Contextual effect of wealth on independence: an examination through regional differences in China

- 1 Kosuke Takemura¹*, Takeshi Hamamura², Yanjun Guan³, Satoko Suzuki⁴
- ¹Faculty of Economics, Shiga University, Hikone, Japan
- 3 ²School of Psychology and Speech Pathology, Curtin University, Perth, WA, Australia
- 4 ³Business School, Durham University, Durham, United Kingdom
- ⁴Graduate School of Management, Kyoto University, Kyoto, Japan
- * Correspondence: Kosuke Takemura, Faculty of Economics, Shiga University, 1-1-1 Banba,
- 7 Hikone, Shiga 522-8522, Japan.
- 8 boz.takemura@gmail.com
- 9 Keywords: culture, independence, individualism, economic development, multilevel, contextual
- 10 **effect.**

11 Abstract

- 12 The current study disentangled two different effects of wealth on psychological tendency toward
- independence; one is an effect exerted at the individual-level (i.e., effect of being rich) and the other
- is a contextual effect (i.e., effect of being surrounded by rich individuals). Past research has found a
- stronger tendency toward independence among people in developed societies. This association has
- often been explained as a result of a greater amount of choices, and thus more opportunities to
- express individuality that wealth affords to individuals. In addition to this individual-level process,
- theories in cultural psychology imply that the wealth-independence link also reflects social
- processes—living in a rich society, regardless of one's own wealth, promotes independence
- 20 (contextual effect of wealth on independence). Through a large-scale survey in China, using
- 21 multilevel analyses, we found that wealth had both the individual-level effect and contextual effect
- on independence as well as related psychological tendencies (influence orientation and generalized
- trust), suggesting that individuals are more likely to be independent with greater personal wealth, and
- 24 when surrounded by wealthy others. Possible processes through which independence is promoted by
- living in a wealthy area are discussed.

1 Introduction

- Across human societies, individuals differ in their relative independence from, and interdependence
- within, social relationships (Hofstede, 1980; Markus & Kitayama, 1991; see also Henrich et al.,
- 29 2010). Independent (individualistic) tendency is characterized by individuals seeing themselves as
- 30 independent from others, which also relates to motivation to influence (rather than adjusting oneself
- 31 to) others (Morling et al., 2002) and willingness to interact with others outside of one's immediate
- social circles, and thus generalized trust of others (Allik & Realo, 2004; Hamamura, 2012). These
- 33 psychological tendencies give rise to behavioral patterns that in turn, collectively maintain social
- environment and reinforce psychological processes associated with independence (Leung & Cohen,
- 35 2011; Markus & Kitayama, 1991; Shweder, 1991; Yamagishi, 2011).

36 37 One of the best established correlates of independent tendency at the societal level is wealth. Previous cross-cultural research has found that people residing in rich societies are more likely to 38 show independent tendencies (Georgas et al., 2004; Greenfield et al., 2003; Grossmann & Varnum, 39 2015; Hofstede, 1980; Inglehart & Baker, 2000). For example, Hofstede (1980) reported a strong 40 correlation (r = .82) between Gross National Product per capita and individualism through a nation-41 42 level correlation analysis. Georgas et al. (2004) found that difference in individualism across 43 countries was best explained by economic differences among a range of eco-cultural variables, such 44 as religion and education. 45 46 However, the society-level correlation between wealth and independence found in previous studies 47 (e.g., Hofstede, 1980) may either reflect an effect of affluent societies promoting independent 48 tendencies or an effect of affluent individuals tending to be more independent or both of them. Stated 49 differently, the individual-level effect of wealth may give rise to the society-level pattern that Hofstede (1980) identified. 50 51 52 In fact, a number of theories have interpreted the wealth-independence link as reflecting the effects 53 associated with personal wealth. For example, it has been suggested that wealth promotes independence because "(a)ffluence implies the ability to 'do one's own thing" (Triandis et al., 1988, 54 p. 324) or "affluence creates choices and allows people to express their individuality by making 55 56 different choices" (Schimmack et al., 2005, p. 21). This type of explanation postulates that personal wealth facilitates greater independence through its effect in affording more choices to individuals. 57 58 Consistent with this theory, some research has demonstrated an association between individual 59 differences in socioeconomic status and independence (e.g., Grossmann & Varnum, 2010; 60 Hamamura et al., 2013; Kohn et al., 1990; Kraus & Keltner, 2009; Na et al., 2010; Stephens et al., 2007). 61 62 On the other hand, influential theories in cultural psychology seem to support the view that wealth 63 64 also has a unique effect on independence at the society-level. Theories of cultural psychology have emphasized roles of social processes, such as shared meaning systems (Kitayama & Uskul, 2011; 65 Markus & Kitayama, 1991; Snibbe & Markus, 2005), social norms (Gelfand et al., 2011), and shared 66 social contexts (Kraus et al., 2012), in shaping psychological processes. These social processes may 67 help explain the effect of wealth on independence beyond its effect operating at the level of 68 69 individuals. In other words, these theories predict the presence of a contextual effect, that wealth 70 exerts an effect on independence at society-level above and beyond its effect at individual-level. Depending on the relative strength of individual-level and society-level effect, the contextual effect 71 can take two forms (e.g., Tay et al., 2014). One is the case in which society-level effect is larger than 72 73 individual-level effect—societies' wealth has a stronger effect on people's independence than

predicted on the basis of their level of affluence. The other is the case in which society-level effect is smaller than individual-level effect—societies' wealth has a weaker effect on people's independence

than predicted on the basis of their affluence. Theories in cultural psychology seem to suggest the

presence of former type of contextual effect. Analytically, a contextual effect can be computed in a

multilevel model that simultaneously examines the effect of wealth on independence at the level of 78 79 individual (within-group effect) and society (between-group effect) and by taking their difference 80 (Raudenbush & Bryk, 2002). 81 82

In some areas of research, contextual effects have clearly been established (e.g., Christ et al., 2014;

- 83 Colleran et al., 2014; Henrich et al., 2005, 2010; Tay et al., 2014). For example, findings in Henrich 84
 - et al. (2005, 2010) suggested that social norms of anonymous interactions that take place at market
- place, when shared within community, tend to promote prosocial behavior towards an anonymous 85
- 86 other, above and beyond one's own experiences of market exchange. This work demonstrated that
- the role of a socially shared factor (the norms of anonymous interactions at market) in influencing 87
- individual behavior (prosocial behavior towards an anonymous other) beyond the individual-level 88
- 89 process (personal experience of market exchange).

90

- 91 In the current study, we predicted a significant individual-level association between wealth and
- 92 independence, replicating past research (e.g., Grossmann & Varnum, 2010; Hamamura et al., 2013;
- 93 Kohn et al., 1990; Kraus & Keltner, 2009; Na et al., 2010; Stephens et al., 2007). Additionally, we
- 94 examined wealth's contextual effect on independent tendency—an effect suggested by cultural
- 95 psychological theories articulating the role of social processes in shaping psychological processes
- (Gelfand et al., 2011; Kitayama & Uskul, 2011; Markus & Kitayama, 1991). 96

97

- 98 We examined the effect of wealth on independent tendency across provinces in China. This is an
- 99 excellent context for the current research because there are large regional variations within China in
- 100 regards to the distribution of wealth (Fleisher et al., 2014; Yang, 2002) and also with cultural
- 101 practices maintained through legal restrictions on inter-provincial migrations. Still, as the provinces
- are parts of the same single nation, major variables that usually confound cross-country comparisons 102
- are naturally ruled out (Varnum et al., 2010). 103

- The units of analysis in the current study were individual participants (Level 1) that are nested within 105
- 106 provinces (Level 2). Participants were recruited from all the provinces in mainland China, and they
- 107 provided information on their annual household income, in addition to responding to scales designed
- 108 to measure participants' tendency towards independence. One measure of independence was the
- 109 independent self-construal scale (Singelis, 1994). In addition to this direct measure, we assessed two
- 110 psychological tendencies conceptually associated with independence. One was orientation toward
- 111 influencing (rather than adjusting oneself to) surrounding social circumstances. As the independent
- 112 self is perceived as relatively immutable and consistent entity working within the context of a
- 113 mutable world (Heine, 2008), individuals with independent self-construal tend to engage in influence
- 114 rather than adjustment (Morling et al., 2002). The other was generalized trust, or trust toward others
- who are not closely connected to oneself (Yamagishi & Yamagishi, 1994). Previous studies (Allik & 115
- 116 Realo, 2004; Hamamura, 2012) found a positive association between independence and generalized
- 117 trust, suggesting that taking risk of trusting others outside of a close-knit community may be
- 118 sustained by viewing oneself as independent from others (but see also a finding of Yuki et al., 2005,

- showing that individualists sometimes show strong in-group bias; see Brewer & Chen, 2007, and
- Brewer & Yuki, 2007, for reviews). We thus explored if generalized trust would show similar
- 121 correlational patterns as independent self-construal.

122

- We performed multilevel analyses using group-mean centering. Hence, all the predictors at the
- individual-level were centered around respective provincial means. This method removes all inter-
- provincial differences and allows examinations of within-province (individual-level) effects and
- between-province (province-level) effects separately from each other (Enders & Tofighi, 2007). A
- 127 contextual effect is obtained by taking the difference between these two effects. The positive
- 128 contextual effect (province-level > individual-level effect) would indicate that wealth at the level of
- provinces has a stronger effect on people's independence than predicted on the basis of people's
- 130 affluence.

131

132

133

2 Materials and Methods

2.1 Participants

- Participants were recruited from all the provinces (including directly controlled municipalities as well
- as autonomous regions) in mainland China by a marketing research firm, Cross Marketing, Inc. Fifty
- individuals from each province took part in the study, except for Shanghai and Gansu, from which
- 137 100 people participated (the larger sample size from these locations is for the purpose of another
- research project in which the current study was part). The total number of our participants was 1,650,
- which is comparable with that of a previous study examining regional differences in China (Talhelm
- et al., 2014, N = 1,162). In all the provinces, the same recruiting methods were used (i.e., advertising
- on the internet, mass media, and face-to-face surveys). The sample sizes at both levels were
- determined prior to the data collection. To maximize the sample size at level 2 (province-level),
- which is essential for accurate estimations of the level-2 effects (Maas & Hox, 2005), we collected
- data from all the provinces in mainland China (i.e., n = 31). The number of participants from each
- province (n = 50 for most provinces) was determined based on results of simulations by Maas and
- Hox (2005) to ensure unbiased estimations in multilevel analyses. Participants' responses were
- 147 collected through an online survey (Table S1 in the Supplementary Material for sample
- characteristics).

149

150

2.2 Individual-level measures

- Participants worked on scales designed to measure independence and the related tendencies. The
- scales were the self-construal scale (Singelis, 1994), the circumplex scales of interpersonal values
- 153 (CSIV; Locke, 2000), and the generalized trust scale (Yamagishi & Yamagishi, 1994). All the scales
- were administered in Chinese. The consensus method was taken to ensure the validity of translations,
- and at least two independent translators checked the translations (see Table S1 for scale reliability
- and intra-class correlations of the measurements).

158 159 160 161	The self-construal scale consisted of 12 items for independent self-construal (e.g., "Being able to take care of myself is a primary concern for me") and 12 items for interdependent self-construal (e.g., "I will sacrifice my self-interest for the benefit of my group"). Responses were indicated on 7-point scales, with options ranging from 1 (strongly disagree) to 7 (strongly agree).
162	
163 164 165 166 167 168 169 170	The CSIV assessed influence-adjustment orientation. Participants were instructed to think about interpersonal situations (such as being with close friends, with strangers, at work, and at social gatherings), and indicate, for example, how important to them "that I have an impact on them" (influence) and "that I go along with what they want to do" (adjustment). Following the procedure used in previous studies (Miyamoto & Wilken, 2010; Tsai et al., 2007), four items were used to measure influence orientation, and five items were used to measure adjustment orientation. Responses were indicated on 5-point scales, with options ranging from 0 (not important to me) to 4 (extremely important to me).
171	
172 173 174	The third measurement, the generalized trust scale, included five items such as, " <i>Most people are basically honest</i> ." Responses were indicated on 7-point scales, with options ranging from 1 (<i>strongly disagree</i>) to 7 (<i>strongly agree</i>).
175	
176 177 178 179 180 181	After completing these psychological measures, participants provided information on their annual household income (open-ended format), which was log-transformed prior to analyses in order to correct the skew. They also indicated their gender, age, and education level. For education level, participants were asked to indicate their latest academic background from the list of options ranging from elementary school to graduate school (Ph.D. level). We used a dummy-coded variable of education (reference category = no college degree) in our analyses.
182 183 184 185 186	The institutional review board at Kyoto University (the primary investigator's (KT) home institution at the time of study) did not require review of low risk survey such as ours. As such, we did not seek an institutional approval. All aspects of the study were conducted in accordance with the ethical rules of the American Psychological Association. Participation was voluntary and consent was indicated by survey completion.
187	
188	2.3 Province-level measures
189 190 191 192 193 194	As an index of province-level wealth, we used provincial means of participants' annual household income (after log-transformed). We also obtained several province-level variables, and included them as covariates. This included population density (Vandello & Cohen, 1999) and inequality in the distribution of wealth (Fincher et al., 2008). We computed population density from population size (obtained from National Bureau of Statistics of China, 2011) divided by land area (obtained from the website of the State Council of the People's Republic of China ¹ on February 5, 2014). For an index

1 http://english.gov.cn/

-

- 195 of inequality, urban-rural income disparity (ratio of urban disposable income to rural net income, 196 obtained from All China Data Center² on February 6, 2014) was used. In addition, the amount of 197 direct foreign investments into provinces (obtained from All China Data Center on February 6, 2014) 198 was controlled since greater foreign investment may signal greater exposures to Western cultures 199 (Yang, 2002), and that may contribute to independent tendencies of residents. Percentage of in-200 migrants from other provinces (obtained from Duan et al., 2013) was also included in the models as 201 past research suggested that high residential mobility promotes independent tendencies (Oishi & 202 Kisling, 2009), and wealthy provinces presumably attract more migrants. Also, as four directly 203 controlled municipalities in China (i.e., Beijing, Chongging, Tianjin, and Shanghai) are generally 204 urbanized, we included a dummy-coded variable to represent a directly controlled municipality. 205 Finally, as an index of education at the province-level, we calculated the percentage of those who 206 obtained college degree or above from our participants' responses. We included this variable as a
- 207 covariate at the province-level. Descriptive statistics of the province-level variables are shown in 208 Table S2.

209

210

211

3 Results

3.1 Zero-order correlations

- As preliminary analyses, we examined zero-order correlations at the individual-level (Table 1) and at
- 213 the province-level (Table 2). As anticipated, log-transformed annual income (individual-level) was
- positively associated with independent self-construal (r = .22), influence orientation (r = .26), and
- 215 generalized trust (r = .12).

216

- Unexpectedly, interdependent self-construal (r = .12) and adjustment orientation (r = .16) were also
- 218 positively correlated with annual income, but to somewhat lesser degree when compared to the
- 219 counterpart subscale (i.e., independent self-construal for interdependent self-construal, and influence
- orientation for adjustment orientation). The unexpected positive correlations between annual income
- and the interdependence measures might be caused by response style such as acquiescence response
- style, which has been found to be strong in collectivistic societies (Schimmack et al., 2005). In fact,
- style, which has been found to be strong in concertvisite societies (Schimmack et al., 2003). In fact,
- 223 the counterpart subscales were positively correlated (r = .66 for independent and interdependent self-
- construals, r = .63 for influence and adjustment orientations), though past research suggests that
- independence and interdependence are two separate constructs (Oyserman et al., 2002). As such, in
- our main analyses using multilevel modeling, the counterpart subscale was controlled for. For
- example, independent self-construal was analyzed using the residual term of the regression analysis
- in which independent self-construal was predicted from interdependent self-construal. Similarly,
- 229 when we predicted influence, we controlled for adjustment by using the residual from the regression
- of influence on adjustment.

231

² http://chinadataonline.org

- 232 At the province-level (Table 2), provincial mean of logged annual household income was positively
- associated with independent self-construal (r = .60), influence (r = .62), and generalized trust (r = .60)
- 234 .41). Unexpectedly, it was also positively associated with adjustment but relatively weakly (r = .49).
- 235 Provincial income was also correlated with several province-level variables (e.g., population density,
- percentage of in-migrants). As these correlations among the province-level variables might be
- confounding the correlations between provincial income and the independence-related measures, in
- 238 the following analyses, we controlled for the effects of these province-level factors as well as the
- 239 individual-level factors (i.e., age, gender and education level). This is important in order to examine
- unique effect of wealth on the independent tendencies at the individual-level as well as the province-
- level using multilevel modeling. Among the province-level covariates, directly controlled
- 242 municipality, population density, and percentage of in-migrants—three variables presumably relating
- 243 to the degree of urbanization—were highly correlated with each other (rs = .43 to .67). To avoid
- 244 multicollinearity in the multilevel modeling, we created a single composite measure of urbanity by
- averaging them after standardization, and used it as a province-level covariate.

246

247

3.2 Multilevel analyses of independence

- 248 Multilevel analyses were conducted predicting independence and controlling for the individual- and
- province-level covariates (Table 3). We found that the within-province effect of annual income on
- independence was significant and positive. This finding confirm the wealth-independence association
- at the individual-level. Similarly, within-province effects of annual income were also found for
- influence orientation and generalized trust. The between-province effects of income were also found
- to be significantly positive on all the independence-related measures.

254

- 255 Importantly, the contextual effect, obtained by taking the difference of the between-province and
- 256 within-province effect, was positive in all cases. As illustrated in Figure 1, the regression line for the
- between-province effect of income on independent self-construal was steeper than the regression
- lines for the within-province effect of income, and this contextual effect (i.e., the difference between
- within-province and between-province effects) was positive and significantly different from 0.
- Similar patterns were found for influence and generalized trust, though the contextual effect on
- generalized trust was relatively weak and marginally significant (Table 3).
- In sum, we found the consistent patterns across all the independence-related tendencies. Annual
- 263 income had positive associations with independence and related tendencies above and beyond the
- 264 individual-level. Among participants with the same level of personal wealth, those in rich provinces
- were more likely to be independent, influence-oriented, and trustful of others, than those in less rich
- provinces.

267

268

3.3 Supplementary analysis: effect of wealth on interdependence

- We also examined effects of wealth on the interdependence-related tendencies by similar multilevel
- analyses (Table 4). As expected, after controlling for various possible confounding factors, the
- associations between wealth and the interdependent measures, which were partially observed in zero-

order correlation analyses, were no longer found. Annual income was not associated with

interdependent self-construal nor adjustment orientation neither at the individual-level nor province-

level. The diverging patterns of findings between independence and interdependence-related

275 tendencies are consistent with an observation in the literature that independent and interdependent

tendencies are separate dimensions with different correlates (Oyserman et al., 2002).

4 Discussion

Previous studies have found that individuals living in rich societies are inclined toward independence. The purpose of the current study was to separate the individual-level effect and contextual effect of wealth on independence, and to examine whether the wealth-independence link emerges through social processes above and beyond individual processes. We investigated regional differences in independence-related tendencies (independent self-construal, influence orientation, and generalized trust) across 31 provinces in China. The multilevel analyses confirmed the individual-level associations between wealth and independence-related tendencies. It was also revealed that income had contextual effect on independence-related tendencies, indicated by larger effects at the province-level than the individual-level. Thus, even if one is not rich, his or her independent

province-level than the individual-level. Thus, even if one is not rich, his or her included tendency is likely promoted through affluence of surrounding others.

Below, we discuss a question that should be addressed in future studies. Specifically, why does wealth of surrounding others promote one's independence? The first possibility is social transmission of psychological/behavioral tendencies from rich to non-rich individuals. It has been suggested that people tend to learn from prestigious others (e.g., Colleran et al., 2014). Rich (i.e., economically successful) individuals may be regarded as a model of social learning. Consequently, individuals living in rich provinces might have acquired independent tendency through social learning from rich people, who have acquired independent tendency based on their own richness through individual-level processes.

The second possibility is based on the social norms and institutions, markets in particular, that people create as a group. Markets may promote independent tendency by facilitating interactions among strangers (Greenfield et al., 2003; Henrich et al., 2010). At the individual-level, the extent to which an individual is integrated into markets (e.g., obtains resources from markets) may be correlated with the amount of money he or she has, as money affords means to obtain resources through market exchange. Consider a case of labor outsourcing, such as baby-sitting. One could either arrange childcare through their own social network (e.g., asking a friend or a relative) or through market, and rich individuals are more able to rely on the latter. At the society-level, presence of a large number of market-integrated individuals likely indicates the salience of social norms relevant to exchange with strangers, which in turn may promote independent tendency (Yuki & Takemura, 2013). Research supports this rationale. For example, members of herding communities, in comparison to farming communities, interact with strangers more (Uskul & Over, 2014) and have more independent tendency (Witkin & Berry, 1975). Similarly, Leung and Cohen (2011) argue that the presence of

313 314 315 316	soci find	we market is connected to a culturally shared notion that individual worth is inalienable (vs. ally conferred), which is an important aspect of independent culture (Heine, 2005). These ings imply that in provinces where many individuals go to market and use money obtain ources, norms that facilitate independent tendency are collectively created.
317		
318 319 320 321 322 323 324 325	indi see. wow rich and	third explanation is the role of choice that wealth affords at individual-level (e.g., Triandis et al., 8). While originally, this theory might have suggested that it is the amount of choices that an vidual <i>has</i> that matters, our findings suggest that what matters more is the amount of choices they Presumably, there are more shops, goods and services in the wealthier provinces, and individuals all perceive a greater range of options and possibilities for goods and services to select from in the provinces regardless of individuals' own richness. In turn, perceiving a wider range of options possibilities may motivate individuals to pursue personal success and achievement over repersonal harmony with close others.
326		
327 328 329 330 331	wea spec wou	um, the current study contributes to the literature by identifying the role of social processes in the lth-independence link. The current findings, in turn, shed light on the new question: what are the cific social mechanisms underlying the wealth-independence link? Further research on this issue ald be instrumental in advancing the understanding of the association between wealth and ependent psychological processes.
332		
333	5	Author contributions
334 335 336	KT.	authors contributed to the study design. Data collection and the data analysis were performed by KT and TH drafted the manuscript, and YG and SS provided critical revisions. All authors roved the final version of the manuscript for submission.
337		
338	6	Funding
339 340		authors disclosed receipt of the following financial support for the research and/or authorship of article: Graduate School of Management, Kyoto University (grant number: not applicable).
341		
342	7	Acknowledgments
343	The	authors thank Dr. Thomas Talhelm and Dr. Yukiko Uchida for their comments.
344		
345	8	References

- Allik, J., & Realo, A. (2004). Individualism-collectivism and social capital. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, *35*, 29-49.
- Brewer, M.B., & Chen, Y.-r. (2007). Where (who) are collectives in collectivism? Toward
- 349 conceptual clarification of individualism and collectivism. *Psychological Review*, *114*, 133-350 151.
- Brewer, M. B., & Yuki, M. (2007). Culture and social identity. In S. Kitayama, & D. Cohen (Eds.), *Handbook of cultural psychology* (pp. 307-322). New York: Guilford.
- Christ, O., Schmid, K., Lolliot, S., Swart, H., Stolle, D., Tausch, N., Al Ramiah, A., Wagner, U.,
- Vertovec, S., & Hewstone, M. (2014). Contextual effect of positive intergroup contact on
- 355 outgroup prejudice. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America*, 111, 3996-4000.
- Colleran, H., Jasienska, G., Nenko, I., Galbarczyk, A., & Mace, R. (2014). Community-level
 education accelerates the cultural evolution of fertility decline. *Proceedings of the Royal Society B: Biological Sciences*, 281, 20132732.
- Enders, C. K., & Tofighi, D. (2007). Centering predictor variables in cross-sectional multilevel models: A new look at an old issue. *Psychological Methods*, *12*, 121-138.
- Fleisher, B., Li, H., & Zhao, M. Q. (2008). Human capital, economic growth, and regional inequality in China. *Journal of Development Economics*, 92, 215-231.
- Gelfand, M.J., Raver, J.L., Nishii, L., Leslie, L.M., Lun, J., Lim, B.C., Duan, L., Almailach, A., Ang, S., Arnadottir, J., Aycan, Z., Boehnke, K., Boski, P., Cabecinhas, R., Chan, D., Chhokar, J.,
- D'Amato, A., Ferrer, M., Fischlmayr, I.C., Fischer, R., Fülöp, M., Georgas, J., Kashima, E.S.,
- Kashima, Y., Kim, K., Lempereur, A., Marquez, P., Othman, R., Overlaet, B.,
- Panagiotopoulou, P., Peltzer, K., Perez-Florizno, L.R., Ponomarenko, L., Realo, A., Schei, V.,
- Schmitt, M., Smith, P.B., Soomro, N., Szabo, E., Taveesin, N., Toyama, M., Van de Vliert,
- E., Vohra, N., Ward, C., & Yamaguchi, S. (2011). Differences between tight and loose cultures: A 33-nation study. *Science*, *332*, 1100-1104.
- Georgas, J., van de Vijver, F. J. R., & Berry, J. W. (2004). The ecocultural framework, ecosocial indices, and psychological variables in cross-cultural research. *Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology*, *35*, 74-96.
- Greenfield, P. M., Maynard, A. E., & Childs, C. P. (2003). Historical change, cultural learning, and cognitive representation in Zinacantec Maya children. *Cognitive Development*, *18*, 455-487.
- Grossmann, I., & Varnum, M.E.W. (2010). Social class, culture, and cognition. *Social Psychological* and Personality Science, 2, 181-189.
- Grossmann, I., & Varnum, M. E. W. (2015). Social structure, infectious diseases, disasters, secularism, and cultural change in America. *Psychological Science*, *26*, 311-324.
- Hamamura, T. (2012). Are cultures becoming individualistic? A cross-temporal comparison of individualism-collectivism in the U.S. and Japan. *Personality and Social Psychology Review*, 16, 3-24.
- Hamamura, T., Xu, Q., & Du, Y. (2013). Culture, social class, and independence-interdependence:

 The case of Chinese adolescents. *International Journal of Psychology*, 48, 344-351.

- Heine, S. J. (2005). Constructing good selves in Japan and North America. In R. M. Sorrentino, D.
- Cohen, J. M. Olson, and M. P. Zanna (Eds.), *Culture and social behavior: The tenth Ontario*Symposium (pp. 115-143). Hillsdale, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum.
- 389 Heine, S. J. (2008). *Cultural psychology*. New York: Norton.
- Henrich, J., Boyd, R., Bowles, S., Gintis, H., Fehr, E., Camerer, C., McElreath, R., Gurven, M., Hill,
- 391 K., Barr, A., Ensminger, J., Tracer, D., Marlow, F. W., Patton, J. Q., Alvard, M., Gil-White,
- F., & Henrich, N. S. (2005). 'Economic man' in cross-cultural perspective: Ethnography and
- experiments from 15 small-scale societies. *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, 28, 795-855.
- Henrich, J., Ensminger, J., McElreath, R., Barr, A., Barrett, C., Bolyanatz, A., Cardenas, J.C.,
- Gurven, M., Gwako, E., Henrich, N., Lesorogol, C., Marlowe, F., Tracer, D., & Ziker, J.
- 396 (2010). Markets, religion, community size, and the evolution of fairness and punishment.
- 397 *Science*, 327, 1480-1484.
- Henrich, J., Heine, S. J., & Norenzayan, A. (2010). The weirdest people in the world? *Behavioral and Brain Sciences*, *33*, 61-83.
- Hofstede, G. (1980). *Culture's consequences: International differences in work-related values.*Beverly Hills, CA: Sage.
- 402 Hvistendahl, M. (2013). The numbers game. *Science*, *340*, 1037-1039.
- Inglehart, R., & Baker, W. E. (2000). Modernization, cultural change, and the persistence of traditional values. *American Sociological Review*, *165*, 19-51.
- Kitayama, S., & Uskul, A. K. (2011). Culture, mind, and the brain: current evidence and future directions. *Annual Review of Psychology*, 62, 419-449.
- Kohn, M. L., Naoi, A., Schoenbach, C., Schooler, C., & Slomczynski, K. M. (1990). Position in the
 class structure and psychological functioning in the United States, Japan, and Poland.
 American Journal of Sociology, 95, 964-1008.
- Kraus, M. W., & Keltner, D. (2009). Signs of socioeconomic status: A thin-slicing approach.
 Psychological Science, 20, 99-106.
- Kraus, M. W., Piff, P. K., Mendoza-Denton, R., Rheinschmidt, M. L., & Keltner, D. (2012). Social class, solipsism, and contextualism: How the rich are different from the poor. *Psychological Review*, 119, 546-572.
- 415 Leung, A. K.-Y., & Cohen, D. (2011). Within- and between-culture variation: Individual differences 416 and the cultural logics of honor, face, and dignity cultures. *Journal of Personality and Social* 417 *Psychology*, 100, 507-526.
- Locke, K. (2000). Circumplex scales of interpersonal values: Reliability, validity, and applicability to interpersonal problems and personality disorders. *Journal of Personality Assessment*, 75, 249-267.
- 421 Maas, C. J. M., & Hox, J. J. (2005). Sufficient sample sizes for multilevel modeling. *Methodology*, *1*, 422 86-92.
- Markus, H. R. & Kitayama, S. (1991). Culture and the self: Implications for cognition, emotion, and motivation. *Psychological Review*, *98*, 224-253.

- 425 Morling, B., Kitayama, S., & Miyamoto, Y. (2002). Cultural practices emphasize influence in the
- 426 United States and adjustment in Japan. Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 28, 311-427 323.
- 428 Na, J., Grossmann, I., Varnum, M.E.W., Kitayama, S., Gonzalez, R., & Nisbett, R. (2010). Cultural
- 429 differences are not always reducible to individual differences. Proceedings of the National 430 Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 107, 6192-6197.
- 431 Oishi, S., & Kisling, J. (2009). The mutual constitution of residential mobility and individualism. In
- 432 R.S. Wyer, C-y. Chiu, & Y-y. Hong (Eds.), Understanding culture: Theory, research, and
- application (pp. 223-238). New York, NY: Psychology Press. 433
- 434 Oyserman, D., Coon, H. M., & Kemmelmeier, M. (2002). Rethinking individualism and collectivism: 435 Evaluation of theoretical assumptions and meta-analyses. Psychological Bulletin, 128, 3-72.
- 436 Raudenbush, S. W., & Bryk, A. S. (2002). Hierarchical linear models (2nd ed.). Newbury Park, CA: 437 Sage.
- 438 Schimmack, U., Oishi, S., & Diener, E. (2005). Individualism: A valid and important dimension of 439 cultural differences between nations. Personality and Social Psychology Review, 9, 17-31.
- Shweder, R. (1991). Cultural psychology: What is it? In R. A. Shweder (Ed.), *Thinking through* 440 441 cultures: Expeditions in cultural psychology (pp. 73-110). Cambridge, MA: Harvard 442 University Press.
- 443 Singelis, T. M. (1994). The measurement of independent and interdependent self-construals. 444 Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 20, 580-591.
- 445 Snibbe, A. C., & Markus, H. R. (2005). You can't always get what you want: Educational attainment, 446 agency, and choice. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 88, 703-720.
- 447 Stephens, N. M., Markus, H. R., & Townsend, S. S. M. (2007). Choice as an act of meaning: The 448 case of social class. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 93, 814-830.
- 449 Talhelm, T, Zhang, X., Oishi, S., Shimin, C., Duan, D., Lan, X., et al. (2014). Discovery of large-450 scale psychological differences within China explained by rice vs. wheat agriculture. Science, *344*, 603-608. 451
- 452 Tay, L., Morrison, M., & Diener, E. (2014). Living among the affluent: Boon or bane? *Psychological* 453 Science, 25, 1235-1241.
- 454 Triandis, H. C. (1995). Individualism & Collectivism. Boulder: Westview Press.
- 455 Triandis, H. C., Bontempo, R., Villareal, M. J., Asai, M., & Lucca, N. (1988). Individualism and 456 collectivism: Cross-cultural perspectives on self-ingroup relationships. *Journal of Personality* 457 and Social Psychology, 54, 323-338.
- Uskul, A., & Over, H. (2014). Responses to social exclusion in cultural context: Evidence from 458 459 farming and herding communities. Journal of Personality and Social Psychology, 106, 752-460
- Varnum, M. E. W., Grossmann, I., Kitayama, S., & Nisbett, R. E. (2010). The origin of cultural 461 462 differences in cognition: The social orientation hypothesis. Current Directions in
- 463 Psychological Science, 19, 9-13.
- 464 Witkin, H. A., & Berry, J. W. (1975). Psychological differentiation in cross-cultural perspective. 465 Journal of Cross-Cultural Psychology, 1, 5-87.

Xie, Y., & Zhou, X. (2014) Income inequality in today's China. Proceedings of the National 466 467 Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 111, 6928-6933. 468 Yamagishi, T. (2011). Micro-macro dynamics of the cultural construction of reality: A niche construction approach to culture. In M. J. Gelfand, C-y. Chiu & Y-y. Hong (Eds.), Advances 469 470 in culture and psychology (Vol.1, pp. 251-308). New York, NY: Oxford University Press. 471 Yamagishi, T., & Yamagishi, M. (1994). Trust and commitment in the United States and Japan. 472 Motivation and Emotion, 18, 129-166. 473 Yang, D. T. (2002). What has caused regional inequality in China? China Economic Review, 13, 331-474 334. 475 Yuki, M., Maddux, W.W., Brewer, M.B., & Takemura, K. (2005). Cross-cultural differences in 476 relationship- and group-based trust. Personality and Social Psychology Bulletin, 31, 48-62. 477 Yuki, M., & Takemura, K. (2013). Intergroup comparison and intragroup relationships: Group processes in the cultures of individualism and collectivism. In M. Yuki & M. B. Brewer 478 479 (Eds.), Frontiers of culture and psychology: Culture and group processes (pp. 38-65). New York, NY: Oxford University Press. 480 481 482

484 **9 Tables and Figures**

Table 1. Zero-order correlations between individual-level variables (Pearson's *r*)

		2)	3)	4)	5)	6)	7)	8)	9)
1)	Annual income (log-transformed)	01	.06**		.22***	.12***	.26***	.16***	.12***
2)	Gender (ref = male)		16***	.01	08**	06*	08***	11***	01
3)	Age			15***	.18***	.10***	.00	03	.13***
4)	Education (ref = no college degree)				.05*	.08***	.18***	.13***	.06*
5)	Independent self-construal					.66***	.54***	.41***	.42***
6)	Interdependent self-construal						.44***	.42***	.50***
7)	Influence							.63***	.31***
8)	Adjustment								.24***
9)	Generalized trust								

***p < .001 **p < .01 *p < .05

488 Table 2. Zero-order correlations at province-level (Pearson's *r*)

	2. 2010 order correlations at province	2)	3)	4)	5)	6)	7)	8)	9)	10)	11)	12)
1)	Provincial mean of logged annual household income			.66***	50**	.53**	.39*	.60***	.25	.62***	.49**	.41*
2)	Directly controlled municipality		.67***	.43*	34 [†]	.16	.44*	.22	.10	.20	.15	09
3)	Population density (person/km2)			.64***	47**	.38*	.38*	$.37^{*}$.17	$.33^{\dagger}$.24	.14
4)	Percentage of in-migrants				40*	$.37^{*}$.41*	.39*	.18	.29	.18	.21
5)	Ratio of rural net income to urban disposable income					49**	34 [†]	23	01	18	04	40*
6)	Direct foreign investments (1 million USD)						.23	.17	.10	.20	.16	.23
7)	Percentage of person with college degree or above							.29	.39*	.50**	.46**	.41*
8)	Independent self-construal								.71***	.81***	.72***	.59***
9)	Interdependent self-construal									.72***	.76***	57***
10)	Influence										.90***	67***
11)	Adjustment											.62***
12)	Generalized trust											

489 *** p < .001 ** p < .01 * p < .05 † p < .10

Table 3. Multilevel analyses of independent self-construal, influence, and generalized trust

	Independent self-construal ¹⁾		strual ¹⁾	Inf	Influence ²⁾			Generalized trust		
	Coef.	(SE)	p	Coef.	(SE)	p	Coef.	(SE)	p	
Annual income (log-transformed)							'			
Within-province effect	0.28	(0.04)	< .001	0.31	(0.05)	< .001	0.26	(0.08)	.001	
Between-province effect	0.93	(0.22)	< .001	1.18	(0.26)	< .001	1.00	(0.38)	.014	
Contextual effect	0.65	(0.22)	.008	0.87	(0.27)	.003	0.74	(0.39)	.066	
Individual-level covariates							'			
Gender (ref = male)	-0.04	(0.03)	.197	-0.03	(0.03)	.381	0.03	(0.05)	.550	
Age	0.01	(0.00)	< .001	0.00	(0.00)	.537	0.01	(0.00)	< .001	
Education (ref = no college degree)	-0.03	(0.03)	.238	0.11	(0.03)	.001	0.09	(0.05)	.076	
Province-level covariates							'			
Ratio of rural net income to urban disposable income	-0.04	(0.03)	.245	0.00	(0.04)	.930	-0.11	(0.06)	.065	
Direct foreign investments (10 thousand USD)	-0.0000001	(0.00)	.066	0.00	(0.00)	.215	0.00	(0.00)	.547	
Urbanity ³⁾	0.00	(0.03)	.968	-0.06	(0.03)	.087	-0.12	(0.04)	.009	
Percentage of person with college degree or above	-0.33	(0.18)	.087	0.53	(0.22)	.024	0.74	(0.32)	.028	
Model fit and summary							'			
Sample size	1644			1644			1644			
AIC	2580			3071			4501			
BIC	2644			3135			4566			
Log likelihood	-1278			-1523			-2238			

Note. Estimation method: maximum likelihood. All individual-level predictors centered around province-mean. Effects with p < .10 appear in bold print.

494

495

496

¹⁾ The residual was used from the regression of independent self-construal on interdependent self-construal. ²⁾ The residual was used from the regression of influence on adjustment. ³⁾ Urbanity is a composite measure of Directly controlled municipality (dummy-coded), Population density, and Percentage of in-migrants (averaged after standardization).

Table 4. Multilevel analyses of interdependent self-construal and adjustment

501 502

503

	Interdepende	nt self-cons	A	Adjustment ²⁾			
	Coef.	(SE)	p	Coef.	(SE)	p	
Annual income (log-transformed)							
Within-province effect	-0.06	(0.04)	.161	0.00	(0.05)	.946	
Between-province effect	-0.40	(0.24)	.115	-0.04	(0.23)	.867	
Contextual effect	-0.34	(0.25)	.187	-0.04	(0.23)	.880	
Individual-level covariates							
Gender (ref = male)	-0.01	(0.03)	.777	-0.09	(0.03)	.002	
Age	0.00	(0.00)	.785	0.00	(0.00)	.115	
Education (ref = no college degree)	0.08	(0.03)	.009	0.01	(0.03)	.719	
Province-level covariates							
Ratio of rural net income to urban disposable income	0.06	(0.04)	.121	0.04	(0.03)	.196	
Direct foreign investments (10 thousand USD)	0.00	(0.00)	.220	0.00	(0.00)	.567	
Urbanity ³⁾	-0.01	(0.03)	.734	-0.01	(0.03)	.812	
Percentage of person with college degree or above	0.59	(0.21)	.008	0.15	(0.19)	.428	
Model fit and summary							
Sample size	1644			1644			
AIC	2586			2846			
BIC	2651			2911			
Log likelihood	-1281			-1411			

Note. Estimation method: maximum likelihood. All individual-level predictors centered around province-mean. Effects with p < .10 appear in bold print.

¹⁾ The residual was used from the regression of interdependent self-construal on independent self-construal. ²⁾ The residual was used from the regression of adjustment on influence. ³⁾ Urbanity is a composite measure of Directly controlled municipality (dummy-coded), Population density, and Percentage of in-migrants (averaged after standardization).

Figure 1. Results of the multilevel analysis: Independent self-construal as a function of logged annual household income. In the graph, the three solid lines are regression lines for the effect of individual-level income on independent self-construal at three levels of provincial income (average household income at the province-level). The dotted line is regression line for the relation between province-level income and independent self-construal.

