**Spaces of Not Belonging: Inclusive Nationalism and Education in Scotland**

Marta Moskal, University of Glasgow

ABSTRACT

This study addresses the issue of the role of national identity-making through education and how this positions migrants in the national discourse in Scotland. The issue has been highlighted by the arrival of European Union migrants post-enlargement, whose children are being schooled in Scotland. The study discusses the tensions, particularly in relation to migrant populations, between the policy discourse of inclusive nationalism and emphasis on performance that promotes standardization processes and individual accountability. Giving particular attention to the language regulations and practices in education, this article notes the fact that language creates a barrier to the fair benefits of education for migrant populations. Rather than facilitating migrants' inclusion, language has become a vehicle for assimilating migrants into the dominant social and cultural norms of the host society. The study concludes by reflecting on the notion of inclusive citizenship and the implications of social responsibility to balance the economic benefits of people's mobility with cultural recognition and protection.

INTRODUCTION

Owing to transnational mobility, the ethnic and linguistic geography of Scotland is changing (Sim 2015). Meanwhile, the post-devolution Scotland is characterised by the emergence of distinctive visions of social citizenship (Keating et al. 2009), which carries cultural references that link to inclusive nationalism.

Political and economic integration within the European Union (EU) encourages the free movement of workers and their families among EU member countries. This increasing mobility of people between European countries has important implications for educators because it generates cultural and linguistic diversity within schools. Although schools in Europe have experienced this diversity for many years, it remains the subject of controversy (Ribolzi 2007, Heckmann 2008). Educational policies and practices regarding diversity vary widely between, and even within, countries. The case of Scotland within the UK provides a good example for analysis because migrant children and youth, especially from Poland, comprise the fastest growing segment of the Scottish school-age population (Pupils in Scotland Census 2006–2009, Pupil Census–Supplementary Data 2010–2014).

The transition of migrant children to new countries is difficult. Young migrants are often identified by education systems as a 'problem', which consumes valuable resources and which may pose a threat to the identity of the host society (Suárez-Orozco, Darbes, Dias and Sutin 2011). Language is the most evident of the many issues faced by migrant youth, including making friends, adapting to the new school and culture, dealing with loss and loneliness, racism or anti-immigration sentiments among others. (Reynolds 2008:5). Although language proficiency is regarded in many countries as the vehicle for the integration of migrant children and a necessary part of belonging (Roer-Strier and Strier 2006: 103), it is misleading to simply equate language acquisition with acculturation into a new society (Suarez-Orozco and Suarez-Orozco 2013). Fassetta (2014) points out that linguistic assimilation of migrants is the norm of host societies, despite recently observed official narratives and policies that emphasise the benefits of linguistic and cultural diversity (Piller 2012). Despite policy discourses increasingly referring to the

'enrichment' value of migrant children, they 'are positioned as a potential threat to the social cohesion that is required to enhance economic growth and development'. Within neo-liberal discourse, migrant children are said to 'add value' to the host society 'provided that they accommodate to the norms of that society interpreted through their levels of comparative achievement relative to native children', for example, in the Program for International Student Assessment - PISA scores (Devine 2013: 284). Thus, nation-states, languages and cultural values remain at the centre of demands for unilateral adaptation that are commonly made of young migrants and their families (Piller 2001). Valentine, Sporton, Bang Nielsen argue that migrants are often defined as 'out of place' (cf. Cresswell 1996) in their new environment, despite being multi-lingual because their particular individual linguistic competencies do not always fit the norms or expectations of the spaces they inhabit, and so their identities are ascribed by others as not belonging (2008: 377).

This study addresses the importance of language in the debates about citizenship and belonging because the nation-state has to rely on language for its functioning and political practice (Barnett 2004). Language is deeply implicated in individuals' ability to claim and maintain their rights, their affective connections with others and their sense of identification. As such linguistic minority groups need to have space to live their language (Valantine and Skelton 2007: 122).

A Scottish policy discourse analysis and qualitative study conducted among Polish migrants in Scotland discusses the context of the post-devolution policy in Scotland for the arrival of new migrant populations and the implications this has on schooling. It is evident that these processes have placed pressure on schools in multiple ways–from ensuring adequate provision to performance issues. This article

identifies some tensions between policy discourses of inclusive nationalism and standardisation and assimilation practices at local and institutional levels.

EU ENLARGEMENT AND NEW MIGRANTS IN SCOTLAND

The EU enlargements in 2004 and 2007 initiated major population movements to the UK. Poland, being the largest new member-state, has become the prime source of this intra-European mobility. Lack of experience of large-scale migration to Scotland along with the foregrounding and re-examination of what constitutes nationhood in a time of globalisation highlights the significance of this development. The population of Scotland has been largely homogenous and the largest migrant group, until very recently, came from England. However, this situation has changed very rapidly since 2004 and Scotland has experienced a marked increase in migrant arrivals following the new EU accessions. The most recent population census shows that Polish nationals appear to be one of the fastest growing migrant populations in Scotland; their number increased from 2,505 in 2001 to 55,231 in 2011 and reached an estimated 56,000 in 2012. The majority are well-settled, have lived in Scotland for at least five years and are planning to stay (Centre for Population Change Survey reported in Pietka-Nykaza and McGhee 2014).

As a result of increasing family relocation, young Polish migrants form one of the fastest growing percentages of the school-age population in Scotland. Their numbers have increased by approximately 1,000 every year since 2004. The number of pupils speaking Polish as a primary home language constituted the largest population in publicly-funded schools in Scotland after students who speak English at home, reaching over 11,500 in 2014 (see Table 1). Although cities like Glasgow and

Edinburgh remain the main centres of concentration for these migrants, rural areas are increasingly affected by migration as well.

Declining population figures drives Scotland to attract migrants using schools to mediate between migrants and their new society, thereby encouraging migrants to stay. Scotland is distinct from the UK in its policy rhetoric towards immigration. The current UK coalition Government has introduced a raft of restrictive immigration policies since it came to power in 2010, to reduce net migration to less than 100,000 by the time of the next election in 2015 (Packwood, Findlay and McCollum 2014). Although this government failed to meet its target reductions, it kept its strong anti-immigrant political agenda, increasingly driven by the UK Independence Party. The debate on immigration in the UK revolves entirely around the question of the economic value of attracting migrants (Phipps 2013).

In contrast, the Scottish Government has been attempting to attract and retain migrants through the promotion of a discourse of inclusion and opportunity (Scottish Government 2007). An example of this strategy is the Scottish Government's Fresh Talent Initiative, run from February 2004 to June 2008. The Fresh Talent Initiative aimed to promote Scotland as a place to live, study and work, redressing demographic trends by attracting hard-working and motivated people. Fresh Talent ended when the UK Government implemented its new point-based immigration scheme, with strong controls on unskilled migration and new citizenship requirements. However, the point system does not apply to mobility within the EU. Here, the devolution arrangements are important as the UK Government retains control over immigration including to the devolved UK polities. While the UK Government is focused on legislation and measures to restrict immigration from outside the EU, the Scottish Government prioritises increasing its migrant population. It set a new and ambitious population

target in late 2007, which requires Scotland's population growth to match the average for the EU by 2017 (Scottish Government 2007).

This was justified by reference to an ageing population, a declining labour force and the government's explicit desire to encourage cultural and ethnic diversity. Despite the recent financial downturn, migration is still viewed as a natural, inevitable and beneficial resource. As part of that process, we have seen that the Scottish Government is attempting to promote a discourse of nationalism that modernizes and renews nationalism as inclusive, negotiated and contributing positively to social democracy (Salmond 2007).

DISCOURSE OF INCLUSIVE NATIONALISM, EDUCATION AND SOCIAL CITIZENSHIP IN SCOTLAND

Following the Scottish National Party (SNP) election to minority government in 2007 and their subsequent re-election to majority government in 2011, the character of policy-making and policy rhetoric in Scotland has changed, leading to increasing policy divergence. Before 2007, there was considerable pressure for convergence with UK Government political rhetoric because from 1999 until May 2007, the Labour Party was in power both in Scotland and the UK. However, the new situation wherein Labour no longer holds power in Scotland has increased rhetoric of divergence in the key policy areas of immigration and nationalism (Arnott 2009; Keating 2005, 2009). A key factor is the differences in the constructions of 'nation' and 'nationalism', and their representation by the Scottish Government in the development of policy discourse–including education policy, which is fully devolved. Recognition of its separate character was established in the Act of Union of

1707.[1]The SNP is committed to the concept of an independent nation; it must translate the importance it places on this into a legislative program for education. However, it is also simultaneously attempting to project the image of a new, inclusive nationalism (MacAskill 2004, Mitchell 1996, SNP 2007) while positioning 'smarter Scotland' (Salmond 2007) within the wider context of transnational pressures for conformity and knowledge of economy agendas (Arnott and Ozga 2010).

The SNP Government has promoted a form of nationalism that blends political nationalism (self-determination) with social and cultural forms of nationalism (Murkens, Jones and Keating 2002). Education and learning policy provides a key arena for the formation and propagation of this blend, promoting nationalism as a process of identification and negotiation with a new, inclusive and forward-looking society (Arnott and Ozga 2010). Indeed, the SNP's espousal of a nationalism of 'place, not race' reflects its desire to promote nationalism as a process of identification and negotiation by many diverse populations, including recently arrived Polish migrants.

The UK government's strong commitment to education for the knowledge economy, and the accompanying repertoire of performance measurements, developed in England, place it 'beyond' Europe in a global competitive space (Ozga 2009). This UK agenda creates some challenges for the SNP Government in negotiating its agenda of modernized nationalism through education. Indeed, the SNP faces a set of problems in promoting inclusion through education, while simultaneously seeking modernization and competitive advantage via that same route.

Debates about citizenship constitute an important area of policy to examine in relation to our interest in the tensions between the individualistic, economic agenda of

---

[1] Immigration is still a policy area reserved to the UK government at Westminster.

performance measurements and the mobilization of modernized nationalism to support the inclusion of migrants. In the context of an SNP Government in Scotland seeking to develop policy for new migrants within the terms of the devolution settlement, there are interesting questions raised about how citizenship is defined, and what the points of reference are in a devolved system. UK citizenship is, of course, 'British', but this is a contested term in the post-devolution landscape (Greer and Mätzke 2009). It is further challenged by the growth of European citizenship, understood not as a legal entity but as a set of economic, cultural, scholarly and even political activities and processes that operate across national boundaries.

In this environment, the children of Polish migrant workers attending school in Scotland have no obvious point of reference or set of resources through which to negotiate identification with European, British and Scottish forms of citizenship, much less to combine them in a cohesive narrative. This study aims to demonstrate the complexity of using citizenship as a resource for inclusion, given the lack of clarity regarding the locus of citizenship. For the children of Polish migrants, this may include the EU as enabling mobility, the UK as permitting residency, and Scotland as the context of living and learning. These spaces offer a mixed repertoire of economic and cultural resources and are not necessarily amalgamated cohesively with one another.

Citizenship was prominently featured in the major Scottish curriculum review: 'A Curriculum for Excellence' (Scottish Executive 2004). The Curriculum for Excellence (CfE), which is the evolving 'modernized' curriculum for Scottish schools listing 'responsible citizenship' as one of its four key capacities that all children and youth should develop. Responsible citizens are defined as having 'respect for others' and as being able to 'develop knowledge and understanding of the world and

Scotland's place in it; understand different beliefs and cultures; make informed choices and decisions; evaluate environmental, scientific and technological issues; [and] develop informed, ethical views of complex issues' (CfE 2004: 12). Critics of CfE point to the individualized nature of these capacities and to the focus on community activity, rather than political institutions, as a site for their development. These critics see a risk of depoliticizing citizenship if it is not connected to the possibilities of collective political action and state initiative (Biesta 2008, 50). In this sense, citizenship is no longer conceived only in terms of a legal relation between the individual and the state but as a 'total relationship inflected by identity, social positioning, cultural assumptions, institutional practices and sense of belonging' (Werbner and Yuval-Davis 1999: 4 cited after Olsen et al.2014). In other words, the 'political' form of citizenship has evolved into a more diffuse 'social–cultural' form of citizenship based on valued and responsible membership of 'an everyday community of living and working' (Painter and Philo 1995: 115). Olson et al. (2014) noted that although recognizing people as citizens is emphasized, citizenship practice is still predominantly considered to be the outcome of particular educational trajectories (Biesta 2011). More informal designations of citizenship retain a dynamic of their own. Painter and Philo point out the claim that citizenship 'should mean the ability of individuals to occupy public spaces and [institutions like schools] in a manner that does not compromise their self-identity'. If people cannot be present in public spaces without feeling uncomfortable, victimised or 'out of place', then it must be questionable whether or not these people can be regarded as citizens at all, or, at least, whether they will regard themselves as full citizens on an equal footing with other people who seem perfectly 'at home' in public spaces' (Painter and Philo 1995: 115).

IDENTITY AND LANGUAGE ISSUES IN SCOTTISH EDUCATION SYSTEM

Education has played a central role in the shaping of national identity, to different degrees depending on the political history of the nation-state. For example, in the UK, it has been and still is a key factor in sustaining the identity of the 'stateless nation' of Scotland (McCrone 1992). Schooling systems sought to 'define, replicate and ensure their national distinctiveness' (Dale 2006, 29).

Scottish national discourse seems to be woven into the school statistical data. The Pupils in Scotland census is a good example[2]. Since the SNP Government has been in power, significant changes that reflect the political discourse on national identity were introduced to the school statistics. Two new categories, 'White–Scottish' and 'White–Other', were introduced to the Pupils questionnaire's ethnicity section in 2011, replacing the 'White–UK' category from the previous school censuses. 'White–Polish' also appeared as a new category for the first time in 2011 and remains a category in all following censuses to present (Table 2). Another new category was also introduced to the school statistics: ethnicity by national identity in Scotland featuring 'Scottish' as a dominant identification (Table 3).

The majority of pupils still self-declare as 'White–Scottish', but these numbers have slightly decreased in the past four years, whereas the number of pupils who self-declare as 'White–Other' has grown by over 14,000. Similarly, the number of pupils self-declared as 'White–Polish' substantially increased. Among these who self-declared as 'White–Polish', the majority stated that they are more Polish than Scottish

---

[2] The Pupils is an annual dataset collection that captures a wide variety of information on pupils in all publicly funded schools in Scotland. The data is collected from the parents/caregivers via questionnaires and retained in schools' information systems.

in terms of national identity. However, the statistics show a growing number of Polish ethnics who feel Scottish followed by British in terms of national identity (table 3).

School statistics on pupils' ethnicity, national identity and language(s) spoken at home became a medium through which these identifications could be demonstrated. Language came to constitute the main point of identification and major culture reference, for example, the number of pupils who declare Polish as a main home language is significantly greater than these who declare 'White–Polish' ethnicity. McCrone (2002) argues that language could be one of 'a complex set of cultural markers that best resembles a game of identification and identity construction'. He further argues that the capacity to mobilize and negotiate those markers will depend on the amount of cultural and social power the player has. The relationship between ethnicity and national identity play differently in different territories of Britain. Thus, there is no single 'national' debate about issues of nationality and ethnicity. While being 'English' (as opposed to British) as an identity seems to be less available to ethnic minorities, in Scotlandnationality and ethnicity interact differently with one other to the extent that some forms of hybrid identity are possible (McCrone 2002: 316).

By introducing data on main languages spoken at home in Scotland the Pupils census in 2006 provided insight into the frequency and usage of Scots, Gaelic and other minority languages spoken at home. It also shed light on the conflation and identification of heritage languages with the 'White–Scottish' ethnicity and Scottish national identity. The increase in numbers of these who declare Scots language spoken at home might serve as an example of the powerful recourse the language creates for mobilizing, empowering and strengthening collective identities and national consciousness (Desforges and Jones 2001).

According to the Pupils census, there has been a regular increase in the number of pupils using languages other than English at home, including, in statistical order (see Table 1): Polish, Urdu, Punjabi, Scots, Arabic, Mandarin, French, Russian, Lithuanian, Malayalam, Latvian, Bengali, Romanian, Spanish, Portuguese and Slovak, Gaelic and others. These were used by under 500 pupils in 2014 (Pupils in Scotland Census 2006–2009, Pupil Census–Supplementary Data 2010–2014).

The mobilisation of discourses on diversity in Scotland highlights the symbolic role of language in the policy context. Thus, 'Gaelic and Scots have become the dominant terms in the debate, with modern languages as the marked 'others' in the relationship and as proxies for diversity' (Phipps and Fassetta 2015).

A 2013 Scottish Government white paper, *Scotland's Future*, outlined the features of an independent Scotland and made several references to English, Gaelic, Scottish and British Sign Language as being 'Scotland's languages' (564). The inclusion of the Gaelic and Scots languages as significant characteristics of an independent Scotland provides insight into the role that language plays in the development of national policy and identity, particularly in a country recently devolved and seeking further power (Phipps and Fassetta 2015: 17).

However, there is a 'lack of strategic planning regarding languages in Scotland, where the work to sustain linguistic diversity beyond Gaelic is a grassroots endeavour. The 2013 Scottish Government white paper contains ample discussion of Scotland's open and welcoming attitude to migrants but makes no mention of the languages and cultures that migrants bring with them', nor to the role of modern languages in Scottish education' (Phipps and Fassetta (2015).

Language is important not only in terms of national identity but also in terms of citizenship. Associating language with the 'lived experience of citizenship'

(Valentine and Skelton (2007). The study now discusses the experiences of recent Polish migrants in Scotland.

NEW MIGRANT POPULATIONS, LANGUAGE AND SCHOOLING

Although policy discourse in Scotland focuses on attracting and retaining highly skilled migrants, there is a considerable gap between the rhetoric of attracting new migrants to settle in a fair and social democratic society and the low-skilled and poorly-paid jobs that the majority of new migrants hold. In the UK, similar to the other EU member states, which opened their labour markets, new European citizens permanently filled jobs which were previously filled on an irregular basis by temporary migrants (Ruspini 2008, 182). The lack of transferability of cultural capital, (e.g. formal qualifications, knowledge about the functioning of the educational and employment systems,) puts migrant families and their offspring in a very difficult position in societal competition. Often, migrant families experience downward social mobility as parents experience deskilling and underemployment (Moskal 2013).

The ability to speak English and communicate with a diverse range of people is particularly important, not only in getting better access to the host country labour market but also in gaining a fuller understanding of and confidence in the host society (Ryan et al. 2008, 687).

Lack of language competence is also a key focus for research on migrant children and schooling (Esser 2006, Glenn and de Jong 1996). Cummins (2000; cited by Suárez-Orozco et al. 2011, 313) argued that five to seven years are required for migrant language learners to develop academic language proficiency. This proficiency is necessary to compete with native speakers on standardized assessment

tests that are ubiquitous for international student assessments and comparisons, such as the Program for International Student Assessment (PISA) (Christiansen and Segeritz 2008). The results of the 2006 PISA study by the Organization for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD) in 57 different countries revealed that 'first-generation immigrant students in OECD countries lag on average more than 50 points behind their peers, which is roughly equivalent to one and a half years of schooling when considering the OECD average difference in performance between school years' (Christensen and Segeritz 2008, 13–14). Success or failure on these tests has important implications for access to higher education. Suarez-Orozco et al. (2011, 314) state that standardized assessment tests are not objective measures and knowledge of language and cultural schema can influence scores. The power of the league tables has direct consequences on positioning all children in schools 'as productive citizens', without considering 'the resources they can draw upon and which may be differently valued in schools' (Devine 2013).

In Scotland, mainstream education without home language teaching is the dominant type of education. The common view is that language programs that relentlessly focus on the integration of children into mainstream school life are essential. Instruction of migrant pupils in their mother tongue is conducted by voluntary and private initiatives because there is no provision for this within the education system. In this regard, schooling and educational policies discourage students from retaining their primary languages. If students retain their culture and language, they risk being perceived as less capable of identifying with the mainstream culture and learning the mainstream language of the society (Cummins 2000).

There is evidently a problem of linguistic inclusion in Scotland, note Phipps and Fassetta (2015). If a policy were to be enacted based on the size of the speaking

population, languages would become commodities, offered and chosen on the basis of the relative advantages they can offer in the global job market (Smala et al. 2013). Based on the same criteria of relevance and usefulness, other languages are perceived as 'non-languages' (Blommaert et al. 2005) and remain confined to the private sphere.

QUALITATIVE STUDY

The qualitative study portion of this study illustrates the migrant cultural adaptation as well as the language, identification and recognition problems[3] discussed above.

The population sample of this qualitative study included youth from three primary and three secondary schools in Scotland: three located in large urban centres (Edinburgh, Aberdeen), one semi-urban (North Lanarkshire) and two in rural towns (Highlands). Individual interviews were conducted with boys (n = 18) and girls (n = 23) aged 5–17. The children's opinions were counterbalanced by those of their parents (n = 24) and teachers (n = 18), who also took part in the research. All the migrant family members who participated in the study were first generation migrants — born in Poland and migrated to Scotland. They were all 'English as an Additional Language' (EAL) learners since Scotland was usually the first foreign country they had visited or resided. The length of time of residence in Scotland ranged from a few months to six years with the average duration being three years. All interviews with family members were conducted in Polish then transcribed and translated into English. All participants in the study had arrived in Scotland with limited or no

---

[3] The qualitative study had additional aims, see Moskal 2014, 2015.

English skills. The teachers interviewed were mostly EAL teachers (n = 10) and one teaching assistant and with additional input given by school managers (n = 7).

The language issue seems particularly important for children's adjustment to the classroom. Many families who participated in the study admitted that their children had experienced interruption of a school year as well as difficulty in transferring school records, in addition to lack of English language skills. They usually resumed their studies as soon as they arrived in Scotland.

There has been overwhelming pressure on Polish children and youth to learn the new language quickly and integrate into the new school system. Many pupils shared their experiences of feeling the pressure to speak English and to learn in English. This was often associated with anxiety and resistance. For example, Marc, an 8-year-old suburban primary school student, commented on how he adapted to his new school: 'I like the children and art classes and football. I like also math but I do not like English because English is very difficult'. Not all the youth coped well with this challenge and some dropped out before they began to adapt. 'There are now fourteen Polish pupils in my school. There were two more but they were expelled because they were absent too often', reported Julia, a 17-year-old suburban Roman Catholic school student.

Young respondents noted that achieving English fluency was very important. The youths' desire to improve their English was linked to an awareness of the lack of cultural currency or recognition of their native language in the classroom (Devine 2009). Olivia, a 15-year-old rural high school student, emphasized language learning as the most important part of her adaptation:

> I must learn English well. I already learnt a lot, I think. I am glad, there are no Polish pupils in my class, so I am learning faster. Although, I am befriending only with Polish people at the moment, I

try to make English friends, but it is difficult, as I do not communicate
as comfortable as they do.

One very important factor in the accommodation of increasing numbers of migrant students is the issue of resources. Teachers in our study raised concerns regarding the lack of specialist support in schools for assisting children who did not speak English as their first language. Some schools (mostly urban secondary schools) had developed specific language support programs for migrant pupils with teachers who had some training in EAL programming providing this support.

An EAL teacher at a city community high school pointed out that 'Bilingual assistants are rarely available at the continuous basis, more likely in the city schools than in the other areas'. 'Bilingual support is particularly helpful for the children in the very early stages of learning English and these were the groups we prioritised. Bilingual support from the language teaching point of view is not necessary for the language acquisition'.

The multilingual abilities of many students were rarely recognized. One EAL teacher at a city community high school admit*s,*

'We would like to help students to maintain and develop their first language because we know that this supports their English language acquisition. I am very much in favour to maintain children's bilingualism. The problem is that the opportunity for that is very limited. It is not the Scottish Government policy to actively support pupils' bilingualism'.

School managers and teachers who participated in the study expressed concern about the lack of appropriate in-service training for bilingual support. Rector, a secondary school student in the Scottish Highlands, told us,

> I think the schools accept their responsibility to integrate the new pupils. However, the council has to be in the position to allocate more resources to the school. We do not have enough staff, especially ELA staff and any other staff who could assist like the language assistants who could work as the interpreters at the initial stages.

These schools tended to rely on their teachers' abilities to improvise in this regard, as well as on Polish-speaking classroom assistants or other Polish-speaking children. Sometimes the presence of language support teachers resulted in paradoxical situations wherein mainstream classroom teachers failed to address the interests of migrant children believing that these would instead be handled by the language support personnel (Devine 2009).

The impact on the learning and teaching process for other pupils in these schools, whose interests may be marginalized, was described by Matt, 8 years old, who told us:

> In my school the teacher does not help us because in my school there is not enough places, so I and my cousin and four Scottish children we go to third class, (even though we are at the fourth) and the teacher concentrates to help these from the third class instead of us and we have to learn alone.

It was clear that an investment to cover the real costs of providing EAL support, especially with regard to the unplanned arrival of new migrants in a particular area, was needed. Some schools, in particular rural schools with few migrant students, do not have the resources for providing students with any specialized language support at all.

.

The dominant educational policies were not always attuned to the needs of migrant pupils. Still, the number of EAL learners in Scottish schools is growing. Foley et al. (2013) report that the needs of EAL learners across Scotland are not being met to a

sufficient degree, despite the fact that legislation is in place that requires local authorities and schools to ensure that all learners have appropriate access to the curriculum.

The challenge of additional language acquisition can serve to mask the other skills, knowledge and aspirations of young migrants. Many teachers reported that they had limited information on the background of their young migrant students. This lack of personal information can foster inadvertent prejudice and low expectations on the part of teachers. Some teachers admitted during the interview that they did not draw on the previous educational experience of migrant pupils, believing that this experience was limited.

Rector also shared with us,

> It is a major difficulty, at first to know what is the ability of the new pupil because of the limited language. This is an issue in particularly for some of our subject staff, for example Mathematics teachers who face the barrier to know what the pupils are capable of doing. This is an issue we should not sweep it under the carpet because we feel welcoming and we feel that we are integrating the pupils pretty well.

This situation was particularly difficult for those who arrived in the country as teenagers (12 years or older) who often failed to achieve high marks in the English exam system. Once they have reached the age of 16, these pupils fall under the auspices of post-compulsory adult education which provides vocational courses that are designed to prepare adults for entry into the workforce. Teenage students in 'English for Speakers of Other Languages' (ESOL) programs are enrolled in courses to improve their language levels which must be done before they can proceed to vocational training. This strategy to place youth, who have not completed their general education, into general ESOL classes followed by an adult curriculum, has been highly controversial (Cook 2008).

Margaret, a 42-year-old mother of a 15-year-old Tom, described her difficulties with understanding school assessments and policies:

> My son was enrolled to secondary four then he eventually had to go to secondary five to continue education. However, now the head teacher decided that he should rather go to the college. So, he waits for a college now to start after his 16th birthday in January next year [it was May at the time of interview]. He will attend English classes at the college twice a week before January. I do not find right to have school only twice a week with one subject–what 15 years old will do with the rest of his time. I am very disappointed because he is left without any support and he is still a child.

The case of Tom, who was not admitted to the high school exams (General Certificate of Secondary Education – GCSE) to continue education and was instead redirected to a vocational path, suggests that the school was more concerned with its general performance in the league tables than addressing the needs of the students.

Academic engagement and achievement were strengthened by supportive relationships; migrant students expressed a motivation to learn for the sake of their families whom they often understood to have made sacrifices so that they might have better opportunities (Suarez-Orozco et al. 2008).

For example, Adam, age 13, expressed the sense of responsibility he felt toward his family:

> The important things for me are to help my family, so I should help my family, cooperation with the colleges here to cope with the language, I mean the Scottish language and the English language which is important when we need to go somewhere outside of Scotland.

The study also accounts for the ways in which migrant children portray Scottish culture. McGonigal, J. and Arizpe, E. (2007) suggested that migrant and Scottish

children could be influenced by negative stereotypes of Scottish behaviour affected by media, by parental view and by personal experience.

For example, Adam (13-year-old male) reports:

I am learning English faster than I thought I would be and I am very glad about the learning the language. The school is easy and I like to go to school here. I like also a new Polish friend who came to the same school after me. I do not like the people here, these Scottish girls I do not like in particular, I talk sincerely now, and they are very rude. The children are aggressive here and unpredictable. They often tell unpleasant things to me like 'Polish bastard', 'Fucking Pole'.

Concern for the education of their children was cited as an important factor for parents when they were making the decision of whether or not to remain in Scotland. Janet, a 17-year-old girl at a suburban Catholic high school, described how concerns about education for her and her siblings influenced her parents' decision to migrate: 'Maybe, when I will be older I would come back to Poland. My parents are waiting until me and my siblings finish schools here, and then they want to come back to Poland. They leave us the choice when we would like to stay as adults'.

Communication with the school where their children were enrolled was difficult for parents, who often had poor English language skills. They were often unaware of parents' events or issues affecting their children's schooling. They expressed uncertainty about addressing their children's problems at school. For example, Mary, a 43-year-old mother of two daughters who had attended an urban school in Scotland for one year, told us,

'I do have a great barrier to speak English. I do understand most of the things but I cannot talk well and I feel disabled. In Poland I could say something to other parents coming to school e.g. what I do not like and that their children are bullying mine, etc. My daughters were bullied at the beginning of their schooling here and I could not do anything'.

While some schools were able to provide interpreters for parents who lacked English skills, others did not have the necessary resources to offer this service. Frequently, the parents themselves had to locate someone to assist them in communicating with the school. Ewelina, the mother of a 9-year-old boy stated, 'I usually bring somebody I know with me when I go to school to be able to communicate with the head teacher and to avoid the situation that I do not know what has been said'. In a similar context, Valantine and Skelton (2007) acknowledge that providing an interpreter or making other such special provisions for people who lack the proficiency to use the majority or dominant language can enable individuals to communicate with public institutions thereby improving their access to benefits and rights to which they are entitled. Although, the 'norm-and-accommodation model' (Kymlicka and Patten 2003) may facilitate communication, it does not give speakers of minority languages more profound rights in terms of the recognition of their cultural identities. This means recognising the cultural identity of those who use the minority language within public institutions. This is crucial because users of minority languages believe that they not only a right to maintain their language but also a duty to do so for the preservation of their culture and identity (Valentine and Skelton 2007: 137).

The majority of parents taking part in this study were aware of the importance of the English language for their children's education and future, yet did not wish for their children to abandon their Polish identity and language. For example, Joanna, 35-year-old mother of two school children in a semi-urban area, stated,

> We found out soon after arrival that there is a Polish Saturday school open in the area and our children could go there. We want our children to remember Polish language and the country they come from. This is also important in respect to the grandparents, as the children should be able to communicate with them and to know our culture and history.

Polish migrant children and families might initiate or be motivated to join Saturday schools as they might look for a group who share the same views or experiences. Migrant communities develop around practices such as language building solidarity, giving meaning to particular spaces and impacting on individuals' identities (cf. Valentine and Skelton 2007). In such ways it is apparent that language, space and identities are being constantly and mutually constituted (Valentine et al. 2008: 377).


CONCLUSION

Education is an area of policy which has been used to promote national identity. Meanwhile, the education policies in Europe and in the devolved systems of the UK currently dominate with their performance agendas which privilege economic rather than social goals. The focus on performance promotes standardization processes and individual accountability. The SNP Government is pro-European; it needs to define itself as distinct from the UK and to reinforce that distinctiveness by referencing embedded assumptions about education as an area of provision that helps to define national identity in public and egalitarian ways. Simultaneously, the SNP must engage with modernising knowledge economy agendas. Therefore, it needs to reference selected cultural resources while pursuing economic objectives. This combination puts the onus on the families of migrant children and their capacity to choose and invest in their children's successful performance as an indicator of social inclusion.

Scotland's education policy focuses on the community, not the nation, as the locus of citizenship practices, and on individual practices of responsibility rather than collective civic entitlements and recognition.

This study demonstrates that the idea of a culturally neutral state cannot be achieved (Young 2008) and minority group rights such as language assistance and other subsidies to help migrants adapt to the host society are 'tolerance rights' of protections afforded to individuals (Kloss 1971). Valentine and Skelton (2007:137) highlight that most nation states are reluctant to recognise bilingualism or multilingualism as rights regarding them instead as pragmatic accommodations (Kymlicka and Patten 2003). This is because for a state to officially recognise a language it must also acknowledge and accept that it is a multi-cultural state, thereby recognizing that the state is not only the possession of the dominant group but also belongs equally to all citizens (Kymlicka 2003). This in turn requires a state to examine public policies and institutions for discrimination and address the way that different linguistic and cultural groups relate to the state. Thus, Kymlicka (2003) argues that a truly multi-cultural state must accept that 'individuals should be able to access state institutions and act as full and equal citizens without having to deny their own identities'.

Inclusive citizenship 'recognizes migrants' multiple attachments to specific traditions, values, languages and other cultural practices; furthermore, fosters plural ways of belonging' (Guo 2010: 164). Therefore, it offers 'promotion oriented rights' for individuals' particular language and cultural use in public spaces (Kloss 1971).

The empirical analysis presented in this article argues that language may constitute a barrier to the equitable benefits of education and that processes of language acquisition have a broader impact on the everyday lives and identities of young migrants and their families. Education policy and school practices have not been sufficient to integrate difference and diversity into educational environments in Scotland. Schools do not practice bicultural upbringing and are not aimed at

maintenance of ethnic practices and the formation of bilingualism. There is a need to reconsider education policy and practices in Scotland in light of the contemporary realities of migration and intra-European mobility. English is acquired most successfully when a child's first language has been allowed to develop alongside it (Baker 2000, Cummins 2000, Skutnabb-Kangas 2000). Valentine et al (2008) suggested that this might include the provision of more opportunities and incentives for schools to broaden the curriculum to incorporate more modern languages teaching — recognizing the increasingly diverse range of linguistic needs and competencies of their pupils and parents/families thereby promoting multilingualism. The issues of language, identity and social change in Scotland should be discussed in schools. This will benefit both native Scottish and immigrant pupils 'who experience disjuncture between the language codes of home/playground and classroom/literacy' (McGonigal and Arizpe 2007). By fostering a more diverse range of language practices – as part of wider social and economic processes of inclusive citizenship – a more progressive sense of national identity and belonging might also be produced. This relates to Scotland's education discourse to develop and foster 'confident individuals', 'responsible citizens' and 'effective contributors' (Curriculum for Excellence 2004).

Note

The paper does not use the participants' real names. The names used are pseudonyms.

REFERENCES

Arnott, M. (2009) Policy Making & the 'Nation' under the SNP Government: Interdependencies & Interrelationships in Post Devolution Territorial Governance paper to Education and Nationalism: The Discourse of Education Policy in Scotland Seminar CES, University of Edinburgh 24th June.

Arnott, M. and Ozga J. (2010) Education and Nationalism: the discourse of education policy in Scotland *Discourse* 31(3 ) 335-350

Baker, C. 2000. A parents' and teachers' Guide to Bilingualism. Clevedon,

England: Multilingual Matters.

Biesta, G. J. J. (2008) What kind of citizen? What kind of democracy? Citizenship education and the Scottish Curriculum for Excellence. Scottish Educational Review 40(2): 38-52.

Biesta, G. J. J. 2011. *Learning Democracy in School and Society: Education, Learning and the Politics of Citizenship*. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.

Blommaert, J. Collins, J, Slembrouck, S. (2005) Spaces of Multilingualism, Language and Communication, 25(3): 197-216.

Christensen G, Segeritz M. (2008) An international perspective on student achievement, In Morehouse C. Immigrant Students Can Succeed: Lessons from Around the Globe. Carl Bertelsmann Prize Gütersloh, Germ.: Verl. Bertelsmann-Stiftung: 11–36.

Cook, M. (2008) What We Might Become: The Lives, Aspirations, and Education of Young Migrants in the London Area, Journal of Language, Identity & Education 7(1): 22-40.

Cresswell, T. (1996) In place/out of place: geography, ideology and transgression. University of Minnesota Press, London.

Cummins, J. (2000) Language, power, and pedagogy. Bilingual children in the crossfire, Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.

Dale, R. 2006. Policy relationships between supranational and national scales: Imposition/resistance or parallel universes?. *Research in Educational Sciences*, 24: 27–52.

Desforges, l. and Jones, R. (2001) Geographies of languages/languages of geography. Social and Cultural Geography, 2(3): 261–264.

Devine, D (2013) Value/ing children differently? Migrant children in education .*Children and Society*, 27 (4): 282-294.

Devine, D. (2009) 'Mobilising capitals? Migrant children's negotiation of their everyday lives in school', British Journal of Sociology of Education, 30:5, 521- 535.

Esser, H. (2006) Migration, Language and Integration. AKI Research Review 4. Wissenschaftszentrum Berlin, www.wz-berlin.de

Fassetta, G. (2014) The social and symbolic aspects of languages in the narratives of young (prospective) migrants, Languages and Intercultural Communication, 14(3): 332-338.

Foley, Y. Sangster, P. and and  Anderson, Ch. (2013) Examining EAL policy and practice in mainstream schools, Language and Education, 27:3, 191-206.

Glenn, C.L. and de Jong, E.J. (1996) Educating Immigrant Children. Ne York and London, Garland.

Greer S.L (2009) 'Ever Closer Union: devolution, the European Union and Social Citizenship Rights' in Greer S.L. (ed) Devolution and Social Citizenship in the UK (175-195) Bristol, The Policy Press.

Greer S and Märzke M (2009) Introduction: devolution and citizenship rights' in Greer S.L. (Ed) Devolution and Social Citizenship in the UK, Bristol, The Policy Press.

Guo, S. (2010) Toward recognitive justice: emerging trends and challenges in transnational migration and lifelong learning, International Journal of Lifelong Education, 29:2, 149-167.

Heckmann, F. (2008) Education and Migration – Strategies for Integrating Migrant Children in European Schools and Societies. Report submitted to the European Commission by the NESSE network of experts. http://www.nesse.fr/

nesse/nesse_top/tasks.

Keating, M. (2005) *Government of Scotland: Public Policy After Devolution* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)

Keating, M (2009) 'Rescaling Welfare: Devolution and Social Citizenship in the United Kingdom' paper to IPPR Seminar on Devolution and Public Policy, Edinburgh 15th October.

Keating, A., Hinderliter Ortloff, D. and Philippou, S. (2009) Citizenship education curricula: Changes and challenges presented by global and European integration, Specia Issue Journal of Curriculum Studies 41(2): 145-158.

Kloss, H. (1971) Language rights of immigrant groups. International Migration Review, 5: 250–268.

Kymlicka, W. (2003) Multicultural states and intercultural citizens. Theory and Research in Education, 1: 147–169.

Kymlicka, W. and Patten, A. (2003) Language rights and political theory, Annual Review of Applied Linguistics, 23: 3–21.

Lynch, P. (2002) SNP: The History of the Scottish National Party (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press)

MacAskill, K. (2004) Building A Nation: Post Devolution Nationalism in Scotland, Edinburgh: Luath Press Ltd.

McCrone, D. (1992) Understanding Scotland: A Sociology of a Stateless Nation, London: Routledge.

McCrone, D. (2002) 'Who do you say you are?', *Ethnicities*, 2 (3), 301-20. McGonigal J., Arizpe E. (2007). *Learning to Read a New Culture: How Immigrant Children and Asylum Seeking Children Experience Scottish Identity Through Classroom Books*. Edinburgh: Scottish Government.

Mitchell, J. (1996) Strategies for Self Government, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

Mitchell, K. (2006) 'Neo-Liberal Governmentality in the European Union: education, training and technologies of citizenship' Enviroment and Planning D: Society and Space, 24: 389-407.

Moskal, M. (2015) 'When I think home I think family here and there': Translocal and social ideas of home in narratives of migrant children and young people. *Geoforum,* 58, 143-152.

Moskal, M. (2014) Language and cultural capital in school experience of Polish children in Scotland. *Race, Ethnicity and Education*.

doi:10.1080/13613324.2014.911167

Moskal, M. (2013) Circulating capitals between Poland and Scotland: a transnational perspective on European labour mobility. Journal of International Migration and Integration, 14: 363-379.

Murkens, J. with P. Jones and M.Keating (2002) Scottish Independence: A Practical Guide, Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press.

ONS (2013 Office for National Statistics, 2013 Migration Statistics Quarerely Report – Statisticsl Bulletin

ww.ons.gov.uk/ons/rel/migration1/migration-statistics-quarterly-report/august-2013/msqr.html

Olson, M., Fejes, A., Dahlstedt, M. and Nicoll, K. (2014) Citizenship discourses: production and curriculum, British Journal of Sociology of Education, Early Online Publication.

Ozga, J. (2009) Governing Education through Data in England: From Regulation to Self-Evaluation, Special Issue of *Journal of Education Policy*, 24(2) 149-163.

Packwood, H., Findlay, A. and McCollum, D. (2014) Engaging with immigration policy on the ground: A study of Local Authorities in Scotland. CPC Briefing Paper 19, ESRC Centre for Population Change, UK.

Painter, J. and Philo, Ch. (1995) Spaces of citizenship: an introduction. Political Geography, 14: 107–120.

Phipps, A. (2013) Agenda: We must invest in the currency of kindness towards our immigrants, Herald Scotland, Monday 26 August 2013, online

Phipps, A. and Fassetta, G. (2015) A critical analysis of language policy in Scotland. *European Journal of Language Policy* 7(1): 5-28.

Pietka-Nykaza, E. and McGhee, D. (2014) Polish migrants in Scotland: voting behaviours and engagement in the Scottish independence referendum. CPC Briefing Paper 20, ESRC Centre for Population Change, UK.

Pollard, N., Lattore, M. , Sriskandarajah, D. (2008) Floodgate or Turnstiles? Post-EU Enlargement Migration Flows to (and from) the UK, London: IPPR.

Piller, I. (2001) Naturalization language testing and its basis in ideologies of national identity and citizenship. The International Journal of Bilingualism, 5(3): 259-277.

Piller, I. (2012) Multilingualism and Social Exclusion. In Martin-Jones, M., A. Blackledge & A. Creese. Eds.  Handbook of Multilingualism. London: Routledge.

Pupils in Scotland Census 2006-2009, The Scottish Government, Pupils in Scotland Census 2006-2009, The Scottish Government, http://www.gov.scot

Pupil Census - Supplementary Data 2010-2014, The Scottish Government, Pupils in Scotland Census 2006-2009, The Scottish Government, http://www.gov.scot

Reynolds, G. (2008) The Impacts and Experiences of Migrant Children in Secondary Schools. University of Sussex: Sussex Centre for Migration Research: Brighton.

Ribolzi, L. 2007. Between Inclusion and Marginality: The Role of Education in Migrant Children, Journal of Social Science Education, 6(1): 45-56.

Ruspini P. (2008) The Post-Enlargement Migration Space**.** in C. Bonifazi, M. Okólski, J. Schoorl, P. Simon (eds) International Migration in Europe: New Trends,

New Methods of Analysis, IMISCOE Research, Amsterdam: Amsterdam University Press, 179-196.

Ryan, L., Sales, R., Tilki, M., & Siara, B. (2008) Networks, social support and social capital: the experiences of recent Polish migrants in London, Sociology, 42(4), 672–690.

Salmond, A. (2007) 'Strategic Objectives of new Government' First Minister's Speech to Scottish Parliament 23rd May Accessed 1/8/07 http://www.scotland.gov.uk/News/This-Week/Speeches/FM-Parliament

Scottish Executive (2004) Ambitious, Excellent Schools: Our Agenda for Action (Edinburgh: Scottish Executive) Accessed 1/10/06 http://www.scotland.gov.uk/library5/education/aessaa.pdf

Scottish Government (2007) The National Performance Framework www.scotland.gov.uk/Publications/2007/11/13092240/9 (accessed February 2012).

Sim, D. (2015) Refugee Onward Migration and the Changing Ethnic Geography of Scotland, Scottish Geographical Journal, 131(1): 1-16.

Skutnabb-Kangas, T. 2000. Linguistic Genocide in Education-or Worldwide Diversity and Human Rights? Mahwah, NJ: Lawrence Erlbaum Associates.

Smala, S., Bergas Paz, J. and Lingard, B. (2013) Languages, cultural capital and school choice: distinction and second-language immersion programmes. British Journal of Sociology of Education, vol. 34(3): 373-391.

SNP (2007) Let Scotland Flourish: Manifesto 2007. Edinburgh: Scottish National Party.

Roer-Strier, D. & Strier, R., (2006). The role of home an dschool in the socialization of immigrant children in Israel: Father's view. In R. Kirova and Adams, L. (eds.) Global Migration and Education. Schools, Children and Families, London Routlege.

Suárez-Orozco C, Suárez-Orozco M.M. (2013). Transnationalism of the heart: familyhood across borders. in: *What is Parenthood? Competing Models for Understanding Today's Revolution in Parenthood*. Ed. D Cere, L McClain. New York and London: New York Univ. Press.

Suárez-Orozco, M. M., Darbes, T., Dias, S.I., and Sutin, M. (2011) Migration and Schooling, Annual Review of Anthropology, 40: 311-328.

Suárez-Orozco, C., Suárez-Orozco, M. and Todorova, T. (2008) Learning a New Land: Immigrant Children in American Society, Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Werbner, P., and N. Yuval-Davis. 1999. "Introduction: Women and the New Discourse of Citizenship." In *Women, Citizenship and Difference*, edited by P. Werbner and N. Yuval-Davis, 1–38. London and New York: Zed Books.

White Paper: Scotland's Future. Guide to an Independent Scotland (2013)

http://www.scotland.gov.uk/resource/0043/00439021.pdf

Valentine, G. and Skelton, T. (2007) The right to be heard: citizenship and language, Political Geography 26: 121–140.

Valentine, G., Sporton D. and Bang Nielsen, K. (2008) Language use on the move: sites of encounter, identities and belonging. Transactions of the Institute of British Geographers, 33(3): 376–387.

Young, I.M. (2008) Justice and the politics of difference". In *The New Social Theory Reader*, Edited by: Seidman, S. and Alexander, J. 261–269. London: Routledge.