 366 Pickering. Alternatively, if the LGM limit lies at the Wykeham Moraine as proposed by Kendall (1902) 367 the age of 17.6  $\pm$  1.0 ka relates to the development of a full glacial lake, although we do not know 368 the depth of water above the sample and hence it dates lake sedimentation any time after the 369 glacier margin stood at the Wykeham Moraine.

370 An age of 17.3 ± 1.0 ka (Shfd15055) from LF2b records fan aggradation and permafrost conditions 371 following the lowering of Lake Pickering, to somewhere below 34 m OD. Together with the 17.6  $\pm$  1.0 372 ka age on LF1b, this date indicates a drop in lake level sometime around 17.5 ± 1.0 ka and below the 373 45 m stand, and hence likely associated with the thinning of the North Sea Lobe and its recession 374 eastward from the Flamborough Moraine.

375 The reduced discharges and sediment grades recorded by LF2c are dated 15.8 ± 0.9 ka (Shfd15056). 376 As this deposit contains no evidence of obvious lacustrine sedimentation or shoreline reworking 377 despite lying below 45 m OD, it must relate to fan progradation to a lower lake stand and hence 378 postdate the Cayton-Speeton Stage and the production of the Flamborough Moraine, at which time

379 the 45 m lake developed. The general fining-upwards evident in LF2c to LF2a sometime after 15.8  $\pm$ 380 0.9 ka likely records the exhaustion of sediment and meltwater energy in the Wolds drainage 381 channels feeding the lake marginal fans. This cessation is coincident with the ameliorating climate 382 associated with the Windermere Interstadial (Allerod/Bolling; GI-1 14.7 to 12.9 ka, Lowe et al, 2008). 383 Permafrost degradation as reported elsewhere in lowland UK (e.g. Murton et al. 2003) would have 384 reduced overland flow on the Chalk Wolds and the peak discharge associated with spring nival 385 melting would have been reduced.

386 An age of  $10.1 \pm 0.7$  ka (Shfd15057) was obtained from the LF 4 sand unit above the cryoturbated 387 sandy gravels of LF3. The final phase of significant epigenetic ice wedge development occurred 388 between 15.8  $\pm$  0.9 ka and 10.1  $\pm$  0.7 ka indicating probably a Younger Dryas age for the periglacial 389 features. This further supports previous reports of significant lowland permafrost during the stade 390 (e.g. Bateman et al. 2014). Sediment from LFA4, dated to  $10.1 \pm 0.7$  ka, reflects reworking of 391 coversand into the early part of the Holocene before the Sherburn sands were stabilised by the 392 development of vegetation in the ameliorating climate of that time.

# 393 **Discussion**

394 The extensive outcrop through the Sherburn Sands at East Heslerton clearly records the aggradation 395 of a fan from the base of the Wolds escarpment after a drop in the level of Glacial Lake Pickering 396 sometime around 17.5 ka. Although Foster (1987a) previously rejected earlier notions that the 397 deposits were lacustrine, their occurrence at altitudes <40 m OD and therefore well below the 70 m 398 and 45 m lake stands associated respectively with when the BIIS was at the Wykeham and 399 Flamborough Moraines requires explanation. Although the sedimentology presented here based 400 upon new exposures does include evidence of lake sedimentation at ca. 17.6 ka in LF1b, we have no 401 evidence of water depth at that time. Above LF1b, the East Heslerton deposits predominantly record 402 subaerial fan aggradation. Because they lie below 45 m OD, they must have aggraded to a lake level 403 no higher than that altitude and most likely to the lowest Lake Pickering shoreline indicated by the 404 Pickering delta at 30 m OD.

405 We now attempt to answer the questions we posed above regarding the Sherburn Sands and 406 equivalent deposits. First, they coincide with and outcrop below the Lake Pickering shorelines (45-70 407 m OD) because they relate to alluvial fans receiving progressively larger volumes of debris and 408 adjusting to falling shallow lake levels. Hence, although they are not lacustrine in nature, they are 409 related to lake surface base level. Second, they likely do not directly record glacier marginal 410 recession and hence are devoid of ice-contact characteristics; their depositional shelf at a consistent 411 altitudinal range inside and outside the Wykeham Moraine is dictated by the accommodation space 412 afforded by the shallow lake margins and the dominant 45 and 70 m lake level altitudes at the time 413 of sediment delivery from the Wolds. Third, they only partially represent glacial outwash, with the 414 majority of sediment-laden streams emerging from the Wolds likely being fed by nival melt and 415 hence explaining their grain size, clast forms and lithologies; palaeocurrents are typical of alluvial 416 fans that coalesced and aggraded to falling lake levels between 70 and 30 m OD. Fourth, they are not 417 deltaic because of the lack of vertical accommodation space necessary for the development of 418 foreset beds in a shallow lake margin subject to falling water levels; this would be compounded by 419 localized incision and regrading of alluvial fans adjusting to falling lake levels. Interesting in this

**Page 11 of 31**

1

420 respect is the source of the abundant sand and gravel, which must reflect the activity of nival melt 421 on the Wolds escarpment.

422 The range of OSL dates on the East Heslerton stratigraphy provides chronological control on lake 423 marginal infilling by aggrading glacial and nival-fed fans on the distal side of the Wykeham Moraine. 424 The basal date of 17.6 ka could conceivably relate to lacustrine sedimentation (LF1a) as early as the 425 70 m lake stand in front of the Wykeham Moraine. However, work elsewhere has shown that the 426 North Sea Lobe of the BIIS had extended sufficiently south to have blocked the Vale of Pickering to 427 form Lake Pickering from ~20.5 ka onwards (Bateman et al. 2015). It is more likely therefore that the 428 East Heslerton basal age of 17.6 ± 1.0 ka reflects sedimentation within the later 45 m lake, a period 429 not to too dis-similar to that of the high stand of Lake Humber (16.6 ± 1.2 ka; Bateman et al. 2008) 430 into which Lake Pickering flowed. The fluvial rather than deltaic signature of overlying LF1b and LF2 431 indicates that fan construction at c.17.3 ka was grading to lower lake levels and hence must postdate 432 the 45 m level of Lake Pickering. Therefore, the construction of the Flamborough Moraine, which is 433 associated with the 45 m lake level, must have taken place prior to 17.3 ka. Indeed, although the 434 basal age of Shfd13054 is thought to directly date this 45 m lake, as only the upper sediments were 435 observed, this age more likely represents the final phase of the 45 m lake. The duration of the 45 m 436 lake, and therefore the Flamborough Moraine which impounded it, remains undated but with 17.6  $\pm$ 437 1.0 ka being the best minimum age at present. Further adjustment to the 30 m Lake level at ~17.3 ka 438 is coincident with the time when a regional scale BIIS North Sea Lobe is thought to have retreated a 439 short distance eastward (Bateman et al. 2015) and would have held Lakes Pickering and Humber at 440 similar levels whilst the Vale of York Lobe retreated northward (Fairburn and Bateman, 2015). With 441 the shrinkage and demise of Lake Humber, flow through the Kirkham Gap resumed lowering Lake 442 Pickering further (down to the 20 m OD level of the gap). This in combination with silting up led to 443 fragmentation and demise of Lake Pickering, leaving only Lake Flixton to survive into the Holocene 444 (Palmer et al., 2014).

445 The first direct chronology that Lake Pickering existed at least by ~17.6 ka (probably with an earlier 446 higher lake level) until sometime before 15.6 ka provides further information for the dynamics of the 447 BIIS North Sea Lobe. Given ice impoundment for the existence of the lake is required, the North Sea 448 Lobe must have been established and further south of the Vale of Pickering by this time range. It 449 must have also endured close to the present-day coastline for this time period. Livingstone et al. 450 (2012) showed extension of the North Sea ice lobe to the Vale of Pickering by 25 ka, establishment 451 of Lake Pickering by 22 ka and with it persisting and blocking the Vale of Pickering until 16 ka. Clark 452 et al (2012) showed ice approaching the Vale of Pickering at 23 ka but not reaching it until 19 ka and 453 gone by 16 ka. Given the ice had had to retreat before the lake could exist at East Heslerton, the new 454 data broadly agrees with the onset times of both studies but that the North Sea lobe retreated 455 northward later than either suggest. The latter point is borne out by new work by Bateman et al 456 (2015) who propose that ice arrived to the Vale of Pickering ~20.5 ka but did not retreat northward 457 until just before 15.1 ka. They also show two ice marginal advances (within 20.9 – 17.1 ka and 17.1 – 458 15.1 ka) on the Holderness coastline to the south. It is tempting to suggest that, based on the change 459 of Lake Pickering level to 30 m around 17.3 ka, ice blocking the Vale of Pickering also retreated at 460 this time. Whether the lake level was maintained by moraines or a lower ice dam further to the east 461 remains to be established.

# 462 **Conclusions**



# **Acknowledgements**

485 This work was supported by the UK Natural Environment Research Council consortium grant 486 BRITICE-CHRONO NE/J009768/1. Thanks to Cook and Son sand quarry at East Heslerton for excellent 487 access to the site. Rob Ashurst is acknowledged for his assistance in the preparation of the 488 luminescence samples.

### **References**

483 levels.

- 490 Agar, R., 1954. Glacial and post-glacial geology of Middlesborough and the Tees estuary. Proceedings 491 of the Yorkshire Geological Society, 29, 237– 253.
- 492 Bateman, M.D. 1998. The origin and age of coversand in north Lincolnshire, UK. Permafrost and 493 Periglacial Processes, 9, 313-325.
- 494 Bateman, M.D. and Catt, J.A. 1996. An absolute chronology for the raised beach deposits at 495 Sewerby, E. Yorkshire, UK. Journal of Quaternary Science, 11, 389-395.
- 496 Bateman, M.D., Buckland, P.C., Chase, B., Frederick, C.D., Gaunt, G.D. 2008. The Late- Devensian 497 proglacial Lake Humber: new evidence from littoral deposits at Ferrybridge, Yorkshire, 498 England. Boreas 37, 195–210.
	- 499 Bateman, M.D., Hitchens, S., Murton, J.B., Lee, J.R. and Gibbard, P.L. 2014. The evolution of 500 periglacial patterned ground in East Anglia, UK. Journal of Quaternary Science, 29, 301–317
- 501 Bateman, M.D., Evans D.J.A., Buckland, P.C., Friend, R.J., Hartmann D., Moxon, H., Connell R,
- 502 Fairburn W.A., Panagiotakopulu, E.,and Ashurst, R.A. (2015). The post Last Glacial Maximum 503 dynamics of the Vale of York and North Sea ice lobes of British and Irish Ice Sheet. 504 Proceedings of the Geological Association (in review).
	- 505 Boston, C.M., Evans, D.J.A., O´ Cofaigh, C., 2010. Styles of till deposition at the margin of the Last











159x149mm (300 x 300 DPI)

 $\bf8$  $\boldsymbol{9}$ 

 $\mathbf 1$  $\overline{2}$  $\overline{\mathbf{4}}$  $\overline{5}$  $\,6$  $\overline{7}$ 



95x81mm (300 x 300 DPI)





**BBB** 

# $\circ$  $\circ$

 $\frac{1}{\circ}$  .

 $\begin{bmatrix} 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \\ 0 & 0 \end{bmatrix}$  Gravel  $\begin{bmatrix} \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \end{bmatrix}$  Gravel  $\begin{bmatrix} \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \end{bmatrix}$  Gravel  $\begin{bmatrix} \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \\ \circ & \circ & \circ \end{bmatrix}$  Kimmeridge clay









254x190mm (96 x 96 DPI)

 $\mathbf{1}$ 

 $\begin{array}{c}\n23 \\
45\n\end{array}$ 

 $\,6$ 

 $\overline{\mathbf{7}}$  $\bf 8$  $\boldsymbol{9}$ 

 $\mathbf{1}$ 



390x260mm (300 x 300 DPI)









209x297mm (150 x 150 DPI)







200x362mm (300 x 300 DPI)



 $\mathbf 1$  $\overline{2}$  $\overline{\mathbf{4}}$ 

**http://mc.manuscriptcentral.com/jqs**





337x222mm (300 x 300 DPI)





190x254mm (96 x 96 DPI)



300x260mm (300 x 300 DPI)



347x190mm (300 x 300 DPI)





352x224mm (300 x 300 DPI)



390x162mm (300 x 300 DPI)

 $\mathbf 1$ 



254x190mm (96 x 96 DPI)